

Internet Printing Protocol Workgroup Meeting Minutes

February 14, 2017

Meeting was called to order at approximately 2:15pm PT on February 14, 2017 and 9:00am PT on February 15, 2017.

Attendees

Smith Kennedy (HP)
Gyaneshwar C Gupta (Okidata - call in)
Ira McDonald (High North - call in)
Alan Sukert (Xerox - call in)
Mike Sweet (Apple)
Paul Tykodi (TCS - call in)
Bill Wagner (TIC)
Rick Yardumian (Canon - call in)

Agenda Items

1. IP Policy and Minute Taker
 - IP policy accepted, Mike taking minutes
2. Slides
 - <http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/slides/ipp-wg-agenda-february-17.pdf>
 -
3. IPP System Service
 - <http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippsystem10-20170212-rev.pdf>
 - Section 5.2, Table 1, Note 10: Create-Resource for resource-type, Send-Resource-Data for resource-format-supported
 - Section 5.6: Should "optional" be "OPTIONAL" or just use a synonym? Try to avoid use of lowercased conformance words
 - Line 815: '... when the Client supplies the "resource-ids" operation attribute ...'?
 - Line 825: Same thing
 - Section 5.9:
 - Reword "optional to supply"
 - Section 5.10:
 - Reword "optional to supply"
 - Section 6.1.2:
 - Line 936: Reword "optional to supply"
 - Section 6.2.2:
 - Lines 1334 and 1344: Reword "optional to supply"
 - Section 6.4.6 (Pause-All-Printers)
 - Add parenthetical about 'stopping' reason, like for Resume-All-Printers
 - Section 6.4.11:

- Lines 1747-1748: The System will change to a "system-state" of 'stopped' when all configured Printers have completed shutdown and moved to the 'stopped' state.
 - Make a similar change for Startup, Disable, and Enable
 - Global: Add printer attributes to response of Enable/Disable/Pause/Resume/Shutdown-All-Printers, model on Startup-All-Printers (also add printer-is-accepting-jobs)
 - Global: Add printer-message-from-operator operation attribute to Xxx-All-Printers operations
 - Need to research which attribute sets it...
 - About 95% content-complete - mainly need to expand some operation descriptions and fill out the security considerations.
4. Get-User-Printer-Attributes White Paper
- <http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/whitepaper/tb-userop-20170201.pdf>
 - Section 3.1.1:
 - Why can't Duncan print the photo?
 - Cannot limit based on application - no authoritative way to get that info
 - Could limit based on media type (print in color but not on photo media)
 - Section 3.1.x:
 - What about time-of-day restrictions? Source IP?
 - Semantics for Get-User-Printer-Attributes can say that returned attributes and values may vary based on out-of-band information such as most-authenticated user name, time-of-day, source address, etc.
 - Section 3.1.2: Drop since == OAuth or implementation detail separate from IPP
 - Section 3.1.3:
 - Unknown -> guest
 - printer-uri-supported/printer-xri-supported allow for multiple URIs, each with different security/authentication requirements
 - Discussion:
 - Get-Printer-Attributes needs to return list of all attributes and values configured by admin
 - Need to adopt Get-User-Printer-Attributes to get limited list
 - Mike: iOS could do it, macOS/Linux (with CUPS) would not
 - Separate logical printers can provide a restricted list of attributes and values to existing clients
 - Edge case - no significant push to add this since IPP/1.0
 - Q: Do we need this?
 - A: Probably not
 - But maybe write up best practices in the future...
5. IPP Finishings 2.1
- <http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippfinishings21-20170111-rev.pdf>
 - Results of vote so far: 4 yes, 3 abstain
 - Vote concludes this Friday, February 17th

- Jog Offset:
 - Options: do nothing, deprecate in favor of output-bin, add new finishings-col in future rev of finishings spec
 - Deprecate would be done separate from spec using IPP deprecation policy (registration template to IPP mailing list)
 - Printer finisher MIB has a jog reference edge (which edge gets jogged) but no subunit association (but a stacker offset, axis, and type but those are for other finishing processes?)
 - Printer MIB has an offset boolean for output tray
 - Consensus: Deprecate 'jog-offset' in favor of using "output-bin" with the 'mailbox' and 'stacker' values.
 - Action: Mike to post deprecation template for 'jog-offset' finishings/finishing-template values, with reasons.
 - Smith will post an updated draft for WG approval dated Feb 17, 2017 at the conclusion of the formal vote
6. IPP 3D Printing Extensions
 - <http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ipp3d10-20170110-rev.pdf>
 - Q: Can we evangelize this with developers?
 - Cura and other slicers? Probably not since they are generating G-code
 - Other open source developers? Need to identify
 - Printer manufacturers/3D print service providers - Ultimaker, PWG members, others?
 - Next steps:
 - Approve process for formal vote in Steering Committee
 - Approve editorial changes in IPP WG
 - Anne Price: Engage to get the word out that IPP 3D has been published
 - Also talk with 3MF consortium (WRT Print3d job ticket schema)
 - Make IPP sample code more visible, Raspberry Pi print server documentation
 - Action: Mike to document ippserver setup on Raspberry Pi for 3D
 - Develop iptool test file(s) for testing conformance and simulating a client.
 - Action: Mike to develop iptool tests for IPP 3D
 - Talk further in Steering Committee
 - Change requests:
 - "print-rafts" to "print-base": Approved
 - "printer-bed-temperature" to "platform-temperature": Approved
 - Additional printer-state-reasons: Approved
 - Print3d Schema
 - Still need to annotate elements
 - Q: What about job receipts?
 - A: Should be in the schema, but don't think 3MF has considered that yet?
 - Mike will post named version to PWG FTP server for review at

- subsequent IPP WG meetings once annotations are complete
 - Please send feedback to IPP WG list
- Other standards bodies:
 - Focus should be on reaching out and raising awareness, but with the understanding that we are addressing different kinds of printers
 - Consumer/office printers
 - Commercial print services
 - Not large-scale manufacturing hardware
- Next steps:
 - How to import/use other material type databases with IPP 3D?
 - Import names into IANA registry, or develop a naming scheme like MSN?
 - Naming scheme seems the most scalable solution, e.g., 'isoNNNN_material-name'
 - Something to add in IPP 3D v1.1
 - Need to add service counters
 - Come up with way to express work/usage per material
 - Also for IPP 3D v1.1
 - Need subunit status/configuration
 - Also for IPP 3D v1.1
 - MFD Alerts update
 - Ira and Mike are available as editors
 - Should be a simple editorial/registration update in the new document template
 - Do before IPP Transform
 - Start in Q2 2017
 - IPP Transform Service
 - Ira and Paul are available as editors
 - Will use an informative reference to the last working draft of SM Transform, but the document will be free-standing
 - Focus is on simple file format transforms for v1.0
 - Start in Q4 2017
 - Defer FaxOut and State errata updates until 2018 unless editors/volunteers appear.
 - Print3d schema is a medium priority item for 2017
 - Also IPP sample code updates
 - Consensus: Move IPP WG meetings to Thursdays from 3:00-4:30pm ET

Next Steps / Open Actions

- Next IPP WG conference call is Thursday, March 2, 2017 from 3:00-4:30pm ET
- Action: Mike to post deprecation template for 'jog-offset' finishings/finishing-template values, with reasons.
- Action: Mike to document ippserver setup on Raspberry Pi for 3D

- Action: Mike to develop ipptool tests for IPP 3D
- Action: Mike to locate IPP/1.1 RFC announcement and forward to IPP mailing list (DONE)
- Action: Mike to add document-format-accepted (1setOf mimeType) from IPP INFRA to registry (DONE)
- Action: Mike to look at document template to fix level 3 headings which are not bold (ONGOING - template was correct, Mike will look at the System Service document instead)
- Action: Mike to send IANA IPP registry updates to Ira (DONE)
- Action: Mike to add output-bin registration to IANA IPP registry (DONE)
- Action: Mike to fix registration of job-constraints-supported and job-resolvers-supported to include "resolver-name (name(MAX))" member attribute (DONE)