

Programme Evaluation Series

**Evaluation of projects related to the
Voluntary Guidelines on the Responsible
Governance of Tenure of Land, Fisheries
and Forests in the Context of National
Food Security funded by Germany**

Management response

Management response to the evaluation of projects related to VGGT funded by Germany					02/2022
Evaluation recommendation	Management response Accepted, Partially accepted or Rejected	Management plan			
		Actions to be taken, and/or comments about partial acceptance or rejection	Responsible unit	Time frame	Further funding required (Y or N)
<p>Recommendation 1. FAO should develop a West Africa sub-regional program on land governance and mobilize resources to fund it.</p> <p>The development of a sub-regional programme would retain and solidify the gains made in the region and overcome challenges linked to the current context of fragmented and short-term projects.</p> <p>This programme would allow land tenure expertise to be available in the region (in the sub-regional office and in the countries) to provide further support to both country and regional efforts in land governance, further cultivate partnerships at regional level and provide opportunities for new projects.</p> <p>Such a regional approach would facilitate the building of synergies with ongoing actions supported by regional organizations, such as ECOWAS, CILSS, UEMOA and OMVS.</p>	Accepted	<p>Development of a West Africa subregional programme proposal. The programme will build on results achieved in the region and strengthen existing collaboration with national partners and regional bodies, including but not limited to ECOWAS, CILSS, UEMOA, OMVS.</p> <p>The programme could focus on priority areas as identified through the Evaluation, but also emerging from on going consultation with FAO Regional Offices and local partners: gender, youth, conflict prevention and land degradation/desertification.</p>	Land Tenure Team (LTT)/ESP	October 2021	Yes
<p>Recommendation 2. FAO should work within country-level roadmaps with specific short and long-term goals.</p> <p>Working within country specific technical roadmaps built out from existing national action plans (or assisting in their development if absent) can facilitate national ownership and greater effectiveness.</p>	Accepted	<p>The Land Tenure Team will ensure that all country engagements are based on a assessment of tenure insecurity and a roadmap for change that taps in strategic opportunities. The team will also prioritise selected countries to focus on achieving change at scale and in each of them will promote the identification of key reasons for tenure insecurity. Key opportunities (government programmes, donor investments, etc) and key partnerships (govt, civil society and development agencies) will be mapped to build</p>	LTT/ESP in collaboration with FAO Representatives, and Land tenure officers in Regional Offices	From January 2022	Yes

Management response to the evaluation of projects related to VGGT funded by Germany					02/2022
Evaluation recommendation	Management response Accepted, Partially accepted or Rejected	Management plan			Further funding required (Y or N)
		Actions to be taken, and/or comments about partial acceptance or rejection	Responsible unit	Time frame	
<p>One aspect of such roadmap work should be to conduct an analysis of the reasons why tenure insecurity exists for farmers and herders in country specific contexts.</p> <p>An M&E system should be developed to monitor progress towards achievements of set goals at national level and contributions to increased tenure security at the local level.</p>		a road map with short- and long-term goals. M&E systems will be promoted in each of the selected countries			
<p>Recommendation 3.</p> <p>FAO should continue drawing partners' attention to issues related to governance of tenure as part of its participation in donor groups and improving coherence and coordination of efforts at the country level.</p> <p>Participation in donor groups should be used as an opportunity to draw partners' attention to the importance of responsible governance of tenure for food and nutrition security, conflict prevention, and gender equity; and mobilize resources for activities at country level.</p> <p>Broader coordination is also needed to ensure that approaches and messages are harmonized with regard to local communities that are the targets of implementation. The national and local platforms can play a significant role in this coordination effort. It is also important to continue developing synergies among projects implemented by different actors on land tenure in the same regions.</p>	Accepted	FAO will continue to draw attention of its partners to tenure issues and to actively participate in donor engagement fora at global level (e.g. Global Donor Working Group on Land) and national. FAO will contribute to the development of a Global Land Tenure Report and establish a Land Observatory to provide analysis and strengthen visibility of tenure issues. FAO will engage with all partners at country level to improve convergence towards land tenure change at scale. FAO will pursue a Land Advocacy Agenda to bring land tenure to the debates in climate change, food systems, desertification, etc. As immediate action FAO will support the development of a paper on tenure and food system for the Food System Summit 2021, and will strive to reinforce collaboration with UNCCD for the implementation of the Technical guide on on Tenure and Land Degradation Neutrality to be launched at UNCCD COP 15.	LTT/ESP		Yes Funds available to initiate the process, but better results could be achieved with more significant investments

Management response to the evaluation of projects related to VGGT funded by Germany					02/2022
Evaluation recommendation	Management response Accepted, Partially accepted or Rejected	Management plan			
		Actions to be taken, and/or comments about partial acceptance or rejection	Responsible unit	Time frame	Further funding required (Y or N)
<p>Recommendation 4.</p> <p>Greater attention needs to be focused on developing concrete actions to be carried out in local communities which result in defined, precise and achievable gains. Such actions provide the opportunity to integrate fundamental components of the broader program into concrete objectives (women's land rights, dispute resolution, community empowerment, capacity development of local actors and institutions), and provide important settings for spin-offs and civil society demand to take place.</p> <p>Concrete actions in the field are those which directly and immediately affect the lives of local communities. Particular attention should be paid to: land mapping, establishment of reliable land information systems; establishment or upgrading of local courts; land use and allocation plans; the development and implementation of land management tools; capacity development of local communities on the principles of responsible investment and negotiating with investors.</p> <p>This approach could also include the establishment of synergies between the VGGT programme and other FAO projects implemented at the country level (such as club DIMITRA, Farmer Field Schools and Caisses de résilience, projects funded by the Peace Building Fund...). This would allow the potential</p>	Accepted	<p>In the selected countries including but not limited to those part of this Evaluation, FAO will pursue and strengthen actions at local level, including capacity development, community empowerment, supporting the strengthening of local land administration and build local MSPs.</p> <p>In some countries such as Mali and Mauritania, work has already started in the direction suggested by the Evaluation, with the establishment of transhumance committees under the project GCPGLO127MUL. Same is valid for the development of local platforms in Senegal (Casamance in particular) under GCPGLO347MUL.</p>		Partially already ongoing, more broadly from Jan 2022	Yes

Management response to the evaluation of projects related to VGGT funded by Germany					02/2022
Evaluation recommendation	Management response Accepted, Partially accepted or Rejected	Management plan			Further funding required (Y or N)
		Actions to be taken, and/or comments about partial acceptance or rejection	Responsible unit	Time frame	
of the VGGT in terms of conflict prevention and equitable management of land and natural resources, to be translated into concrete results.					
<p>Recommendation 5.</p> <p>The VGGT programme should pay greater attention to all relevant production systems, as well as take into account climate change and vulnerable groups.</p> <p>There is a demand to place greater attention on all production systems and not just crop production. Depending on the country these would include forestry, fisheries, pastoralism, cross-border issues, and mining.</p> <p>Greater attention is also needed on two specific themes: i) women and youth access to land and ii) the impact of climate change on governance of tenure.</p>	Accepted	<p>FAO will work towards the reinforcement of the centrality of land and natural resource governance for food security, poverty reduction and more broadly, inclusive rural transformation, which is central to the 2030 Development Agenda and the SDGs.</p> <p>Gender will remain at the core of any strategic intervention, becoming eventually an independent and well defined programme. Such an effort can build on extensive experience gained in countries not part of the current Evaluation, such as Kenya and Colombia.</p> <p>FAO will further mainstream VGGT principles in key areas of work that are responding to the current context, such as FAO's work on climate change, natural resources conservation, water management, landscape management.</p> <p>The thematic area of youth is already defined among the priority areas of work for the LTT in 2021/2024.</p>	LTT/ESP; OCB; NFO		Yes
<p>Recommendation 6.</p> <p>While the platforms have demonstrated great utility in coordination and dialog development, they remain fragile especially at local level. FAO should work to develop partners' capacities to ensure sustainability of platforms.</p>	Accepted	The sustainability and support of MSP is and remains at the core of the LTT programme priorities and will be one of the fundamental pillars and principle of implementation for any in country intervention, in the respect of local context. In the immediate terms the LTT has already adopted a strategy of synergy and	LTT/ESP, PSU,		Yes

Management response to the evaluation of projects related to VGGT funded by Germany					02/2022
Evaluation recommendation	Management response Accepted, Partially accepted or Rejected	Management plan			Further funding required (Y or N)
		Actions to be taken, and/or comments about partial acceptance or rejection	Responsible unit	Time frame	
<p>Given platforms' success and central position in the project, greater attention should be given to their sustainability in particular in the case of local platforms.</p> <p>Platforms need to be opened up to all relevant stakeholders, including the private sector which has been absent in most cases. There is a need to develop a specific approach towards the private sector. Operating rules should be formalized according to local realities. And the dominance of platforms by a particular actor or sector, should be mitigated.</p> <p>Exchanges between platforms (at both local and national level) should be continued as a way to further share experiences and develop capacities.</p>		<p>coordination with partner organization such as ILC and WHH to ensure support to MSP.</p>			
<p>Recommendation 7.</p> <p>There is a need to continue to provide support to legal and institutional capacity development (in particularly in Mali and Liberia where new laws have been adopted), and continue efforts for the adoption of the Pastoralist Law in Mongolia.</p> <p>Countries which have adopted new laws continue to need assistance in the implementation of these laws as part of their land policy reform process. Additional legal assistance is needed in the development of implementing regulations, enforcement, awareness raising about new laws, legal</p>	Accepted	<p>The recommendation is in line with programme priorities of the LTT for 2021-2024. In particular with the objective of Strengthening innovative local approaches for advancing governance of tenure by developing capacities and promoting multi-stakeholder platforms at local level to improve tenure rights through implementation of land policies and through improved customary systems.</p> <p>The LTT will focus on promoting tenure policy reforms (including land reform, land administration improvement and land consolidation programs) that will scale up equitable rural transformation and increase tenure rights by small-scale producers in</p>	LTT/ESP; LEGN; CFI;		Yes

Management response to the evaluation of projects related to VGGT funded by Germany					02/2022
Evaluation recommendation	Management response Accepted, Partially accepted or Rejected	Management plan			Further funding required (Y or N)
		Actions to be taken, and/or comments about partial acceptance or rejection	Responsible unit	Time frame	
<p>assistance to local communities and training of local officials.</p> <p>Also needed in all countries is support for strengthening or establishing institutions at local and national level (courts, land tenure commissions etc.) to improve access of community members, associations and villages to the means to exercise their rights.</p> <p>Collaborations with universities could be further promoted in view of developing curricula on responsible governance of tenure (including reviewing existing courses on governance of tenure to integrate the VGGT), so as to contribute to legal and institutional capacity development.</p> <p>Awareness raising of actors on responsible governance of tenure should be continued to include representatives of political parties and groups.</p>		<p>selected countries with greater needs/opportunities.</p> <p>The capacity to further support the process of pastoral law development in Mongolia will depend on fund mobilisation</p>			
<p>Recommendation 8.</p> <p>FAO should move ownership of the VGGT out of the FAO domain, so that it is seen as an international agreement, and not necessarily FAO-owned. It should also place the VGGT in a supporting role instead of a leading role within country land policy reform processes.</p> <p>Rethinking how the VGGT and related projects are communicated could contribute to increased ownership by the various actors intervening in land governance, synergies and</p>	Accepted	<p>FAO will pay greater attention in communicating the VGGT as CFS product, through the development of communication and CD material, delivery of programmes, interaction with international and national partners. Fundamental in this regard will be the continuous engagement of CFS, its board and Secretariat, to maintain the VGGT as highest priority in CFS agenda.</p>	LTT/ESP; CFS Secretariat		No

Management response to the evaluation of projects related to VGGT funded by Germany					02/2022
Evaluation recommendation	Management response Accepted, Partially accepted or Rejected	Management plan			
		Actions to be taken, and/or comments about partial acceptance or rejection	Responsible unit	Time frame	Further funding required (Y or N)
coherence of actions, and decrease donor competition over land rights efforts. The efforts of communicating the VGGT should continue extending to other countries.					
<p>Recommendation 9.</p> <p>Greater attention should be placed on including the private sector in the VGGT programme goals, objectives and activities so as to secure business investment alongside community tenure security.</p> <p>Emphasis on community - investor interaction and consultation, and the formation of mutually beneficial economic arrangements would greatly enhance the role of investments in development.</p> <p>There is a need to develop specific methods and approaches to involve the private sector in policy dialogue on governance of tenure and other VGGT activities and programmes.</p>	<p>Partially accepted</p> <p>While FAO agrees that greater participation of private sector in VGGT programme is desirable, FAO has a limited ability to ensure such participation, particularly when private sector actors are not committed to support the VGGT principles or take part in MSPs.</p>	FAO will continue to produce guidance for private sector on VGGT principles. On developing roadmap for changes (as per recommendation 2) FAO will emphasise the importance of community-investor interaction and consultation and awareness raising about responsible investments. FAO will assess what methods were successful on promoting private sector engagement on policy dialogues on governance of tenure and disseminate such learnings.	LTT/ESP; PSU	From January 2022	Yes

Office of Evaluation
evaluation@fao.org
www.fao.org/evaluation

Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations
Rome, Italy



Some rights reserved. This work is available
under a CC BY-NC-SA 3.0 IGO licence.