

---

**From:** Brian Ellrott - NOAA Federal <brian.ellrott@noaa.gov>  
**Sent:** Monday, May 20, 2019 6:50 PM  
**To:** Garwin Yip - NOAA Federal  
**Subject:** Re: "I&S tables"

I addressed all of Maria's comments on the w-r I&S in the latest file saved in the main I&S folder. I need to connect with her regarding a comment on using the Lindley productivity criteria (she's worried we're applying a recovery standard) and another one regarding cohort replacement rate. I'll coordinate with her and you tomorrow.

I need to address your comments and update the tables with our latest approach. Plan to do that tonight and tomorrow.

Sorry I didn't respond sooner - family duty. Feel free to call or text me if you ever want an immediate response.

On Mon, May 20, 2019 at 4:58 PM Garwin Yip - NOAA Federal <[garwin.yip@noaa.gov](mailto:garwin.yip@noaa.gov)> wrote:  
There's been talk about moving the "I&S tables" in the beginning of the I&S sections to the end of the effects sections. There are reasons to move them, and reasons not to move them. I'm going with the latter. Let's keep them in the I&S sections.

Division leads, please take a look at your effects tables and the I&S tables and make sure they are consistent.

I think we talked about this before, but just to make sure, for those programmatic PA components that we said there's not enough detail to analyze, please mention, to the extent that you can, general trends in effects (e.g., likely beneficial, likely negative), and have them reflected in the effects and I&S tables.

Also, for those PA components where you made assumptions, please have those PA components reflected in the effects and I&S tables with the assumptions realized. For example, often times, assumptions are made to replace uncertainties, so if we made an assumption, the effects row should not reflect the uncertainty.

We will be distributing the winter-run I&S section to Reclamation on Wednesday, and the spring-run, steelhead, and green sturgeon I&S sections on Thursday, so hopefully they are tight and right for distribution.

Brian and Joe:  
-- I need to track Maria's comments in the winter-run I&S section, and also to make sure transfer over to the other I&S sections where appropriate. Please let me know when they are ready for my review.  
-- Rosalie wants to see the revised sections prior to peer review. I understand that sending to Reclamation is not peer review, but if there is enough time for Rosalie's eyes before they go to Reclamation, that'd be great.

-Garwin-

---

*Garwin Yip*  
Water Operations and Delta Consultations Branch Chief  
NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region  
U.S. Department of Commerce  
California Central Valley Office

650 Capitol Mall, Suite 5-100  
Sacramento, CA 95814  
Office: 916-930-3611  
Cell: 916-716-6558  
FAX: 916-930-3629  
[www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov](http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov)



--

**Brian Ellrott**

*Central Valley Salmonid Recovery Coordinator*  
*NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region*  
*U.S. Department of Commerce*  
Mobile: 916-955-7628  
Office: 916-930-3612  
[brian.ellrott@noaa.gov](mailto:brian.ellrott@noaa.gov)