

Programme Evaluation Series

[04/2023](#)

**Cluster evaluation of two projects
contributing to the second phase of the
FAO programme “Support to the
Implementation of the Voluntary
Guidelines on the Responsible Governance
of Tenure of Land, Fisheries and Forests”**

Project codes: GCP/GLO/347/MUL and
GCP/INT/328/UK

Follow-up report

Cluster evaluation of two projects contributing to the second phase of the FAO programme “Support to the Implementation of the Voluntary Guidelines on the Responsible Governance of Tenure of Land, Fisheries and Forests” – Follow-up report

07/2024

Evaluation recommendation	Management response Accepted, Partially accepted or Rejected	Management plan			
		Actions to be taken, and/or comments about partial acceptance or rejection	Description of actions actually taken, or reasons for actions not taken	MAR Score	Impact of, or changes resulted from taken actions
<p>Recommendation 1.</p> <p><i>Relevance:</i> In order to maintain and strengthen relevance, the FAO land tenure team should pursue greater integration of Voluntary Guidelines on the Responsible Governance of Tenure of Land, Fisheries and Forests (VGGT) land-related work with the areas of forestry and fisheries, conflict management and land-based investments, as exemplified by the Mekong Region countries. To the extent that resources permit, the FAO land tenure team should invest in political economy analysis with the aim of identifying both openings for and obstacles to land governance reform and use such evidence to inform country-level intervention strategies.</p>	<p>Accepted</p>	<p>GLA study and ongoing discussions with social forestry team (FOA) to mainstreaming tenure in their work. Antoine and Safia work in the Pacific.</p>	<p>The land tenure team is working closely with NFO in the development of dedicated studies on the nexus between tenure and climate change in Africa and Asia. Is also collaborating with NSL in promoting the use of water tenure assessment methodologies at country level (among which Senegal and Colombia).</p>	<p>Good</p>	<p>Land tenure is being mainstreamed in other sectors (e.g. climate change, natural resources management), through a closer and articulated collaboration with other division, including the expansion in new areas of work (e.g. land and water nexus).</p> <p>More inputs are still needed to revamp the work on responsible investments.</p>
		<p>Part of the discussion of the pre CFS event on implementation of the VGGT after 10 years. Reflection with other development partners on the importance of political economy analyses and impact of land-based investments.</p>	<p>The Land Tenure Team (LTT) will apply in at least one country the Governance Analysis Framework, of which the political economy analysis is part.</p>		
		<p>Working groups on land governance in protected areas have been created for the 3 subregions of Redparques: Mesoamerican, Amazon and South cone. Ongoing regional study with Redparques on the state of the art of land governance in protected areas in Latin America.</p>	<p>Base line information about the governance of tenure in protected areas was collected for 10 LAC countries and a first draft of the regional study has been finalized for revision. Governance of tenure is now part of the thematic areas of work in Redparques and it will begin to be included in their regional/global meetings, declarations, and reports.</p>		

Cluster evaluation of two projects contributing to the second phase of the FAO programme “Support to the Implementation of the Voluntary Guidelines on the Responsible Governance of Tenure of Land, Fisheries and Forests” – Follow-up report					07/2024
Evaluation recommendation	Management response Accepted, Partially accepted or Rejected	Management plan			
		Actions to be taken, and/or comments about partial acceptance or rejection	Description of actions actually taken, or reasons for actions not taken	MAR Score	Impact of, or changes resulted from taken actions
<p>Recommendation 2.</p> <p><i>Coherence:</i> In order to increase coherence, the FAO land tenure team should identify ways to better integrate the work at national level with that of other actors and FAO, and link more closely to national agendas and roadmaps where they exist, FAO Country Programming Frameworks (CPFs) and projects.</p>	Accepted	<p>Already happening in several countries, for example in Sierra Leone with the World Bank (WB); in Senegal with WB and the German Agency for International Cooperation (GIZ); in Tchad FAO is engaging with the Land at scale (RVO) project; in Burkina Faso; in Madagascar (plus other 11 countries) we have a joint VGGT+10 initiative with ILC for joint coordination of the multi-stakeholder platforms (MSP); a position paper developed in Mozambique to inform the new CPF plus alignment with government, SIDA and SDC under the new land policy; Convergence group in the United Republic of Tanzania, Liberia, the Philippines, Colombia, Senegal and Sierra Leone for exchange of information and increase collaboration between development partners.</p>	<p>In Sierra Leone the support to the land governance reform is conducted in synergy with WB land administration programme.</p> <p>In Chad FAO is launching a new project on local land governance with the RVOproject in collaboration with OXFAM Novib and KadasterInternational.</p> <p>In Burkina Faso FAO supports the national multi-stakeholder platform on land with the implementing its national roadmap to increase responsible governance of tenure.</p> <p>In Guinea Conakry FAO is supporting the implementation of the recommendations of the <i>Etats généraux du foncier</i> including the preparation of a land policy in collaboration with UNHABITAT.</p> <p>In Madagascar (plus other 11 countries) we have a joint VGGT+10 initiative with ILC for joint coordination of the MSP.</p> <p>In Mozambique technical support is given for the review of the land code for it to be in line with the VGGT principles.</p> <p>The convergence group with ILC, WB and WHH is still active and provide space for better coordination at country level.</p>	Excellent	<p>Newly developed land projects at country level, are often the result of a closer collaboration, during the design phase with other international and national partners, leading to more coherence and efficiency. Such approach is also increasing FAO visibility as key partner in the land sector.</p>

Cluster evaluation of two projects contributing to the second phase of the FAO programme “Support to the Implementation of the Voluntary Guidelines on the Responsible Governance of Tenure of Land, Fisheries and Forests” – Follow-up report

07/2024

Evaluation recommendation	Management response Accepted, Partially accepted or Rejected	Management plan			
		Actions to be taken, and/or comments about partial acceptance or rejection	Description of actions actually taken, or reasons for actions not taken	MAR Score	Impact of, or changes resulted from taken actions
		<p>Ongoing Trilateral South-South Cooperation Project between FAO and the Government of Brazil (2018–2023) to enhance land governance in LAC. Besides supporting regional dialogue and knowledge exchange, bilateral cooperation agendas are also being developed within this project to support Guatemala, Paraguay and Colombia.</p> <p>Nevertheless, in RLC some country offices consider land tenure as a high political risk agenda and therefore are reticent to include it in their CPF and projects even where government interest may exist. More political support and buy in from FAO directors, regional, subregional and national representatives is also needed for the overall promotion and mainstreaming of the land tenure agenda.</p>	<p>FAO and the new Government of Brazil reinforced their commitment to support VGGT implementation in LAC. Studies towards improving land cadaster in Guatemala, Colombia and Paraguay have been finalized.</p>		

Cluster evaluation of two projects contributing to the second phase of the FAO programme “Support to the Implementation of the Voluntary Guidelines on the Responsible Governance of Tenure of Land, Fisheries and Forests” – Follow-up report					07/2024
Evaluation recommendation	Management response Accepted, Partially accepted or Rejected	Management plan			
		Actions to be taken, and/or comments about partial acceptance or rejection	Description of actions actually taken, or reasons for actions not taken	MAR Score	Impact of, or changes resulted from taken actions
Recommendation 3. <i>Effectiveness:</i> In order to improve effectiveness, the FAO land tenure team should identify ways to link capacity development work and multisectoral dialogue more directly with decision making processes and to engage more systematically at grassroot level through the direct support of pilots.	Accepted	In terms of reaching the grassroots or working more at community level, we have a new project funded by BMEL and implemented in Sierra Leone and Mauritania where we specifically take a local land governance approach, including local level MSP.	The BMEL funded project ' Promoting inclusivity for improved local tenure governance ' is successfully be implemented in Sierra Leone and Mauritania, with a specific focus on strengthening local MSP. The project triggered additional funding in Sierra Leone through the world bank, a partnership with GIZ. The MSP approach promoted by FAO was part of the ALP Conference in November 2023 and Land conference in May 2024. Capacity development sessions in Senegal aim to connect land and water use for local actors to engage effectively with authorities. They also educate pastoralist communities about their rights and VGGT principles. These sessions include material development, in-person training, and dialogues with neighboring communities of Mali and Mauritania. These activities have played a crucial role in forming transboundary committees and shaping Senegal's new pastoral code.	Good	LTT approach in project design and implementation has greatly changed becoming more decentralized, and country driven, including from a resource mobilization perspective. At country level, the team is adopting a grass root approach, in line with the recommendation, where capacities and government priorities, allow.
		In Mozambique, we are mainstreaming land tenure security in the framework of an agribusiness project that works directly with farmers' associations.			

Cluster evaluation of two projects contributing to the second phase of the FAO programme “Support to the Implementation of the Voluntary Guidelines on the Responsible Governance of Tenure of Land, Fisheries and Forests” – Follow-up report					07/2024
Evaluation recommendation	Management response Accepted, Partially accepted or Rejected	Management plan			
		Actions to be taken, and/or comments about partial acceptance or rejection	Description of actions actually taken, or reasons for actions not taken	MAR Score	Impact of, or changes resulted from taken actions
		As part of the new LTT strategy, one of its pillars is to have our work and impact at the local level where effectiveness can be achieved. Also, we have internalized <i>inclusivity</i> as a new cross-cutting area of work for FAO.	The Rural Transformation and Gender Equality Division of which LTT is part, completed in 2023 its new strategy, whereby Inclusivity is recognised as one of its pillar and crosscutting themes. As such, the LTT has now included in its new PWB 2024–2026 two dedicated outputs on gender equality in land governance and youth access to land.		
		This recommendation is welcomed but it is not entirely a responsibility of the LTT in headquarters. For example, if the ADG-RAF does not find it necessary to have a land tenure officer for the region then the effectiveness of the work is compromised and out of the control of headquarters.	In Chad and Guinea Conakry training sessions using VGGT-inspired capacity development materials helped grassroots actors (farmers’ organizations, pastoralists etc.) to engage more efficiently in the ongoing land policy preparation processes.		
		In the Caribbean, agricultural land bank mechanisms that lease public lands to local farmers, are being expanded and replicated within ongoing national value chain development projects (Grenada, Saint Vincent & the Grenadines, Saint Lucia and Saint Kitts & Nevis).	Land Bank pilot work is ongoing in all islands except SVG. In Grenada, a draft of a “National Land Bank Policy” has been finalized and is currently under revision for subsequent Cabinet approval. Political will towards land bank implementation is high in Saint Kitts and Nevis; yet, resources for FAO to respond to government’s requests for follow-up support are scarce.		

Cluster evaluation of two projects contributing to the second phase of the FAO programme “Support to the Implementation of the Voluntary Guidelines on the Responsible Governance of Tenure of Land, Fisheries and Forests” – Follow-up report					07/2024
Evaluation recommendation	Management response Accepted, Partially accepted or Rejected	Management plan			
		Actions to be taken, and/or comments about partial acceptance or rejection	Description of actions actually taken, or reasons for actions not taken	MAR Score	Impact of, or changes resulted from taken actions
Recommendation 4. <i>Efficiency:</i> In order to improve efficiency, the FAO land tenure team should consider ways to strengthen country offices’ engagement and leadership in the rolling out of project interventions and the overall promotion of the tenure agenda, and rethink the current ‘programmatic approach’ in light of the ‘project funding’ reality.	Accepted	Most of the current projects in West Africa are a result of resource mobilization at country level as a local level demand that has been enhanced by LTT ability to respond.	Efforts continue to improve resource mobilisation at country level. Successful outcomes are registered in Sierra Leone, Chad, Tanzania and Senegal. LTT has developed an engagement strategy with Africa (Regional, Subregional and Country Offices) aimed at increasing ownership and leadership of Country Offices in land related projects and raised the profile of land agenda in the region. LTT has appointed focal points to coordinate the work with the regional and Subregional Offices, which led to new project’s formulation (i.e. new FVC funded land project led by Subregional Office in Libreville, covering Chad, Cameroon and CAR). The United Republic of Tanzania Country Office engagement has been strengthened through the GeoTech4Tenure training that led to the development of a proposal to support the WB Land Administration project through a TCP and subsequently through a UTF project.	Excellent	The team has reorganized its internal structure in order to better respond to country request and improve exchange of information from headquarters to Regional Offices and vice versa, which has led to numerous joint activities and fundraising. However, the absence of a land tenure officer in RAF, pose some limitation to the coordination with the region.
		In Mozambique, the Country Office requested a position paper that can be used in mainstreaming tenure in their CPF and in any possible project.	Under orientation of the Country Office a report was written focussing women’s land rights to feed the consultation process for the revision of the land law in the country.		

Cluster evaluation of two projects contributing to the second phase of the FAO programme “Support to the Implementation of the Voluntary Guidelines on the Responsible Governance of Tenure of Land, Fisheries and Forests” – Follow-up report

07/2024

Evaluation recommendation	Management response Accepted, Partially accepted or Rejected	Management plan			
		Actions to be taken, and/or comments about partial acceptance or rejection	Description of actions actually taken, or reasons for actions not taken	MAR Score	Impact of, or changes resulted from taken actions
		In Colombia, land tenure and the agrarian reform initiative driven by the government has made land a central part of their agenda and has formed a team of support from the RLC region and headquarters.	In Colombia the government is implementing a titling and land reform process following the Peace Agreement signed in 2016. LTT in headquarters, RLC and Country Offices staff have joined forces to provide technical support to the government on this purpose.		
<p>Recommendation 5.</p> <p><i>Efficiency:</i> In order to improve documentation and learning, LTT should develop a comprehensive knowledge management system to ensure the systematic documentation of information and a greater extent of cross-country learning, with particular emphasis on Eastern-Western Africa.</p>	Accepted	LTT has now appointed a person to lead the knowledge management component which has also developed a clear strategy for 2023–2025.	A knowledge management (KM) strategy has been defined, amended as per the changes in the divisional structure and thus following a team partial restructure. Current status allows a initial mapping of past and current land tenure projects. An upgrade of the current strategy is planned for the next biennium.	Advancing	A KM system has been developed, although in its initial form, yet contributing to a better documentation of LTT led activities.
		A Global Land Observatory (GLO) is in the process of being established and housed by FAO. It is a collaboration with ILC, GLTN and CIRAD which will hold existing documentation on land and create new knowledge in the coming years.	GLO has been established. The governance structure is set in place and functioning. GLO is now working its main product, the state of land tenure and governance.		
		A letter of agreement (LOA) has been signed with ILC and Tenure Facility to develop a Regional Learning Cycle on collective tenure rights of Indigenous and Afrodescendent Peoples.	The regional cycle was finalized with outstanding results. 23 case studies from 9 countries in the region where shared during 5 thematic sessions with an average of 100 participants.		

Cluster evaluation of two projects contributing to the second phase of the FAO programme “Support to the Implementation of the Voluntary Guidelines on the Responsible Governance of Tenure of Land, Fisheries and Forests” – Follow-up report					07/2024
Evaluation recommendation	Management response Accepted, Partially accepted or Rejected	Management plan			
		Actions to be taken, and/or comments about partial acceptance or rejection	Description of actions actually taken, or reasons for actions not taken	MAR Score	Impact of, or changes resulted from taken actions
			A second learning cycle will take place in 2024, focusing on experiences of afrodescendant communities and women’s tenure rights, this with the support of the Brazilian Cooperation.		
<p>Recommendation 6.</p> <p><i>Sustainability.</i> In order to increase sustainability, the FAO land tenure team should adopt a more systematic approach to capacity building and a more strategic one to partnership development.</p>	Accepted	Under the new LTT strategy, we have every team member assigned at least one main partner organization (on land) so that these partnerships are nurtured and collaboration is fostered.	<p>LTT has invested considerable resources in strengthening global partnerships on land and towards more sustainable intervention. LTT is chairing the Global Donor Working Group on Land, is one of the main promoters of the Global Land Agenda, which led to the high-level event with government champions (23 October), and an official CFS side event (27 October). In addition, a special High-level session of the Global Land Agenda conveners is planned during the WB Land Conference in May 2024.</p> <p>Also, FAO LTT has established a peer to peer learning programme (GeoTech4Tenure) organizing online trainings in English, Spanish and French, creating an eLearning course and providing face to face trainings dedicated to specific countries/projects combining geospatial technologies and participatory methodologies for securing tenure rights. GeoTech4Tenure has been recognized of great interest and potential</p>	Good	LTT is leading on several strategic partnerships at global and country level, has raised its profile including in other sectors (e.g. UNCCD, CBD). Less emphasis compared to the period in which the evaluation was conducted, is now dedicated to capacity development as core activity, but where this is done, is through a more focused support, and aiming at scaling up results.

Cluster evaluation of two projects contributing to the second phase of the FAO programme “Support to the Implementation of the Voluntary Guidelines on the Responsible Governance of Tenure of Land, Fisheries and Forests” – Follow-up report

07/2024

Evaluation recommendation	Management response Accepted, Partially accepted or Rejected	Management plan			
		Actions to be taken, and/or comments about partial acceptance or rejection	Description of actions actually taken, or reasons for actions not taken	MAR Score	Impact of, or changes resulted from taken actions
			for ongoing and future development initiatives at RLC regional level and in various countries (Guatemala, Honduras and Colombia).		
		Capacity development has become an imbedded component of all the land tenure work. LTT no longer relies in the capacity development unit in PSU.			
		Capacity development and KM are key components of various ongoing partnerships with regional cooperation networks linked to land and natural resources tenure in the LAC region (e.g. REDPARQUES, REAF-Mercosur, Red Interamericana de Catastro y Registro de la Propiedad, CPCI, ILC-LAC; Prindex).	Several knowledge exchange initiatives regarding agrarian justice; land conflict resolution and VGGT implementation, were carried out during 2023, which contributed to national land legislative processes. LTT has developed a more holistic and systematic approach to natural resources and has developed a strategic plan for partnership development, focusing on collaboration with governments, non-governmental organizations (NGOs), academic institutions, and other relevant stakeholders to support the Global Dialogue on Water tenure.		

Office of Evaluation
E-mail: evaluation@fao.org
Web address: www.fao.org/evaluation

Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations
Rome, Italy