
From: Garwin Yip - NOAA Federal <garwin.yip@noaa.gov>
Sent: Wednesday, June 12, 2019 11:57 AM
To: Barbara Byrne - NOAA Federal
Cc: J. Stuart - NOAA Federal; Brian Ellrott - NOAA Federal; Joe Heublein - NOAA Federal; Kristin Begun - NOAA Affiliate; Howard.Brown; Cathy Marcinkevage
Subject: Re: FYI -- Delta perf objectives

All,

To clarify a few things based on what I know and heard:

- The revised PA that Dave sent out last night is not final (mainly because of the Shasta section), but we don't have time to wait for the final before working on the supplemental analyses.
- Barb will draft the supplemental analysis for the Delta, in coordination with Jeff.
- Jeff provided some comments, referring to "they" (Reclamation?), "you" (Reclamation?), and just general questions. Note that we WILL NOT be going back to Reclamation to ask clarifying questions, or suggest text changes. ANY changes will likely warrant a Federal Directors' meeting, so will take what we have and make do with them.

I see that Barb scheduled a 1-hour call this afternoon for the Delta objectives. We could provide some clarifications, assumptions, etc., but the meeting needs to be very targeted, and we need to work through all of the comments very quickly, as we all have a lot of work to do.

-Garwin-

Garwin Yip
Water Operations and Delta Consultations Branch Chief
NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region
U.S. Department of Commerce
California Central Valley Office
650 Capitol Mall, Suite 5-100
Sacramento, CA 95814
Office: 916-930-3611
Cell: 916-716-6558
FAX: 916-930-3629
www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov



On Wed, Jun 12, 2019 at 9:53 AM Barbara Byrne - NOAA Federal <barbara.byrne@noaa.gov> wrote:
Jeff -- about to look at your other comments, but Reclamation has been telling us that this "limit to historic loss" approach replaces the salvage or loss thresholds (e.g. 2% of the WR JPE; 3000 steelhead) from the original and most recent BA, and the rest of the OMR management elements also carry forward -- including the -5,000 cfs OMR limit. I see that Mooney sent over a draft revised FULL PA -- will check with Garwin et

al and see if that is ready to be shared or is still too draft (don't want to revise things twice over based on an interim version).

On Wed, Jun 12, 2019 at 6:37 AM J. Stuart - NOAA Federal <j.stuart@noaa.gov> wrote:

Also noticed in this current write up that there is no reference to a "baseline" of -5,000 cfs OMR flows during the period of salmon presence - nominally January - June. How does this current write up fit in with all of the other OMR management actions from the original BA? How do we splice all of their actions together, such as the turbidity bridge, and estimate of 5% of a population in the Delta as the start of OMR management, with this "take" section? Does this new element only replace the one bullet of "salvage and loss thresholds" in the 2/5/19 BA version? Looking forward to your clarification.

Jeff

On Wed, Jun 12, 2019 at 5:46 AM Brian Ellrott - NOAA Federal <brian.ellrott@noaa.gov> wrote:

Hi Barb,

Thanks for putting this together. I added one comment on top of Jeff's version in the loss section, and made a minor edit in the DCC section.

The comment is: Can we provide a biological rationale for why this level of loss (and associated far field effects) would help avoid jeopardy? Based on Michel (2018), one could argue that maintaining the status quo would likely contribute to maintaining freshwater survival below population survival levels. There's a lot to unpack there with confounding effects beyond loss at the pumps, but I think there's a strong enough argument such that we should provide a biological rationale for status quo.

On Tue, Jun 11, 2019 at 8:52 PM J. Stuart - NOAA Federal <j.stuart@noaa.gov> wrote:

Please see my comments in the attached document. Answers to these comments will enable me to understand and write a suitable supplement to the PA regarding Reclamation's current position.

On Tue, Jun 11, 2019 at 12:04 PM Barbara Byrne - NOAA Federal <barbara.byrne@noaa.gov> wrote:

Dear I&S section leads and Delta effects co-leads -- The current (and I think final) Delta performance objectives are described on p. 5-7 of the attached doc -- sharing FYI. The framework, timing, and populations included were decided at the Directors level; Dave Mooney and I just clarified the specifics necessary to calculate the necessary thresholds. My understanding is that I will work with Jeff to add a supplemental analysis of these to the effects section and we will work with the I&S and ITS leads to incorporate into the I&S section and ITS.

The edits to the DCC section (p 4 of the attached) were discussed the week of 5/20 and have already been incorporated into the Delta effects section (but not necessarily the I&S sections, since those weren't prepared for peer review).

ALERT: The Shasta performance objectives are still pending edits and agreement -- the draft objectives in the attached doc may yet be revised.

--

Barb Byrne

Fish Biologist

NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region

U.S. Department of Commerce

Office: 916-930-5612

barbara.byrne@noaa.gov

California Central Valley Office
650 Capitol Mall, Suite 5-100
Sacramento, CA 95814



Find us online

www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov



--

Jeffrey S. Stuart, M.S.
Fishery Biologist

NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region
U.S. Department of Commerce
California Central Valley Office
650 Capitol Mall, Suite 5-100
Sacramento, CA 95814-4706

Office: 916-930-3607
J.Stuart@noaa.gov



Find us online

www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov



--

Brian Ellrott
Central Valley Salmonid Recovery Coordinator
NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region
U.S. Department of Commerce
Mobile: 916-955-7628
Office: 916-930-3612
brian.ellrott@noaa.gov

--

Jeffrey S. Stuart, M.S.
Fishery Biologist

NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region
U.S. Department of Commerce
California Central Valley Office
650 Capitol Mall, Suite 5-100
Sacramento, CA 95814-4706

Office: 916-930-3607
J.Stuart@noaa.gov



Find us online

www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov



--

Barb Byrne

Fish Biologist
NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region
U.S. Department of Commerce
Office: 916-930-5612
barbara.byrne@noaa.gov
California Central Valley Office
650 Capitol Mall, Suite 5-100
Sacramento, CA 95814



Find us online

www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov

