

Evaluation Findings

Hawai'i Coastal Zone Management Program

August 2008 to August 2018

Published August 2019



Office for Coastal Management
National Ocean Service
National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration
United States Department of Commerce

Table of Contents

| | |
|--|----|
| Executive Summary..... | 1 |
| Program Review Procedures..... | 3 |
| Evaluation Findings | 4 |
| Ocean Resource Management Plan Implementation | 4 |
| Special Management Area Permitting..... | 7 |
| Hawai'i's Coastal Nonpoint Pollution Control Program | 9 |
| Implementation of General Requirements | 10 |
| Evaluation Metrics | 12 |
| Conclusion..... | 16 |
| Appendix A: Response to Written Comments..... | 17 |

Executive Summary

The Coastal Zone Management Act requires the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration's Office for Coastal Management to conduct periodic evaluations of the performance of states and territories with federally approved coastal management programs. This evaluation examined the operation and management of the Hawai'i Coastal Zone Management Program by the State of Hawai'i Office of Planning for the period from August 2008 to August 2018. The evaluation focused on three target areas: ocean resource management plan implementation, special management area permitting, and Coastal Nonpoint Source Pollution Control Program approval.

The findings in this evaluation document will be considered by the NOAA Office for Coastal Management in making future financial award decisions concerning the coastal program. The evaluation came to these conclusions:

Accomplishment: The state of Hawai'i continues to be a national leader in examining the impact of public and private land-based activities on ocean resource management and planning to improve coastal and ocean ecosystems.

Accomplishment: The State of Hawai'i adopted a new uniform statewide building code that increased standards related to wind speed and hazard resilience. The Office of Planning led efforts to ensure that the code was incorporated into the federally approved Hawai'i Coastal Zone Management Program.

Accomplishment: The Hawai'i Coastal Zone Management Program has shown leadership across the Pacific region by spearheading interstate collaboration on federal consistency and encouraging job shadowing by staff from the territorial coastal management programs.

Accomplishment: The Hawai'i Coastal Zone Management Program's Ocean Resources Management Plan has considered traditional community needs in project implementation.

Accomplishment: The Hawai'i Coastal Zone Management Program championed the creation of the He'eia National Estuarine Research Reserve in partnership with the local community and the University of Hawai'i.

Recommendation: In future iterations of the Ocean Resources Management Plan, the state should examine ways to better focus priorities and identify multiagency approaches to achieve the goals stated in the Hawai'i Coastal Zone Management Act (Chapter 205A).

Recommendation: The Hawai'i Coastal Zone Management Program should seek ways to fund the special management area permitting activities of all of the counties at appropriate levels.

Recommendation: The Hawai'i Coastal Zone Management Program should work with the counties to address comprehensively the issue of the cumulative impacts of development and, if appropriate, develop guidance to assist the county permitting authorities.

Recommendation: The Hawai'i Coastal Zone Management Program should consider developing a comprehensive communications strategy to ensure public understanding of coastal and ocean issues and government responses to them.

Necessary Action: The Hawai'i Coastal Zone Management Program must work with the NOAA Office for Coastal Management to develop and submit a work plan with interim benchmarks and a timeline for meeting the outstanding conditions of its conditionally approved coastal nonpoint source pollution program by February 1, 2020. The documentation indicating how the State of Hawai'i has met the outstanding conditions must be submitted no later than August 31, 2023.

This evaluation concludes that the State of Hawai'i Office of Planning is satisfactorily implementing and enforcing its federally approved coastal program, adhering to the terms of the federal financial assistance awards, and addressing the coastal management needs identified in section 303(2)(A) through (K) of the Coastal Zone Management Act.

Program Review Procedures

The NOAA Office for Coastal Management evaluated the Hawai'i Coastal Zone Management Program in fiscal year 2018. The evaluation team consisted of Ralph Cantral, evaluation team lead, Kristina Kekuewa, Pacific region manager, and Stephanie Lum-King Bennett, site liaison, all from the NOAA Office for Coastal Management; and Lisa Engler, assistant director (now director), Massachusetts Office of Coastal Zone Management. The support of the Hawai'i Coastal Zone Management Program staff was crucial in conducting the evaluation, and their support is most gratefully acknowledged.

NOAA sent a notification of the scheduled evaluation to Leo Asuncion, director, Hawai'i Office of Planning, on December 14, 2017, and published a notice of "Intent to Evaluate" in the *Federal Register* on June 27, 2018. The Hawai'i Coastal Zone Management Program posted a notice of the public meeting and opportunity to comment in the *Honolulu Star-Advertiser* on June 27, 2018.

The evaluation process included a review of relevant documents and a survey of stakeholders, which helped identify three target areas for the evaluation: ocean resource management plan implementation, special management area permitting, and Coastal Nonpoint Source Pollution Control Program approval. A site visit was also conducted and the evaluation team held meetings with staff members and group discussions with stakeholders and program staff members about the target areas. In addition, a public meeting was held on Wednesday, August 29, 2018, at 6:00 p.m. at the Hawai'i State Capitol Auditorium, 415 Beretania Street, Honolulu, Hawai'i, to provide an opportunity for members of the public to express their opinions about the implementation of the coastal zone management program.

Stakeholders and members of the public were given the opportunity to provide written comments via email or U.S. mail through Friday, September 7, 2018. Two written comments were received from the public or interested parties. The Office for Coastal Management then developed draft evaluation findings, which were provided to the coastal program for review, and the coastal program's comments were considered in drafting the final evaluation findings.

Final evaluation findings for all coastal programs highlight the coastal program's accomplishments in the target areas and include recommendations that are of two types:

Necessary Actions address programmatic requirements of the implementing regulations of the Coastal Zone Management Act (CZMA) and of the state coastal program approved by NOAA. These must be carried out by the dates specified. Failure to address necessary actions may result in a future finding of non-adherence and the invoking of interim sanctions, as specified in CZMA §312(c).

Recommendations are actions that the office believes would improve the program, but which are not mandatory. The state is expected to have considered the recommendations by the time of the next evaluation or by the dates specified.

Evaluation Findings

Ocean Resource Management Plan Implementation

One of the greatest attributes of the Hawai'i Coastal Zone Management Program is its strong network of agencies with responsibilities for implementing a number of state laws and local ordinances that protect the state's more than 1,000 miles of shoreline. The Office of Planning works with this network to monitor implementation of the program's enforceable policies throughout the state and to ensure consistency with the objectives and policies stated in the state's Coastal Zone Management Law (Hawaii Revised Statutes (HRS) Chapter 205A).

Examples of Key Efforts

In 1985, the State of Hawai'i developed the first Hawai'i Ocean Resources Management Plan. This plan has been an excellent example of how a state can undertake a comprehensive examination of how state agencies can affect the health of ocean resources. Many of the impacts occur from routine actions, including funding, management, and permitting authorities. The plan has continued to evolve since that initial effort. Over the course of more than 30 years of implementation, the state has gained the active participation of a long list of partners in addition to the core state agencies. These new partners include local and federal agencies as well as nongovernmental organizations. The latest update of the plan was completed in 2013.

The Council on Ocean Resources was established as part of the 2013 plan update. It was created by the heads of the seven state agencies, the four counties, and the University of Hawai'i—all with responsibilities for managing resources in the state's marine and coastal zone. The agencies came together to ensure a healthy, productive, and sustainable ocean ecosystem that supports economic growth while preserving and protecting the state's values and needs. The council allows for greater coordination and implementation of these shared ocean and coastal resource management priorities. The council is managed by the coastal zone management program and supported by the Marine and Coastal Zone Advocacy Council.

During this evaluation period, the State of Hawai'i has very methodically built a program that has gone from initial data collection to demonstration and adaptation. Where the 2006 plan established a large number of goals, strategies, and actions, the 2013 update refined the strategic actions to a more focused set that can be effectively prioritized, tracked, and implemented. The coastal zone management program held numerous public listening sessions for this latest revision of the plan. These sessions illustrated the public's desire for clear indicators to show progress being made to address this refined set of goals. Each management priority has been assigned to a lead agency that is initiating actions and tracking progress toward meeting the priorities set in the plan.

The coastal zone management program, as overall convener of plan implementation, has developed an online dashboard to track progress on the strategic actions of the Ocean Resources Management Plan. This online tool offers the latest information on progress toward meeting the 11 management

priorities outlined in the plan. Each of the management priorities has at least one indicator available through the dashboard, and each of these indicators includes explanatory information about the background, the latest status (benchmark), and a discussion of what the outcomes of the next steps might look like (target).

In addition to involving agency heads, Hawai'i's ocean resource management planning efforts include the Coordinated Working Group, composed of key managers from the participating agencies as part of the Sub-Regional Ocean Partnership, which works to involve citizens from across the state. The latter group has been used extensively to identify key issues at the grassroots level that need to be considered by the council and has helped to create two action teams to help implement the management priorities of the management plan. These action teams have also been essential in identifying technical assistance and training needs. One specific success was the Coastal Data Exchange, which brought together more than 130 people from 75 agencies and organizations to share information on current trends in coastal development and the management of coastal hazards.

Accomplishment: The state of Hawai'i continues to be a national leader in examining the impact of public and private land-based activities on ocean resource management and planning to improve coastal and ocean ecosystems.

Several stakeholders stated their concern that the current approach to addressing 11 priority management areas, while an improvement over previous versions of the plan, is still too broad and is resulting in a scattergun approach to management. There has been little new funding made available to address the issues in a multiagency way, and the staffing levels have remained steady or declined. The approach of identifying one or two highest priority issues for the council and the Coordinated Working Group to address at any one time, as is being done with the assistance of the sub-regional working groups, seems to be appropriate.

Other stakeholder concerns are whether the plan is primarily to implement existing single-agency programs or to develop shared responses to the most pressing issues of the day, and whether the current approach of focusing primarily on onshore impacts to marine resources is the best approach. It appears to the evaluation team that the structures that have been created have the ability to foster a multidisciplinary and multiagency approach. As plan implementation proceeds, the agencies should look for ways to encourage a shared responsibility and action to the limits allowed under state and federal laws.

Recommendation: In future iterations of the Ocean Resources Management Plan, the state should examine ways to better focus priorities and identify multiagency approaches to achieve the goals stated in the Hawai'i Coastal Zone Management Act (HRS Chapter 205A).

The coastal zone management program supported a study entitled *Assessing the Feasibility of Managed Retreat* that served as an exploration of the practicality of implementing managed retreat as a coastal adaptation strategy in the state.

The Hawai'i Coastal Zone Management Program identified a need for better building codes as a part of the state's strategies to address coastal hazards and climate change through the NOAA Section

309 Assessment and Strategy. Before 2010, building codes were approved by each county and the standards varied. The state adopted a statewide uniform building code (Hawai'i Administrative Rules Chapter 3-180) in 2009 that became effective in April 2010. The code was approved by NOAA for use as an enforceable policy in the Hawai'i Coastal Zone Management Program in January 2013.

The Hawai'i Coastal Zone Management Program has been central to the development of the building code and its subsequent implementation. The program helped to coordinate federal funding for the essential research that was needed to establish appropriate wind design standards for development in each of the counties through research partnerships with NOAA, FEMA, and the Hawai'i Emergency Management Agency. Designation of Hawai'i as a Special Wind Region by the American Society of Civil Engineers was a direct outcome of that work. Following the adoption of the statewide code, the coastal zone program led the efforts to provide training in the interpretation and application of the code. Demand for training on the building code remains high in the counties, and the coastal zone management program continues to support this training.

Accomplishment: The State of Hawai'i adopted a new uniform statewide building code that increased standards related to wind speed and hazard resilience. The Office of Planning led efforts to ensure that the code was incorporated into the federally approved Hawai'i Coastal Zone Management Program.

In ancient Hawai'i, fishponds played a key role in providing food for the people of Hawai'i. At one time, there were more than 400 fishponds statewide. Today only six fishponds are in operation, and several others are in the process of being restored. In 2012, the Hawai'i legislature passed a resolution urging the agencies of the coastal zone management program to find ways to streamline the permitting process for fishpond restoration. In 2013, the program developed and issued a concurrence for minor federal permit activities for fishpond restoration. In 2015, the Department of Land and Natural Resources developed a streamlined process for state permits for fishpond repair and restoration. The coastal zone management program continues to work with the NOAA Pacific Regional Office to streamline permitting by federal agencies.

Accomplishment: The Hawai'i Coastal Zone Management Program's Ocean Resources Management Plan has considered traditional community needs in project implementation.

Special Management Area Permitting

The Hawai'i Coastal Zone Act established special management areas to protect key coastal and ocean resources as one of the key elements of the coastal zone management program. These areas, as identified for each county, require that permits be obtained before development. The Hawai'i Coastal Zone Management Program works with each county to ensure consistent permitting implementation throughout the state.

Examples of Key Efforts

The coastal zone management program provides ongoing training and technical assistance to the county planning commissions (the designated county permitting authorities) and their staffs. The special management area coordinator in the coastal zone management program also conducts monthly meetings with the county planning and permitting staff to clarify state policy and guidelines. When requested by a county, the coastal zone program will also provide direct assistance by reviewing individual permit applications and any proposed changes to county permitting regulations. This training and assistance has proven invaluable to county permitting authorities, and has brought about a greater sense of consistency of permitting actions across the state.

In discussing special management area permitting with the four counties, the team learned that coastal zone program staff members have been very helpful with implementation. Publications related to the process have been distributed statewide and have been used to educate the public. Increased public knowledge about the process has made the work of the county officials easier. There is now interest in providing information to the public about coastal hazards and shoreline processes.

The Hawai'i Coastal Zone Management Program also provides annual financial assistance to the Counties of Maui, Kaua'i, and Hawai'i to support their special management area permitting efforts. The City and County of Honolulu previously received funding from the program, but, under a previous administration, opted not to continue to receive funds from the state. The funds not disbursed to Honolulu were allocated to the other counties, which now have relied on the increased level of funding for several years.

Honolulu has continued to issue special management area permits using local funds, but finds that it has difficulty maintaining consistency of application review due to a lack of staff. In some instances, this has delayed the issuance of permits, as the county has found it necessary to pull back some minor permit applications to consider them as major permits, which allows for a longer review period.

The City and County of Honolulu has asked to resume receiving funding to support their special management area permitting efforts. The coastal zone management program has been reluctant to redirect funding from the other counties to support Honolulu, as assessments of current funding levels demonstrate that there may be implications affecting staffing levels in each of the three counties if this request were met. The state, as of the date of the evaluation team visit, had not

found a permanent solution to this dilemma, but has identified and provided resources for projects to facilitate administration of special management area permitting.

Recommendation: The Hawai'i Coastal Zone Management Program should seek ways to fund the special management area permitting activities of all of the counties at appropriate levels.

The Hawai'i Coastal Zone Management Act (HRS §205A-26) specifies that the cumulative impact of individual permits should be considered before a special area permit is granted. The act (HRS §205A-22) further states, as it defines what activities are considered development and what are not development,

“provided that whenever the authority finds that any excluded use, activity, or operation may have a cumulative impact, or a significant environmental or ecological effect on a special management area, that use, activity, or operation shall be defined as “development” for the purpose of this part.”

The evaluation team heard from both stakeholders and county partners that it has been extremely hard to determine cumulative impacts in the special management area permitting process, that community members are frustrated, and that refined guidance would be helpful in making decisions. Because the Hawai'i Coastal Zone Management Program is charged with ensuring consistency among the county permitting programs, it would be good for both the state and the counties to play an important role in resolving this issue statewide.

In 2013, the Hawai'i Coastal Zone Management Program developed *Stormwater Impact Assessment*, a guidance document that addressed cumulative and secondary impacts of development on stormwater. This document could serve as a starting point for conducting a more comprehensive analysis of cumulative impacts.

Recommendation: The Hawai'i Coastal Zone Management Program should work with the counties to address comprehensively the issue of the cumulative impacts of development and, if appropriate, develop guidance to assist the county permitting authorities.

Hawai'i's Coastal Nonpoint Pollution Control Program

The Coastal Zone Act Reauthorization Amendments (CZARA) of 1990 started a process whereby each coastal state would develop a program to control nonpoint source pollution based on a legislative and regulatory structure that would enable them to meet joint guidance prepared by NOAA and the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA).

Examples of Key Efforts

The Office of Planning and the Hawai'i Department of Health have continued to make progress throughout this evaluation period. The management measures that have been satisfactorily addressed since the last evaluation include agriculture, watershed planning, urban areas, hydromodification, and wetlands and riparian areas. The state has also submitted several elements for approval, including installation of new on-site disposal systems; planning, siting, and designing highways and bridges; and monitoring and tracking, but are still awaiting decisions from NOAA and EPA as to their approvability.

Moving to Full Approval of Coastal Nonpoint Program

In accordance with Section 6217 of the Coastal Zone Act Reauthorization Amendments of 1990, all states with federally approved coastal programs must develop comprehensive coastal nonpoint pollution control programs (coastal nonpoint programs). These programs must be developed and implemented in accordance with guidance by NOAA and the EPA. Under CZARA, if NOAA and EPA find that a state has failed to submit an approvable program, the federal agencies must withhold funding for the state coastal zone management program under Section 306 of the CZMA and Section 319 of the Clean Water Act.

Ensuring that all states fully satisfy their coastal nonpoint program requirements under CZARA and the CZMA to maintain full funding of their coastal zone management programs is important. Section 306(d)(3)(16) CZMA states that coastal zone management programs shall "[contain] enforceable policies and mechanisms to implement the applicable requirements of the Coastal Nonpoint Pollution Control Program of the State required by section 1455b of this title". Since the Section 312 evaluation process is designed to assess how well the state is meeting its coastal nonpoint program requirements and carrying out the goals and objectives of the CZMA, which include protecting water quality, NOAA uses the evaluation process to assess a state coastal zone management program's progress in meeting coastal nonpoint program requirements.

The State of Hawai'i initially submitted program documentation in July 1996. After carefully reviewing Hawai'i's coastal nonpoint program submission to evaluate the extent to which Hawai'i's program conforms to the requirements of CZARA, NOAA and EPA approved Hawai'i's program, with conditions, on June 30, 1998. The conditions outlined actions the state needed to take to fully satisfy all CZARA requirements and receive full approval of its coastal nonpoint program. Since then, NOAA and EPA have worked with the State of Hawai'i to address its remaining conditions. At present 44 of the required 50 management measures have been approved, and the state is working diligently to finalize the remaining measures.

The evaluation team recognizes the State of Hawai'i's good-faith effort to move forward in a timely way with full approval of its conditionally approved coastal nonpoint program. NOAA also acknowledges delays by the federal agencies in reviewing submitted materials as they prioritize focus on other states with similar necessary actions already in place. NOAA commends the Hawai'i Coastal Zone Management Program for its close work with partners, including the Hawai'i Nonpoint Source Program operated under Section 319 of the Clean Water Act, NOAA, and EPA, to address the remaining conditions.

Necessary Action: The Hawai'i Coastal Zone Management Program must work with the NOAA Office for Coastal Management to develop and submit a work plan with interim benchmarks and a timeline for meeting the outstanding conditions of its conditionally approved coastal nonpoint source pollution program by February 1, 2020. The documentation indicating how Hawai'i has met the outstanding conditions must be submitted no later than August 31, 2023.

Additional Efforts to Improve Water Quality

The Hawai'i Coastal Zone Management Program continues to lead efforts to improve water quality and coastal ecosystems by developing guidance for existing state and local programs. Guidance documents developed during the reporting period supported efforts to help watershed managers develop plans to achieve water quality objectives, and to provide permitting agencies with design criteria for onsite stormwater detention. Trainings for the revised watershed planning guidance helped all four counties prepare and adopt watershed plans that enable them to receive funding from EPA under Section 319 of the Clean Water Act.

Cesspool management has proven to be a major water quality concern. The state has more than 90,000 cesspools, and nearly all of them pose a risk to surface water quality. In 2015, the Hawai'i legislature passed legislation to assist homeowners in replacing cesspools with more suitable wastewater systems.

Implementation of General Requirements

Support for Coastal Zone Management Programs in the Pacific Region

The Hawai'i Coastal Zone Management Program has been playing a key role in advancing coastal zone management throughout the Pacific region. The program co-leads with NOAA Office for Coastal Management quarterly calls with coastal management program staff members from the three Pacific territories to discuss federal consistency issues. These calls have been described by the territories as essential to creating a better understanding of concepts and responsibilities of the federal consistency process. The program also provides direct assistance to resolve concerns related to specific federal consistency cases.

The coastal zone management program has also allowed employees from the Pacific territories to come to their offices to shadow employees to see how they conduct their jobs. Comments from the territories were very enthusiastic about their experiences and appreciated that the Hawai'i staff asked them to think through their specific needs before coming to their offices so that they could make sure that their needs were met. This effort also allowed the territories to reflect on the status

of progress in their programs, and examine how the experience could help them introduce new initiatives or revive old ones.

Accomplishment: The Hawai'i Coastal Zone Management Program has shown leadership across the Pacific region by spearheading interstate collaboration on federal consistency and encouraging job shadowing of staff.

Establishment of the He'eia National Estuarine Research Reserve

The Hawai'i Coastal Zone Management Program coordinated the site selection and nomination processes for the He'eia Research Reserve, culminating in the designation of the reserve in 2017. The program also led the development of the management plan in coordination with the University of Hawai'i's Institute of Marine Biology. The involvement of the community surrounding the reserve was critical to all phases of the nomination and designation process. The research, training, and engagement conducted at the reserve will provide valuable opportunities to conserve coastal habitats and develop sound natural resource management practices.

Accomplishment: The Hawai'i Coastal Zone Management Program championed the creation of the He'eia National Estuarine Research Reserve in partnership with the local community and the University of Hawai'i.

Stakeholders expressed concern that Hawai'i residents have little understanding of the Hawai'i Coastal Zone Management Program and that the program might benefit from greater public knowledge about the program's efforts. Because direct coastal program staff and funding are already fully committed, the program could benefit from collaborations with other agencies and nongovernmental organizations on strategic communication.

Recommendation: The Hawai'i Coastal Zone Management Program should consider developing a comprehensive communications strategy to ensure public understanding of coastal and ocean issues and government responses to them.

Evaluation Metrics

Beginning in 2012, state coastal zone management programs began tracking their success in addressing evaluation metrics specific to their programs. These three metrics include a five-year target and provide a quantitative reference for each program about how well it is meeting the goals and objectives it has identified as important to the program.

Metric 1: Government Coordination and Decision-Making

Goal: Improve coordination and participation in the implementation of the CZM Program and improve government decision making through technical assistance and consultation on projects affecting the coastal zone.

Objective: Increase the number of partnerships between government agencies as well as partnerships with non-government organizations to address a CZM Program Goals and Objectives of HRS Ch. 205A.

Strategy: The Hawai'i CZM Program weaves together national, state, county and private organizations whose actions affect the state's coastal resources into a single network. The overarching goal is to maintain the needed communication and coordination so that these different stakeholders all act within the same policy framework. The approach for meeting this goal and target is to increase effective multisector collaboration to address Hawai'i CZM Program Goals and Objectives of HRS ch 205A. By increasing the partnerships between government, non-profit, private, public organizations, community groups, and individual community members, we will be able to encourage unique, long-term solutions. We held six coordination events in 2011. To help meet the goal of increased coordination events, we plan to incrementally increase the number of events each year – one additional event per year in each of the first four years and two additional events in the fifth year (Year 1 = 7 events, Year 2 = 8 events, Year 3 = 9 events, Year 4 = 10 events, Year 5 = 12 events), for a total of 46 events over 5 years. The strategies and activities for achieving the goal and objective are identified in Perspective 3: Promoting Collaboration and Stewardship in the ORMP. Government Coordination events are defined in the Coastal Zone Management Act Performance Measurement System Coastal Management Program Guidance, 2011.

Performance Measure: The number of coordination events related to Government Coordination offered or sponsored by the Hawai'i CZM Program.

Target: Between 2012-2017, 46 coordination events related to Government Coordination offered or sponsored by the Hawai'i CZM Program.

Year 1 results: 22

Year 2 results: 21

Year 3 results: 26

Year 4 results: 29

Year 5 results: 21

Cumulative Results: 119

Discussion: The program far exceeded its goal of 46 over the five year period. These results reflect the program's keen interest in providing trainings and listening sessions.

Metric 2: Public Access

Goal: Improve access to the state's beaches and recreational resources for all citizens

Objective: Develop a comprehensive understanding and statewide commitment to comprehensive public access for recreational resources and increase public access opportunities.

Strategy: Hawai'i's coasts provide the foundation of our social, economic, recreational, and environmental prosperity. Public access to coastlines and beaches is assured in our State Constitution, and the beaches are held in public trust by the State for the benefit of the people. Because access is increasingly under threat, the Hawai'i CZM Program's objectives and policies involve enhancing and protecting public access throughout the state. The approach for meeting this goal and target is to increase the number of activities to educate the public and resource agencies on public access and its importance to communities and the economy. We will focus on partnering with other organizations to hold educational events and encourage partnerships with a variety of organizations (e.g. vacation rental organizations and non-profit organizations) to increase a comprehensive understanding of public access in the State. We held five (5) educational events in 2011. To help meet the goal of increased educational events, we plan to incrementally increase the number of events each year – one additional event per year in each of the five years (Year 1 = 6 events, Year 2 = 7 events, Year 3 = 8 events, Year 4 = 9 events and Year 5 = 10 events), for a total of 40 educational events over 5 years. Public access education events are defined in the Coastal Zone Management Act Performance Measurement System Coastal Management Program Guidance, 2011

Performance Measure: Number of education events related to Public Access offered or sponsored by the Hawai'i CZM Program.

Target: *Between 2012-2017, 40 educational events related to Public Access offered or sponsored by the Hawai'i CZM Program.*

Year 1 results: 2

Year 2 results: 3

Year 3 results: 0

Year 4 results: 2

Year 5 results: 5

Cumulative Data: 12

Discussion: The number of educational events did not meet the target. As indicated by Metric 1 above, the program conducted many outreach events over the period. In the May 2015 Section 309 Assessment and Strategy, the public access enhancement area was rated as a "Medium" priority and an enhancement strategy was not pursued at that time. Perhaps a better metric would have been number of people trained, which is closer to showing true impact than the number of meetings.

Metric 3: Coastal Hazards and Climate Change

Goal: Encourage and facilitate state, county and federal agencies, policy makers, business and community partners to plan for the impacts of climate change.

Objective: Facilitate the collaboration and implementation of the Climate Change Adaptation Policy and legislation.

Strategy: Climate change and sea level rise are major driving forces of change in Hawai'i over the next 20 years. Adapting to and mitigating impacts will require that climate change adaptation measures be integrated into all levels of hazard mitigation and land use planning in Hawai'i. The Hawai'i CZM Program will encourage and facilitate state and county agencies to plan for the impacts of climate change by incorporating climate change adaptation measures developed through the Hawai'i Climate Change Adaptation policy and legislation. The approach for meeting this goal and target is to increase collaboration projects that are defined as partnership projects with state and county agencies for the purpose of planning ahead for impacts of climate change by incorporating adaption measures developed through the Hawai'i Climate Change Adaptation Policy and legislation. Each new partnership with a state or county agency committed to incorporating climate change adaptation measures is considered a new collaboration project. The Hawai'i Climate Change Adaptation Policy and legislation identifies fourteen (14) key governmental agencies (state and county agencies) responsible for the implementation of climate change adaptation measures. Through the provision of technical and/or financial assistance or policy guidance to the fourteen (14) key government agencies, the Hawai'i CZM Program proposes to establish at least two (2) new collaboration projects each year for a total of ten (10) collaboration projects by the year 2017.

Performance Measure: Number of collaboration projects established that support the guidelines of the Hawai'i Climate Change Adaptation policy and legislation.

Target: By 2017, 10 collaboration projects established that support the guidelines of the Hawai'i Climate Change Adaptation Policy and legislation.

Year 1 results: 1

Year 2 results: 2

Year 3 results: 2

Year 4 results: 1

Year 5 results: 2

Cumulative Data: 8

Discussion: Although the number of collaboration projects was only 80% of the goal, progress was made on implementing the subject report. As with Metric 2 above, the results and impact of the collaborations would be a more useful metric than merely the number of them.

Conclusion

For the reasons stated herein, I find that the State of Hawai'i is adhering to the programmatic requirements of the Coastal Zone Management Act and its implementing regulations in the operation of its approved Hawai'i Coastal Zone Management Program.

These evaluation findings contain one necessary action and four recommendations. The necessary action must be responded to within six months of the date of the final findings. The recommendations must be considered before the next regularly scheduled program evaluation, but they are not mandatory at this time. Program recommendations that must be repeated in subsequent evaluations may be elevated to necessary actions.

This is a programmatic evaluation of the Hawai'i Coastal Zone Management Program that may have implications regarding the state's financial assistance awards. However, it does not make any judgment about or replace any financial audits.

signed by Keelin S. Kuipers
Keelin S. Kuipers
Deputy Director
NOAA Office for Coastal Management

dated August 1, 2019
Date

Appendix A: Response to Written Comments

Two written comments were received as part of this evaluation.

Mr. Phil Fernandez, Hawai'i County, vice chair of the Marine and Coastal Zone Advocacy Council:

Mr. Fernandez provided comments on several issues. First, he lauded the staff leadership of the Hawai'i Coastal Zone Management Program as being highly dedicated throughout the review period. He appreciates that the program operates with high transparency and clear goals and that the advisory committee is consulted frequently to help shape goals.

Jean Public (via Yahoo.com):

"IT IS CERTAINLY WELL PAST TIME THAT ALL BUILDING ON COASTS SHOULD BE BANNED TOTALLY AND PERMANENTLY. WHEN AN OLD BUILDING COMES UP BY THE OCEAN, IT SHOULD BE CONDEMNED AND NOT ALLOWED TO REBUILD ON THAT SITE. NO HERITAGE SITES. IT IS WELL PAST TIME TO RECOGNIZE COASTAL FLOODING. THIS COMMENT IS FOR THE PUBLIC RECORD. THE DEVELOPERS JUST KEEP WANTING TO KEEP BUILDING THERE AND OUR GOVT SEEMS TO BE IN CABAL WITH THEM IN ALLOWING IT. WE NEED OUR GOVT TO SAY NO TO MORE BUILDING BY THE OCEAN IN ALL STATES OF THIS COUNTRY. NOT JUST HAWAII. THIS COMMENT IS FOR THE PUBLIC RECORD. IT IS TIME FOR ALL SUCH BEACH BUILDING TO BE STOPPED. LETS RECOGNIZE REALITY. THIS COMMENT IS FOR THE PUBLIC RECORD. PLEASE RECEIPT. JEAN PUBLIEE"

The evaluation team appreciates Jean Public's comment, but points out that this evaluation is of the Hawai'i Coastal Zone Management Program, which was approved under the provisions of the Coastal Zone Management Act (16 U.S.C. §1451-1465). The act authorizes states to voluntarily develop resource management programs "to preserve, protect, develop, and where possible, to restore or enhance, the resources of the Nation's coastal zone for this and succeeding generations." This evaluation examines only the state's implementation of its approved program.