

## ADMINISTRATIVE CONFERENCE OF THE UNITED STATES

## Committee on Adjudication Minutes April 5, 2012

Members Attending

Judge John Vittone (ret.) Edward Kelly Judge Robert Lesnick

(Chair)

Judge Randall Frye, (by Robert Giannasi Fred Alvarez (by telephone)

telephone)

Adam Loiacono (attending on James Eisenmann (attending on

behalf of Ivan Fong) (by behalf of Susan Tsui

telephone) Grundmann) (by telephone)

**ACUS Staff Attending** 

Paul R. Verkuil Jeffrey Lubbers Funmi E. Olorunnipa

Chairman Acting Director of Research & Staff Counsel

Policy

**Invited Guests Attending** 

Russell R. Wheeler,

Consultant, ACUS Immigration Adjudication Project

Lenni B. Benson,

Consultant, ACUS Immigration Adjudication Project (by telephone)

Juan Osuna, Director, EOIR

Members of the Public Attending

Judge Denise Slavin, EOIR and NAIJ (by telephone)

Rebecca Fenneman (by telephone)

Vanessa Allyn, Human Rights First

Karen Grisez, ABA Commission on Immigration

Amar Nair, CAIR

Marta Rothwharf, EOIR

The meeting commenced at 9:30 a.m. in the Conference Room of the Administrative Conference ("the Conference"). Judge Vittone began by welcoming the Committee members, special invited guests and public attendees. Judge Vittone then called for approval of the



## ADMINISTRATIVE CONFERENCE OF THE UNITED STATES

meeting minutes from the March 12, 2012 Committee meeting. The meeting minutes were approved by voice vote of the Committee members in attendance. Judge Vittone then proceeded to introducing the project currently being considered by the Committee, the Immigration Adjudication Project. Judge Vittone noted that the topic to be discussed at the meeting would be the portions of the updated draft report on this Project which dealt with the use of video teleconferencing (VTC) and other technology in immigration removal adjudication case. Chairman Verkuil then welcomed Committee members to the meeting and briefly discussed the importance of the work on this topic conducted by the consultants Mr. Wheeler and Ms. Benson. Chairman Verkuil also discussed upcoming Conference work on this topic to be conducted by Fred Lederer, Law Professor at William & Mary Law School. Mr. Lubbers then provided a few administrative remarks, including reminding Committee members of the importance of participating in the next Committee meeting on April 23, 2012 in person, particularly since at that meeting the Committee would begin voting on the draft recommendation for this Project. Judge Vittone then recognized the special invited guests in attendance from the various agencies and organizations and informed the Committee that those guests would be allowed to contribute to the conversation after Mr. Wheeler's initial presentation.

Judge Vittone then introduced the Project's consultants, Mr. Wheeler and Ms. Benson (who appeared by telephone). Judge Vittone the called on Mr. Wheeler to provide the Committee with an overview of the portions of the updated draft report in this Project which specifically dealt with the use of VTC and other technology in immigration removal adjudication cases. Mr. Wheeler began by discussing the research conducted by the consultants regarding the use of VTC and other technology in immigration removal adjudication cases. He discussed the relevant results of the survey that the consultants administered to immigration judges and noted the suggestions for improvement of the use of VTC and other technology which immigration judges made in the surveys. Mr. Wheeler then proceeded to discuss in detail those recommendations contained in the draft report and the accompanying memorandum to the Committee of the recommendations to be discussed at the April 5, 2012 meeting. First, Mr. Wheeler turned to those recommendations in the memo which specifically dealt with the use of video technology to increase respondents' access to legal advice and representation. Mr. Wheeler then discussed those recommendations in the memo which specifically dealt with use of VTC in hearings for removal and bond redetermination hearings. During the discussion of the recommendations contained in the memo, Chairman Verkuil, Mr. Lubbers, Judge Vittone, Ms. Benson, Mr. Kelly, Judge Lesnick, Mr. Giannasi, Mr. Osuna, Judge Slavin, Mr. Alvarez, Mr. Loiacono, Mr. Nair, Ms. Allyn and Ms. Grisez provided comments and suggested edits to the text of the recommendations. Ms. Olorunnipa noted that the approved edits would be made and provided in the next draft of the recommendation.



## ADMINISTRATIVE CONFERENCE OF THE UNITED STATES

Following the presentation by Mr. Wheeler and the discussion of the recommendations by those in attendance at the meeting, Ms. Olorunnipa noted that she would circulate a revised draft report and enclosed recommendations before the next Committee meeting on April 23, 2012. Ms. Olorunnipa also noted that the next meeting would focus on voting on the draft recommendation which would include all the recommendations in this project and which would be discussed and voted upon by the Committee at the April 23<sup>rd</sup> meeting. Judge Vittone then adjourned the meeting at 11:15 a.m.