

---

**From:** Brian Ellrott - NOAA Federal <brian.ellrott@noaa.gov>  
**Sent:** Friday, May 17, 2019 12:17 PM  
**To:** Brown, Howard  
**Cc:** Brittany Cunningham - NOAA Affiliate; Yip, Garwin; Cathy Marcinkevage - NOAA Federal; Naseem Alston - NOAA Federal; Stephen Maurano - NOAA Federal; Susan\_Boring@fws.gov; Joe Heublein  
**Subject:** Re: American Division Effects

Howard,  
Thanks to Brittany, Stephen, Naseem, Amanda, Susan, and Joe, the American River effects section is ready to share with Reclamation. It takes a village to raise an effects draft.

Let me know if you have any questions.

R:\Draft BiOp\2\_ESA\2.5-2.6 Effects of the Action\American River Division  
2.5 and 2.6 American Effects V5 (sticking with original file naming convention b/c I'm stubborn, stressed, and I like that approach better)

Thanks,  
Brian

On Fri, May 17, 2019 at 11:41 AM Brian Ellrott - NOAA Federal <[brian.ellrott@noaa.gov](mailto:brian.ellrott@noaa.gov)> wrote:  
Sounds good. I'll get it ready now.

On Fri, May 17, 2019 at 11:22 AM Naseem Alston - NOAA Federal <[naseem.alston@noaa.gov](mailto:naseem.alston@noaa.gov)> wrote:  
Hi Brian,

Your second question: I am happy to clean the doc up for distribution, or you can - think the idea was for the lead to do that. Just let me know.

I don't think you need to name a new version, just keep your MASTER version and created a clean one from that using the naming convention requested by HB.

to your First question:

I agree the sentence gets a little wordy, see attached alternative (taking out the proportion language there, but adding it into the sentences above - I didn't see a logical place to easily put it in for spawning as well, but I think it gets the point across)

Naseem O. Alston  
ESA-Section 7 Coordinator/Fish Biologist  
NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region  
U.S. Department of Commerce  
California Central Valley Office  
Sacramento, CA  
(916)930-3655  
<http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov/>

On Fri, May 17, 2019 at 11:03 AM Brian Ellrott - NOAA Federal <[brian.ellrott@noaa.gov](mailto:brian.ellrott@noaa.gov)> wrote:  
I like that you pulled from the I&S table to fill in the last sentence, Brittany.

Naseem,

The last sentence pasted below includes your edits, and Brittany updated it to identify the proportion you asked for. The sentence does not make sense to me though. I think it tries to jam too many PBF conclusions into one sentence and confuses amount of CH affected with magnitude. Keep it if you think it works for describing CH, otherwise I would delete it.

Based on the above discussion, a medium proportion of the value of spawning, rearing, and migratory habitats for the conservation of the species are negatively affected as a result of the PA.

---

On Fri, May 17, 2019 at 10:16 AM Brian Ellrott - NOAA Federal <[brian.ellrott@noaa.gov](mailto:brian.ellrott@noaa.gov)> wrote:  
Thanks Brittany! I'll take a look.

On Fri, May 17, 2019 at 11:15 AM Brittany Cunningham - NOAA Affiliate  
<[brittany.cunningham@noaa.gov](mailto:brittany.cunningham@noaa.gov)> wrote:  
Hi Brian,

I swapped the hatchery text for the new text Naseem provided, they were pretty much the same already. Looks like you addressed everything else that was needed. I just want you to look over the last sentence of the whole section (pg.41). Naseem wanted a proportion of the habitat negatively affected. Please make sure I filled that in correctly.

Thanks!  
Brittany

On Fri, May 17, 2019 at 8:43 AM Naseem Alston - NOAA Federal <[naseem.alston@noaa.gov](mailto:naseem.alston@noaa.gov)> wrote:  
Hey Brian,

That could likely work, just wasn't sure the difference between/point of the 2 sections (that would warrant differences)... like probably didn't need to be that long in the intro AND repeated here. But anyway.

Naseem O. Alston  
ESA-Section 7 Coordinator/Fish Biologist  
NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region  
U.S. Department of Commerce  
California Central Valley Office  
Sacramento, CA  
(916)930-3655  
<http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov/>

On Fri, May 17, 2019 at 8:40 AM Brian Ellrott - NOAA Federal <[brian.ellrott@noaa.gov](mailto:brian.ellrott@noaa.gov)> wrote:

Brittany,

Can you double check my work to make sure all of Naseem's comments are addressed? There may be a few loose ends, but I tried to hit all of the substantive comments.

Naseem,

Why can't we just replace the hatchery section in the BO with Amanda's version? That would be a lot faster than a detailed comb through.

Thanks,

Brian

On Fri, May 17, 2019 at 5:41 AM Brian Ellrott - NOAA Federal <[brian.ellrott@noaa.gov](mailto:brian.ellrott@noaa.gov)> wrote:

Thanks Naseem and Brittany.

On Fri, May 17, 2019 at 12:27 AM Brittany Cunningham - NOAA Affiliate

<[brittany.cunningham@noaa.gov](mailto:brittany.cunningham@noaa.gov)> wrote:

Hi Brian,

Here's the document with your edits from earlier today and Naseem's comments tonight combined. It's also on the ROCON Drive. Will dive into it tomorrow morning and address whatever still needs to be done.

Brittany

On Thu, May 16, 2019 at 7:56 PM Naseem Alston - NOAA Federal <[naseem.alston@noaa.gov](mailto:naseem.alston@noaa.gov)> wrote:

Hi Brian,

I took a quick look at the section (to be sent to Reclamation tomorrow morning!?)

I found the section very easy to read/follow!

And although it is very clear/concise and has great final conclusions for magnitude of effect, I think it would be helpful to include the proportion of the pop affected within the sections.

See attached. I set some of them up as examples. I see "proportion" is included in the I&S tables so it might work for someone to crosswalk backwards (where did those proportions come from anyway?)

For the Hatchery discussion - please see the attached INTRO section that I asked Amanda to look at and correct - good for this section to reflect that one (or refer to the intro, etc). If time we could ask Amanda to do this comparison (or Brittany?)

I added some suggested text to 2 (?) sections described as uncertain and not consulted on - changed to framework-level (GY/HBd/CMK - please consider taking a look at those as well)

Lastly, I saw a few outstanding comments from Brittany that are addressed to you - so check those out as well!

let me know if you have any questions,

Naseem O. Alston  
ESA-Section 7 Coordinator/Fish Biologist  
NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region  
U.S. Department of Commerce  
California Central Valley Office  
Sacramento, CA  
(916)930-3655  
<http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov/>

--

**Brittany Cunningham**  
Natural Resource Specialist

Contractor with Lynker Technologies  
NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region  
[650 Capitol Mall, Suite 5-100](#)  
[Sacramento, CA 95814](#)  
Office: (916) 930-3606  
[brittany.cunningham@noaa.gov](mailto:brittany.cunningham@noaa.gov)

--

**Brian Ellrott**  
*Central Valley Salmonid Recovery Coordinator*  
*NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region*  
*U.S. Department of Commerce*  
Mobile: 916-955-7628  
Office: 916-930-3612  
[brian.ellrott@noaa.gov](mailto:brian.ellrott@noaa.gov)

--

**Brian Ellrott**  
*Central Valley Salmonid Recovery Coordinator*  
*NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region*  
*U.S. Department of Commerce*  
Mobile: 916-955-7628  
Office: 916-930-3612  
[brian.ellrott@noaa.gov](mailto:brian.ellrott@noaa.gov)

--

**Brittany Cunningham**

Natural Resource Specialist

Contractor with Lynker Technologies  
NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region  
[650 Capitol Mall, Suite 5-100](#)  
[Sacramento, CA 95814](#)  
Office: (916) 930-3606  
[brittany.cunningham@noaa.gov](mailto:brittany.cunningham@noaa.gov)

--

**Brian Ellrott**  
*Central Valley Salmonid Recovery Coordinator*  
*NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region*  
*U.S. Department of Commerce*  
Mobile: 916-955-7628  
Office: 916-930-3612  
[brian.ellrott@noaa.gov](mailto:brian.ellrott@noaa.gov)

--

**Brian Ellrott**  
*Central Valley Salmonid Recovery Coordinator*  
*NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region*  
*U.S. Department of Commerce*  
Mobile: 916-955-7628  
Office: 916-930-3612  
[brian.ellrott@noaa.gov](mailto:brian.ellrott@noaa.gov)

--

**Brian Ellrott**  
*Central Valley Salmonid Recovery Coordinator*  
*NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region*  
*U.S. Department of Commerce*  
Mobile: 916-955-7628  
Office: 916-930-3612  
[brian.ellrott@noaa.gov](mailto:brian.ellrott@noaa.gov)

--

**Brian Ellrott**  
*Central Valley Salmonid Recovery Coordinator*  
*NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region*  
*U.S. Department of Commerce*  
Mobile: 916-955-7628  
Office: 916-930-3612  
[brian.ellrott@noaa.gov](mailto:brian.ellrott@noaa.gov)