## NOAA MARINE FISHERIES

+ + + + +

## PUBLIC MEETING ON A PERMIT APPLICATION FROM MYSTIC AQUARIUM

+ + + + +

IMPORT OF 5 BELUGA WHALES INTO THE UNITED STATES FOR SCIENTIFIC RESEARCH PURPOSES

MONDAY NOVEMBER 18, 2019

+ + + + +

The Public Meeting convened in the Great Hall at the Silver Spring Civic Center, 1 Veterans Place, Silver Spring, Maryland, at 1:00 p.m., Amy Sloan, Moderator, presiding.

## STAFF PRESENT:

JENNIFER SKIDMORE, Biologist, Permits and Conservation Division

AMY SLOAN, Deputy Chief, Permits and Conservation Division

COURTNEY SMITH, Principal Scientist with Ocean Associates

SHASTA McCLENAHAN, Biologist, Permits and Conservation Division

CARRIE HUBARD, Biologist, Permits and Conservation Division

AMY HAPEMAN, Biologist, Permits and Conservation Division

JORDAN RUTLAND, Sea Grant Fellow, Permits and Conservation Division

## P-R-O-C-E-E-D-I-N-G-S

1:00 P.M.

MS. SLOAN: Good afternoon, everyone.

And thank you for coming to the public hearing on
the permit application, File No. 22629 submitted
by Mystic Aquarium.

My name is Amy Sloan. I'm the Deputy
Division Chief of the Permits and Conservation
Division of NOAA Fisheries, Office of Protected
Resource.

Today, I'm going to give a very brief presentation. I'll try to go through this as fast as I can to give speakers time. We'll just go over the logistics, the purpose, and a review of the application, an overview of the process that we use to make a decision on the application, and then I'll pause and take questions on our process.

And then we're going make sure that everyone has had a chance to register. I'm glad we were allowed to let you guys in early because I think most everyone is registered and then

we'll take oral comments and you'll be speaking at the front.

As you know, there's two registration tables. I think everybody is fine then, so I don't really have to worry about going over those. I do want to make sure everybody filled out a speaker card. If you did not fill out a speaker card, and you need to speak, please do it when I'm done with my presentation.

And also, sign in. We have an attendance sheet, so we would like to have your name and contact information.

You may also submit written comments before or after you speak and we would upload those to the FDMS.

We're going to randomize the order of speakers. The time limit, and we're hoping to give everybody at least five minutes, but right now we already have 28 speakers, so it looks like it might be around four minutes, but what we'll do is when I finish my presentation, we'll do a double check on where we are on time and then

we'll give you a final time limit.

As I mentioned, you'll be speaking up at the front, but when it's time for questions,

Jordan Rutland in the back will hand a microphone around if you have questions on the process when I get to that point.

We do have a court reporter, who will be taking a written record of the hearing today, and we will post that on our website when it's available.

And please take a moment to silence
your cell phones right now, if you don't mind and
I think everyone will be courteous and kind
during the presentations.

So the purpose of the hearing is for you, the public, to be able to provide oral comments on the permit application submitted by Mystic Aquarium. It's not for discussion or for debate. It's for you to stand up and provide your comments.

And then also as I mentioned, it will be an opportunity if you have questions on the

permit process.

So for the application, Mystic

Aquarium has requested a scientific research

permit to import five beluga whales from

MarineLand of Canada to Mystic Aquarium. The

beluga whales proposed to be imported were born

in captivity at MarineLand of Canada and at least

one parent is from the depleted Russian stock.

Mystic proposes to conduct health related research studies and develop non-invasive research techniques to contribute knowledge and inform the management and recovery of beluga whale populations in the wild, including endangered and depleted populations.

There are eight research studies

proposed which are detailed in the permit

application itself and they include neural

immunological studies, as I mentioned, developed

as non-invasive techniques, hearing and

physiological response to sound, photogrammetry,

diving physiology, microbiome, behavioral and

reproduction studies which would involve natural

breeding only, and testing of prototype telemetry devices and cameras.

In order to achieve those objectives,

Mystic would train the beluga whales to

voluntarily participate in the studies. They

propose to have the whales on display incidental

to the research, and if deemed necessary for

health or welfare, they propose to transport a

whale or whales to Georgia Aquarium where the

same research would occur.

Regarding public comments, as I mentioned, oral comments given today will be recorded in writing and that written record will be posted on our website which is at the bottom.

The written records may be also turned in today and if you do turn your written records in today in a hard copy format, we will scan them and upload them to regulations.gov and that is where public comments may be submitted in writing electronically through close of the comment period which is December 2nd.

And the permit application and

instructions for submitting the comments are on our website.

Regarding our decision process, so we will review each and every comment that's submitted. And then we will take into consideration the relevant and substantive comments, the statutory issuance criteria under the Marine Mammal Protection Act Section 104, the Marine Mammal Protection Act regulatory issuance criteria, and then we will prepare the National Environmental Policy Act documentation. And then our office director will make a final decision on the application.

So I'll pause for a moment to see if there are any questions on this process. Okay.

Oh, yes? Could you go to the microphone, please?

PUBLIC COMMENTER: If we submit--

MS. SLOAN: --You are on.

PUBLIC COMMENTER: If we submit written comments today, can we also submit a different set of comments at some later point?

1 MS. SLOAN: Yes. Thank you. Thank 2 you for the question. Any others? Great. So has anyone who wants to speak not 3 filled out one of these cards? 4 So I think we're 5 good. As I mentioned, the speaker order will 6 be random. What I'll do is I'll call the first 7 8 speaker. You're going to come up here and speak. 9 Jennifer and Courtney will remind you of your time and then I'll introduce the next speaker and 10 11 we'll just go that way. So if you can just pardon me for a 12 moment and I'll go confer with them. 13 14 (Pause.) 15 Okay, great. I'm sorry, I'm sorry, I 16 can't give you five minutes, but you will get 17 four minutes. And so without further ado, I'd 18 like to invite Carey Richard from Mystic Aquarium 19 to be the first speaker. 20 MS. RICHARD: Good afternoon. My name is Carey Richard. 21 I'm the Assistant Curator of 22 Marine Mammals at Mystic Aquarium where I've been

an animal care professional for the past 20 years.

During my tenure at Mystic, I've had the opportunity to work closely with a wide variety of species of marine mammals including beluga whales. Every day, I have the privilege to engage with guests during their visit and every day I see the spark of excitement from adults and children alike when they see an animal, especially a beluga, for sometimes the first time in their lives.

I entered this profession to make a difference in the lives of the animals that call the ocean home. My work with the beluga whales and all our care has allowed me to have a direct impact on the conservation of the species.

With the husbandry and research
behaviors that I have helped develop and
implement, I provide a service to scientists who
are dedicated to research efforts that will help
inform important recovery plans and policies. My
efforts ensure that the whales are participating

voluntarily towards this incredibly important goal.

I know that together with the species ambassadors that we care for every day that we are having a direct and meaningful impact on an average of over 800,000 guests each and every I know this because I answer questions from guests who would have never have had the opportunity to see a beluga whale if not for a visit to Mystic Aquarium. I know this because I've seen my own sons and family members begin to take more responsibility for their impact on our ocean, by beginning to use reusable shopping bags and mugs, stop utilizing straws, and take more of an interest in recycling after a visit to our aquarium. And I know this because I witness it firsthand every single day with my own sevenyear-old son's awareness of his impact on our planet.

My husband, an animal behavior researcher, who you will hear from today, and I have had many privileges throughout our career

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

including recording behavior of wild belugas in the Arctic, working together with researchers at Mystic Aquarium and other respective organizations including NOAA, to better understand factors that are affecting populations of wild belugas and assisting with the successful rehabilitation of a beluga whale calf named Tyonek from the endangered Cook Inlet population.

I could not have been a part of the amazing team that rehabilitated Tyonek had it not been for the animal care skills that I have honed at Mystic Aquarium. Tyonek is a true conservation success story, made possible only through years of scientific and husbandry research.

I have been privileged to have had these experiences, but most people and their lives will not be so fortunate and this is where using aquariums matter the most, bringing understanding of animals in ecosystems to people who cannot experience in any other way. You may be familiar with the saying in the end we will

conserve only what we love. We will love only what we will understand. And we understand only what we are taught.

The aim of Mystic Aquarium, each and every day, is to realize this mission, to inspire people to care for and protect our ocean planet through conservation, education, and research.

Approval of this permit allows our facility to continue to fill our responsibilities to beluga whale conservation by broadening our resources to continue non-invasive, voluntary research, to help validate processes so that they are applicable to endangered and threatened populations. We have the ability to ensure that this species is around for my son's lifetime, as well as his children and their children.

I watched my son grow into a magnanimous, funky, and wildly intelligent young boy who because of his accessibility to Mystic Aquarium has quite literally had the unique experience to learn about and from marine mammals himself. My husband I lead our son by example,

so he understands our responsibility as members of the human race to leave this earth much better than we found it.

I made this trip today because approval of this permit is critically important. We must act now to ensure that the depletion of beluga whale populations is halted and that recovery efforts continue to be well informed.

I urge you to approve this permit application and I thank you for your time and consideration.

MS. SLOAN: Can everybody hear okay?
Okay, great. Thanks.

I'd like to invite Laura Thompson from Mystic Aquarium to come up, please.

MS. THOMPSON: My name is Dr. Laura
Thompson. I am a researcher at Mystic Aquarium
and a co-PI on this permit. I'm here to urge the
approval of this permit to bring five belugas to
ensure the future of belugas conservation
research and the education of future generations
of conservation biologists, researchers, and

educators.

Mystic Aquarium has a proven history of world class beluga care and research and a dedication to education. I myself am a testament to Mystic Aquarium's commitment to these programs. Having grown up visiting the aquarium, my aspiration to become a marine biologist was in no small part shaped and inspired by exposure to the belugas at Mystic.

My career in beluga research and my participation in beluga conservation now are the direct results of the educational and professional development opportunities I have received through Mystic Aquarium, first as an undergraduate, and then as the first graduate student to complete a joint Ph.D. program between the Mystic Aquarium and the University of Connecticut and through post-doctoral research funded by the Office of Naval Research. I continue as a scientist at Mystic today.

During my Ph.D. studies working under Dr. Tracy Romano, I developed my specific

research interests related to beluga physiology and conservation concerns. I studied the relationship between dive behavior and health as it relates to immune function in these animals.

Only a few institutions carry out any immune function work for marine mammals and Mystic Aquarium is a leader among them.

With my work, we were the first lab to describe adaptation of beluga immune cells to diving and continue to investigate what conditions may interrupt these adaptations.

The goal of my work is to understand how belugas maintain health during diving and how human activity or a changing environment impacts their ability to do so. For example, we know belugas are changing their dive patterns in response to the changing distribution of their prey with warming Arctic waters, as well as the presence of boats and sound in the ocean. The significance of these changes in behavior is unknown, cannot be determined from tag studies, and it may not be detectable by observation at

all.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

Our research is working towards understanding these consequences on individuals and ultimately population health and it is only made possible through the belugas in our care. Indeed, a key factor in assessing these important physiological responses is our ability to collect repeated samples from the belugas at Mystic and directly relate our results to specifically trained and observed dive behaviors. truly unique beluga studies that are not being conducted anywhere else in the world and have clear implications for understanding the health challenges belugas face in a rapidly-changing Arctic. Yet, this work not be possible in the field, a point that I speak to from experience.

As part of Mystic Aquarium's

dedication to the health of wild beluga

populations, I have had the extraordinary

opportunity to travel to two locations to

participate in wild beluga studies. I have seen

where remote environments and minimal

infrastructure limit accessibility, make it difficult, and even dangerous to collect samples, and limit our laboratory analyses as well as the ability to interpret results.

Yet research involving belugas at
Mystic Aquarium is helping to fill these gaps in
knowledge and develop new approaches to field
research. This contribution of knowledge is an
invaluable asset to the future of beluga
conservation and this permit is a critical
component to securing such an asset for the
success of future conservation and management
efforts.

Admittedly, these studies have been limited by access to a very small number of animals. With the addition of five belugas will not only speed results, but will increase our confidence in results. A decision to not approve this permit will only impede beluga research and have unfavorable consequences on the progress of beluga conservation. I encourage you to use Mystic Aquarium's high standards of education and

research to set the precedent for belugas under human care, approve this permit, and allow these animals to truly be ambassadors for their species and help forge the way towards protection of wild populations. Thank you.

MS. SLOAN: Our next speaker -- the next speaker I'd like to invite up is Kate O'Connell from the Cetacean Society
International.

MS. O'CONNELL: Good afternoon. My
name is Kate O'Connell. I'm a resident of the
State of Connecticut and a member of the Board of
Directors of Cetacean Society International, a
marine conservation organization that is
headquartered in West Hartford, Connecticut. I'm
speaking today on behalf of the Society and its
many members and supporters throughout the state.

Our organization is deeply concerned by the proposal from Mystic Aquarium to import five beluga whales from MarineLand in Canada for purposes of scientific research.

We are aware that the Canadian

Government recently adopted a law, S-203, prohibiting the public display, breeding, import, and export of whales and dolphins. Although Mystic is well known for its research programs, we feel that given the size and configuration of the facility any imported whales will be incidentally on public display as noted.

Although the new Canadian regulation prohibits breeding, Mystic Aquarium has stated in its U.S. permit application that it will allow the imported beluga whales to mate and produce offspring, although reproduction is not essential for the research it is proposing. As noted by CSI's President, David Kaplan, in a letter to the editor of The Bay, a newspaper based in Southeast Connecticut, our organization is worried that the proposed import will create a back door to get new blood into U.S. captive beluga breeding programs.

We worry that Mystic Aquarium's proposal will stretch the boundaries of both Canadian and U.S. laws, opening the door to those

whose motivations and expertise are not of the same caliber. There are several U.S. facilities that keep belugas as the breeding programs of this species in captivity has largely failed and none have the research reputation of Mystic. There is a real possibility that some or all of these facilities will try to import MarineLand's belugas for public display and with Mystic's precedent set, they might well succeed.

We are especially concerned that

Mystic is partnering at this moment with Georgia

Aquarium on this venture and that some of the

whales could in future be transferred to Georgia.

We urge NMFS to deny this permit and to encourage Mystic to work directly with MarineLand to improve the conditions of the belugas and establish a research program there. This will spare these whales the stress of transport and separation from their social group and Mystic, the negative attention that this dangerous precedent invites.

We are hopeful that Mystic Aquarium

will continue with its work on belugas in the wild, so we respect not only the letter, but the spirit of the laws that seek to end the global trade in belugas. Thank you.

MS. SLOAN: I'd now like to invite Holley Muraco from Mystic Aquarium.

MS. MURACO: Good afternoon. My name is Dr. Holley Muraco and I'm the Director of Research for the Mississippi Aquarium. I've been working in the zoo and aquarium industry for over 20 years in a variety of roles including animal trainer, welfare consultant, reproduction, and behavior expert, director, and researcher. I'm here today on behalf of marine mammal researchers who are able to study animals under the care of humans and apply that knowledge and to direct conservation action.

It is unfortunate that zoos and aquariums who house cetaceans have become the primary target of extremist groups and their financial campaigns. Not only are the claims made against zoos and aquariums unfounded, the

end result, if they are successful, would prevent critical research advances that would directly benefit wild species.

Take for example our new Mississippi Aquarium. We will open in 2020. It's located on the Mississippi Sound in the northern Gulf of Mexico. Some of you might be familiar with this It is too often overlooked, forgotten, region. or disregarded. Our aquarium is going to bring much needed awareness about this area to the The Mississippi Sound and across the public. northern Gulf of Mexico is home of bottlenose dolphins, Kemp's ridley sea turtles, hammerhead sharks, sperm whales, giant squid, rail sharks, manta rays, and killer whales. It is also home to one of the most endangered whales in the whale, the Gulf of Mexico Bryde's whales where there are less than 100 individuals remaining.

The biodiversity of this region is remarkable and highly under studied. It has been hit with back to back natural and man-made disasters including hurricanes like Katrina and

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

the Deepwater Horizon oil spill that resulted in a four-year UME with over 1100 stranded marine mammals.

We're currently experiencing yet
another dolphin UME and it may be associated with
the historic long term opening of the Bonnet
Carre Spillway resulting in trillions of gallons
of freshwater pouring into the Gulf.

The Mystic Aquarium is going to be a research hub and collaborate for vertebrate study in the Northern Gulf of Mexico. Our aquarium, along with very well cared for dolphins who were all born in human care that will live there will serve as a living laboratory of students and researchers. We have combined an in situ and ex situ program where scientists can be fully engaged in multi-disciplinary research advancements.

Our field studies are going to identify and understand reproductive success, failure, pathology in wild dolphins based directly on our knowledge of reproductions from

dolphins in aquaria. We will disseminate this information to the public to bring conservation awareness and inspire a sense of urgency for wild restoration and protection.

Currently, our aquarium is under construction and we have no animals. Yet, anti-aquarium extremist groups are already protesting against us. It is unfathomable to me the massive waste of money being spent on a completely unfounded pretense when wild animals are truly suffering and need help.

My research focuses on the understanding of the natural reproductive biology of marine mammals with animals in human care and the application of that knowledge to wild studies. Truly understanding reproduction and infertility requires daily monitoring in real time. In order to collect data from cetaceans in aquariums researchers need access to the animals as well as having an environment conducive to research.

Mystic Aquarium and other accredited

zoos and aquariums in the U.S. are uniquely 1 2 suited to providing researchers with the necessary requirements. I highly urge the 3 4 passing of the approval of this permit. MS. SLOAN: Thank you, and I apologize 5 for getting your affiliation wrong. 6 Next, I'd like to invite Katie Cubina, 7 8 I don't know if I said that right. At Mystic 9 Aguarium. Did I get it right? MS. CUBINA: Cubina 10 11 MS. SLOAN: Cubina. Thank you. 12 MS. CUBINA: Good afternoon. My name is Katie Cubina. I'm the Senior Vice President 13 14 for Mission Programs at Sea Research Foundation's Mystic Aquarium where our mission is to inspire 15 16 people to care for and protect our ocean planet 17 through conservation, education, and research. 18 I'm here to testify in support of the research permit that has been submitted by Mystic 19 20 Aquarium to NOAA's National Marine Fisheries 21 Service. My role at the aquarium is to fully

integrate our education, research, and exhibits

department in order to maximize our conservation impact as one of the most trusted, science based, cultural institutions in New England. As such, our conservation work begins with rigorous and credible science and is always aimed at enhancing the health of aquatic ecosystems.

Research has, and always will be, core to our organization. As evidenced by the recently released IPBES Global Assessment Report, in order to halt biodiversity loss, slow the deterioration of nature, and meet biodiversity, climate, and sustainable development goals by 2030, we must act boldly and we must act now.

Amongst other sobering statistics, the report indicates that more than a third of all marine mammals are threatened with extinction.

While our research portfolio addresses a range of critical topics aimed at stemming the tide of what is now popularly being referred to as the sixth mass extinction, none of this research is more timely or critical than our work on beluga whales whose Arctic home is disproportionately

threatened by climate change and related threats of industrial development.

As you are aware, Sea Research

Foundation is a center for global research on

beluga whales with a core team of scientists

studying belugas within a larger world renowned

marine science research program. Our leadership

in this area is evidenced by the fact that in

March of 2019, we hosted the second international

conference on beluga whale research and

conservation.

Beluga studies at Sea Research

Foundation advanced knowledge of immune

responses, indicators of health, hearing and

sound issues, diving physiology, and the

development of non-invasive research techniques.

Our research tools and findings directly aid in

the conservation of endangered beluga populations

such as those in Cook Inlet, Alaska and the St.

Lawrence Estuary, as well as declining

populations elsewhere. Sea Research Foundation's

research is key to advancement and recovery and

sustainability plans that are supported by indigenous community members, scientists, wildlife managers, and others.

Translating the science in order to inform the public, educate students and educators, cultivate environmental stewards and inform management policy is our job. And we take that job very seriously.

Aquariums play a critical role in engaging the public in conservation. Countless research studies including a 2014 study by Impacts indicate that people's underlying concern for the ocean is heightened by a visit to an aquarium, that they expect, trust, and appreciate information about conservation, and that they want to be part of a solution. From this research, our own experiences, and that of colleagues in our profession, we know that we occupy a unique niche within society as it relates to our ability to inspire and motivate conservation action.

Mystic Aquarium engages over a hundred

thousand students annually in our conservation education programs and an additional 50,000 individuals in direct public conservation programs where they serve as citizen scientists in a range of initiatives that include marsh restoration, population monitoring, and marine debris removal events.

Furthermore, many of our educational initiatives are aimed at students from high need communities, locally, regionally, and nationally. Sea Research Foundations dedicates millions of dollars annually to support implementation of these programs across the nation. Of note, we recently hosted an NSF funded scientific, cultural, and educational exchange program with Alaskan Natives and Native American teams focused squarely on beluga research and conservation.

Thank you for your time and careful consideration of this important matter.

MS. SLOAN: Ok, the next speaker will be Justin Richard from the University of Rhode Island.

MR. RICHARD: Good afternoon. My name is Dr. Justin Richard and I am here to voice my strong support of Mystic Aquarium's permit application. As an Assistant Professor at the University of Rhode Island, I am studying the reproductive biology of aquarium beluga whales in an effort to develop tools and to generate data that can be used to improve the management and conservation of beluga whales in the wild, especially the endangered Cook Inlet beluga whales.

Belugas live in one of the harshest environments on the planet, the Arctic. Hidden from view for much of the year by sea ice and cold water, we know next to nothing about their reproductive behavior and physiology outside of the summer season. By sending trained belugas at Mystic Aquarium, we hope to gain insight into the lives of these animals in a way that is simply not possible in the wild.

For example, my research has focused on validating non-invasive research tools that

can be used to study belugas. Developing noninvasive methods to study wild whales is critical
as we desperately need data on wild populations
in order to first understand why some populations
are struggling so that managing agencies can
develop strategies to eliminate these impediments
to recovery.

A key feature to the success of this research is the ability to monitor individual animals longitudinally. Repetitive, non-invasive sampling and behavioral observations throughout the year allow research projects that are logistically impossible to conduct with wild belugas. My current research focuses on simultaneous monitoring of physiology and behavior to elucidate beluga reproductive strategies which is critical for understanding population growth in the wild.

With the belugas in close proximity to the marine mammal experts and research facilities, more robust and cost-effective research is possible. The training expertise and

experience of the husbandry and veterinary staff
Mystic Aquarium is also critical to the success
of these research projects.

In addition to enabling critical research on belugas, the increase in research capacity will create opportunities to train the next generation of scientists who will one day be responsible for improving our understanding and management of these animals.

since 2013, over 40 college
undergraduates have gained independent research
experience by assisting with my research. I am a
product of the educational opportunities and
research training made possible by Mystic
Aquarium veterinarians and scientists. Dr. Tracy
Romano is an extremely important mentor to me as
a scientist and her support and guidance made my
Ph.D. research possible. I intend to continue to
collaborate with the Mystic Aquarium research
team as we work together on our shared passion of
beluga conservation.

This effort is a deeply personal one

for me. There is no doubt that I am doing what I'm doing today because of my experiences at zoos and aquariums as a child and my experience as a husbandry professional at Mystic Aquarium. I have devoted my professional life to advancing our understanding of these animals with the ultimate goal of conserving the species for future generations.

During my 20-year affiliation with Mystic Aquarium, I've been fortunate to contribute to this goal as an educator, trainer, and researcher. My wife, an expert in beluga husbandry with 20 years of professional experience, shares my passion for beluga conservation. I am inspired by the hard work, compassion, and expertise that it takes to provide exceptional care for the animals that we are learning so much from.

Through the skilled training of the whales by Mystic trainers and the expertise in the marine mammal veterinarians using non-invasive methods, Mystic Aquarium routinely

provides novel data on belugas that has implications for the management of wild belugas. Having a larger social group of belugas at Mystic will facilitate more valuable research that is crucial as wild populations increasingly require active management due to anthropogenic factors and I look forward to contributing to these efforts. Thank you for the opportunity to express my support.

MS. SLOAN: Okay, the next speaker will be Tonia Osborne from Mystic Aquarium.

MS. OSBORNE: My name is Tonia and my Inupiaq name is Tyonek (phonetic). I grew up in Northwest Alaska near the ocean. Our family and whole community depends on traditional foods to survive and thrive.

Living in Alaska is extremely
expensive with limited food availability. In
village stores what is available is either frozen
or off the shelf. For this reason, many families
depend on subsistence hunting of traditional
foods such as seals, whales, fish, and caribou as

they have been for millennia. These animals weren't only a source of food, but also became incorporated into a medicine and identity to this day.

My cultural identity and passion for science has allowed me to combine indigenous and traditional knowledge with western science. The Mystic Aquarium's National Science Foundation funded research internship, I had the amazing opportunity to participate in beluga whale research at Mystic Aquarium and travel to the Arctic to conduct research.

At the aquarium, my mentor, Dr. Tracy
Romano and her team of conservation researchers
taught me not only laboratory protocol, but also
how to collect—how you are utilizing aquarium
belugas to collect non-invasive biological
samples, via their blow spray, to learn about
their health.

I had the amazing opportunity to participate in beluga whale research and join the cultural exchange between Mashantucket Pequot

Tribe and the Inupiat people of the Arctic.

Through these close collaborations between scientists and indigenous people, we were able to conduct beluga whale research and ensure their future health.

Mystic Aquarium is a global leader in beluga whale research. With climate change happening at an increased rate in the Arctic, it is important that we continue research on Arctic marine mammals to help us better understand its effects.

It is important that beluga research in aquariums and in the Arctic continues. We must maintain collaboration between conservation researchers and those who hold traditional knowledge, such as those relationships Dr. Tracy Romano has worked hard to create and maintain to this day.

During my internship I have been inspired to continue marine mammal research at my university in Alaska and to contribute what I can to research and conservation of whales. So one

day I hope I will be a reliable resource in my community.

I encourage you to approve this permit to ensure the future of belugas for generations to come. Their importance is not only a necessary component in our ecosystem, but also to our cultural heritage and identity.

MS. SLOAN: Next will be Dr. Paul Boyle from American Humane.

MR. BOYLE: Good afternoon. I'm Dr. Paul Boyle, National Director of the Humane
Certified Zoos and Aquariums Program at American
Humane. I'm here to support Mystic Aquarium's beluga permit application.

I've worked in the zoo and aquarium community for 35 years. And formerly as the Executive Director of a New York Aquarium, I had beluga whales in my care which I chose to move to a larger facility because it was best for their long-term welfare. This experience is specifically why I strongly recommend moving the five beluga whales to Mystic which has the

largest beluga habitat in the United States.

American Humane is the first national humane organization founded in 1877 focused on animal welfare that's rooted in science. Today's aquariums and zoos play critical roles in conservation and educating people about the extraordinary species that share this planet with us.

American Humane launched the Humane
Certified Program in 2015 as the first, thirdparty certification dedicated solely to the
welfare of animals in zoos and aquariums. Mystic
was one of the inaugural institutions to be
assessed by our independent auditors using
rigorous welfare measures in a certification
process that is the leader in animal welfare
assessment world wide. Mystic also is the only
aquarium to hold a USDA scientific research
license.

Their proposal is compelling. Mystic has conducted high-quality research on belugas for over 40 years, making it a global center of

excellence in beluga biology, ecology, and diverse other scientific subjects that are increasingly vital to beluga sustainability in the wild.

Mystic publishes its scientific

findings in the peer-reviewed literature and then

translates the science into engaging stories for

the public, infusing hundreds of thousands of

visitors, teachers, and school children in the

fascinating science of whales in a rapidly
changing world.

The scientific promise of the Mystic proposal was most evident to me in its hosting the 2019 Second International Workshop on Beluga Whale Conservation and Research. This was the most impressive workshop that I have attended in 35 years as a scientist and conservationist which was so because Mystic succeeded in bringing together all beluga whale stakeholders, scientists from across the U.S., Canada, and other countries, U.S. and Canadian regulators, and Inuit tribal leaders with all of them

together focused on beluga population sustainability. It was compelling evidence of Mystic's leadership in forwarding science that today is informing the regulation of belugas in the wild and even it's positively influencing AMMPA authorized tribal hunting practices.

We're all familiar with the hope for science results to inform conservation in the field and in the case of Mystic's proposal that outcome is already happening. The NOAA website reports that NOAA Fisheries is committed to conserving beluga whales and protecting and rebuilding depleted and endangered populations. American Humane strongly urges NOAA Fisheries to approve Mystic's forward-thinking proposal for its convincing science, demonstrated collaboration, and intense focus on forwarding a safe future for beluga whales. And most importantly, American Humane believes the belugas' new home at Mystic will be comfortable and humane with excellent care and welfare. Thank you.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

MS. SLOAN: The next speaker will be Kelly Jaakkola from AMMPA. Did I get that right, Kelly?

MS. JAAKKOLA: Yes, that's right. My name is Dr. Kelly Jaakkola. I'm an MIT-trained scientist who's conducted research with cetaceans for more than 20 years. As such, I want to be clear, that there is no doubt that research with cetaceans in marine mammal facilities has been crucial in helping scientists understand these animals. And, there is also no doubt that the knowledge gained from that research informs and positively impacts conservation efforts with wild cetaceans.

The vast majority of what we know about cetaceans' perception, physiology, cognition, healthcare, has been discovered by research conducted in marine mammal facilities. This includes basic information about these animals such as their echolocation and how that works, diving physiology, metabolism, gestation periods, hearing range, and so forth. And it

also includes applied information such as how to diagnose and treat their diseases. These kinds of advances are only possible by working up close with individual known animals over extended periods of time. That's the only way to set up a situation that's controlled and consistency that you need. It's the only way to know whether and how the data vary over individuals' time of day, whether an animal recently ate, and so forth.

This research for marine mammal facilities directly informs conservation efforts by developing health assessment techniques that can then be used to assess wild mammals. This includes things like how to detect hormones and immune components, not just in their blood, but also less invasive samples like their saliva, breath, and feces.

Figuring out the logistics of collecting biological samples and information non-invasively such as using drones for photos and breath collection, developing a way to passively test an animal's hearing by measuring

its brain waves or developing a respiratory flow meter to be able to analyze an animal's lung function.

This research also provides baseline information that tells us what typical healthy ranges are on all of these assessments which is what allows us to interpret the data from the wild animals. So because of this, biologists working on the conservation of these animals in the wild will not need to guess about the health and conditions of animals and populations. can use photos and samples collected from drones to determine the body condition and health status of free-swimming animals. They can also triage stranded animals to immediately know if that animal has respiratory problems or a hearing problem which is going to affect how they treat that animal. Which brings me to this particular research permit.

Mystic Aquarium is already doing this type of research with their belugas. They've got a state-of-the-art, beautiful facility and a

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

highly qualified team of scientists, marine
mammal experts, and veterinarians working there
with their animals. But to do this kind of
research most effectively, you need more than
just a few animals. Animals vary, just like
people vary, so if you want to know what a
representative range is, whether that's of
hearing or body condition or concentration of
particular hormones, you have to have a big
enough sample size to give you that
representation. The five animals in question
were all born in human care and are all currently
living in an over-crowded facility.

So whether you're looking at what's best in terms of research or conservation or individual animal welfare, all three point to approving this program. And I hope that's what you will do. Thank you.

MS. SLOAN: Next I'd like to invite Greg Marshall. He's here representing himself.

MR. MARSHALL: Good afternoon. I'm

Dr. Greg Marshall. I am the inventor of

Crittercam. I'll be talking about some of my experience with Mystic developing the capability of Crittercam for use with wild free-ranging animals, beluga whales in particular.

Crittercam, if you don't know, is an imaging data logging instrument developed to study wild, free-ranging animals. Deployed with the animal, video and environmental data we collect from the animal's point of view provides important information and insights into the animal's behavior and ecology in places we simply cannot be.

This facilitates new understanding of factors influencing many aspects of animal biology over spatial and time frames that are relevant to the animals themselves.

In my life history, so in the course of my career, mostly with National Geographic Society, I've worked with more than 80 species in remote corners of the world. These studies revealed many new insights into how animals function and survive in places we cannot

routinely access. Such information is critical to management and conservation efforts since we can't effectively protect something we don't understand.

My research collaborators and I have published more than 60 research papers, peer-reviewed papers on this work, most recent of which is the galley proofs that I got last week.

The fundamental premise of this work is that free-ranging animals, wild, free-ranging animals, behaving normally in their natural environment, can teach us important things about what they need to survive and thrive. Our challenge is to see those things and to ensure to the very best of our ability that what we are, what we observe, and what we document, in fact, represents normal, natural behavior. This is extremely challenging since much of what we record in Crittercam's onboard video have never been seen before.

So how do we try to ensure that the animals are, in fact, behaving normally while

carrying our instruments? Well, we've employed a number of conservative strategies. We designed Crittercam systems to be small, streamlined, and intrusive as possible. We developed the most benign and adaptive deployment techniques possible and critically and of course, most relevant to today's discussion, whenever possible we test any of our novel ideas, novel concepts, in systems under tightly-controlled conditions. Of course, this is where my relationship with Mystic Aquarium comes into play. Having access to animals under human care is incredibly valuable for evaluating the efficiency of any potential new animal borne instrument.

Under closely-controlled conditions and working with professionals, care for, and in my experience with Mystic Aquarium care about the animals in their care, we're able to work with the most qualified and considered experts to design, test, and improve field equipment before it's ever deployed in the wild.

This takes work and partners who share

a commitment to a meaningful research that is safely, properly, and effectively pursued. My experience with the Sea Research Foundation has been such a partner.

Needless to say, during the tests that we've done, I've been very impressed with the quality of the facilities at Mystic Aquarium and more importantly, the professionalism, the scientists, and staff and their obvious concern for the animals in their care was evident in every aspect of my experience there. Clean, well-managed facilities, meaningful and stimulating interaction with the animals, and importantly, for my specific interest, engaged in effective oversight of the controlled tests we conduct.

These are good people whose first and foremost interest is in the welfare of the animals they look out for. Whales born under human care and whose lives and welfare were almost certainly were connected to a human support system, I can't think of a better place to be or in better hands to be than at Mystic.

I'm very happy to support this permit application and hope you will as well. Thank you.

MS. SLOAN: I would like to invite Melanie Johnson from PETA.

MS. JOHNSON: I'm Melanie Johnson from PETA. As will be discussed in detail in the written comments submitted by PETA and a coalition of NGOs, the Marine Mammal Protection Act simply prohibits the importation proposed by Mystic Aquarium. The MMPA imposes a strict moratorium on the taking and importation of all marine mammals subject to a few narrow exemptions.

Individuals from a depleted population and their progeny receive additional protections. As an initial matter, all the mothers of the whales to be imported were captured from the depleted Sakhalin Bay, Nikolai Bay, Amur River population. The fathers were captured from the same population or the White Sea which is considered to be of moderate conservation concern by the international scientific community due to

insufficiency of data and concerns related to pollution, vessel traffic, and tourism activities.

As progeny of one depleted population and one of unknown conservation status with the burden on Mystic to show it is not depleted, greater restrictions apply to the whales Mystic seeks to import. Critically, the MMPA prohibits the importation of individuals from depleted populations for public display, even if that display is considered incidental to research.

In enacting the MMPA, Congress placed a clear prohibition on public display import permits for its depleted stocks of marine mammals. When NMFS issued its final rule designated the Sakhalin Bay, Nikolai Bay, Amur River beluga whales as depleted, it likewise declared that quote importation of beluga whales from this population or their progeny into the United States for the purpose of public display will now be prohibited end quote.

It is summarily clear that NMFS does

not have the authority to allow public display of depleted whales incidental to a scientific research permit. The MMPA explicitly authorizes the Agency to allow for public display of depleted marine mammals incidental to an enhancement permit. However, the MMPA does not authorize the Agency to allow public display of depleted marine mammals incidental to a scientific research permit.

The Supreme Court has made clear quote that when Congress includes particular language in one section of a statute, but omits it in another, let alone in the very next provision, the court presumes that Congress intended a difference in meaning, end quote.

Accordingly, the Agency cannot allow for public display of a depleted marine mammal incidental to a scientific research permit. Even if Congress had authorized NMFS to allow public display incidental to a research permit, full time public display is not incidental to research.

Mystic also fails to meet several of the threshold conditions to obtain a research permit. First, the research can be accomplished using non-depleted animals including with some of the 30 belugas currently in United States facilities with which Mystic admittedly collaborates. Mystic admits that it shows these belugas to be imported, not because of their heritage, but because they were all born in captivity and are trainable. In fact, they were all born and raised in captivity and all but one is a hybrid of two geographically and genetically separated populations. These inherent confounding variables undermine any purported justification for specifically using progeny of a depleted population to help that wild population.

Mystic also asserts that the studies are not feasible at other facilities that currently hold belugas. Yet, it also has its former collaboration with Georgia Aquarium and asserts that if any of the whales needed to be moved there for social, health, or welfare

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

reasons, the identical research would continue without exception. These positions are irreconcilable.

Second, this import would likely have a negative impact on the population or result in taking of additional marine mammals by increasing the demand for captive belugas. In short, the MMPA prohibits the import of cetaceans from a depleted population or their progeny for scientific research with incidental public display. And even if it were permitted, Mystic cannot meet its burden to satisfy the stringent threshold requirement.

I urge the Agency to adhere to the clear restrictions that Congress imposed and deny the permit application.

MS. SLOAN: The next speaker is Roslyn Gilhuly from Mystic Aquarium.

MS. GILHULY: Good afternoon. My name is Roslyn Gilhuly. I'm a member of Mystic

Aquarium's Leadership Team. I'm the Senior Vice

President of External Relations. I've been

employed by Mystic for over a decade. I'm also a native of Connecticut and have visited Mystic since my childhood.

Mystic has a long and storied history. Since 1973, we have hosted more than 20 million visitors, provided direct educational programs for over 2 million children and adults, published more than 150 scientific reports, and pioneered the current study of thousands of species of marine life.

I am proud to be part of this organization. Throughout my tenure, I have seen firsthand the world-class care provided to all animals at Mystic Aquarium and the deep and unwavering commitment at every level of the organization to both local and global action for protection of the ocean and its inhabitants.

Mystic Aquarium is a leader in the field of marine mammal research and conservation.

Our team, led by Chief Scientist, Dr. Tracy

Romano, has been at the forefront of whale conservation for more than 30 years. Mystic

Aquarium is the only facility in the United

States that cares for beluga whales that holds a
research license. It speaks to the
organization's history as a research facility
first and foremost.

When not in the field, our team of researchers works in state-of-the-art laboratories at the University of Connecticut's Avery Point campus. Mystic Aquarium's application for a research permit to import five beluga whales, born in human care at MarineLand Canada is a critical piece of our efforts to inform policy and action for wild populations of belugas and other species. This research must take place at Mystic Aquarium and not at MarineLand in order to further the non-invasive data collection methods we have pioneered. risk is the potential viability of samples collected offsite and transported. Timing and other factors can prevent the samples from making it to their destination, thereby damaging the very data needed to validate the research.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

The five whales proposed for import were all born under human care, as you've heard before earlier today, and will thrive in Mystic's Arctic Coast habitat, the largest outdoor whale habitat in the United States. The Mystic habitat is designed and extensively equipped and certified for beluga research. It is a hub for beluga scientists and conservationists providing unique accessibility to study belugas in ways not possible in wild settings.

Mystic's ethical approach is the absolute best solution for individual animals that will otherwise live in a crowded pool or hypothetically be released in the future to a sea sanctuary that not only does not yet exist, but is unproven and risky.

At Mystic, the whales will benefit immediately and help advance knowledge for survival of the species and other cetaceans that are threatened or endangered. Mystic Aquarium's application for a research permit to import these five whales should be approved for the sake of

the individual animals involved and for the health of the species now and in the future. Thank you.

MS. SLOAN: I'd like to invite Steve
Coan from Mystic Aquarium to come speak.

MR. COAN: Thank you. I want to share with you a letter from -- a joint letter from Senator Richard Blumenthal of Connecticut and Senator Christopher Murphy of Connecticut in support of Mystic Aquarium's application.

There are three points, two points
that I want to stress that are made by the
Senators. One is that this proposal to import
beluga whales is good for the animals. So it
does address the welfare of the individual
animals involved. And secondly, it significantly
advances conservation research for belugas and
cetaceans.

This is addressed to Mr. Chris Oliver, the Assistant Administrator for Fisheries and I will read in part the letter in part, two paragraphs. We support importation of these

whales consistent with current law from the overcrowded MarineLand facility to be housed at Mystic Aquarium for the duration of the permit. Mystic Aquarium is a clear leader in beluga care and research whose findings directly benefit endangered populations such as those in Cook Inlet, Alaska, and the St. Lawrence estuary in Quebec. We believe the movement of these animals to Mystic Aquarium will assist in advancing the published research and management priorities for belugas.

Administration, NOAA's recovery plan for the Cook Inlet beluga whale identifies several knowledge gaps in our understanding of beluga biology that impede recovery and conservation. Mystic Aquarium is assisting with filling in those gaps by studying the belugas in their care for responses to environmental stress, developing and validating non-invasive methods to assess health, responses to anthropogenic sound, diving physiology, micro biome regulation and

disruption, reproductive behavior, and the feasibility of deploying cameras and telemetry devices on whales. The addition of these five animals will provide a larger sample size for the aquarium's scientists undertaking these eight crucial investigations.

Mystic Aquarium has a long track record of excellence in beluga research and care. The program operates in close collaboration with the University of Connecticut and other aquaria and is accredited by American Humane and the Association of Zoos and Aquariums. The beluga habitat at the aquarium was designed and recently improved for research and the animal husbandry staff train animals at Mystic Aquarium to voluntarily participate in non-invasive research. The belugas for which the aquarium is applying for a permit are all captive born, non-releasable animals living in overcrowded conditions at MarineLand.

There is slightly more to the letter.

The letter has been entered into the record and

signed by Richard Blumenthal, United States
Senator, and Christopher Murphy, United States
Senator. Thank you.

MS. SLOAN: The next speaker will be Tom Mosey of Mystic Aquarium.

MR. MOSEY: Thank you very much. My name is Tom Mosey. I'm the CEO and President of Mini Melts, Inc., an ice cream company, and I also own a commercial real estate company in Dallas, Texas.

I've been a member of the Mystic
Aquarium Board of Trustees for ten years. I'm
currently the Vice Chairman. The reason I became
involved with Mystic Aquarium was because what it
provided to my family, my two young children at
the time, to see what I've seen as an avid scuba
diver for the last 30 years diving all over the
world. And as we've heard testimony today, over
800,000 people have had that ability to really
come first hand to our incredible ocean planet.

I'm very proud to be part of this organization and I've seen firsthand the world-

class care that the animals at Mystic Aquarium are provided and the deep, unwavering commitment at every level to the local and global action for the protection of the ocean and its inhabitants.

I've traveled extensively throughout the world in my work and related to scuba diving and I've seen firsthand for myself the deterioration in our environment. A few years ago, I climbed Kilimanjaro, the glaciers that once covered pretty much covered the whole summit is practically gone. My family has traveled to the Antarctic and we saw firsthand the incredible melting that's going on there. The Arctic is thawing faster than ever before. And habitat loss for Arctic species is real and it's happening now.

Mystic Aquarium is the leader in the field of marine mammal research and conservation.

Our team is led by Chief Scientist Dr. Tracy

Romano, has been at the forefront of whale

conservation for more than 30 years. Mystic

Aquarium is the only aquarium, as we've already

heard a few times, in the United States to hold a research license. It speaks to the organization's history as a research facility first and foremost.

Mystic Aquarium's application for research permit to import five captive-born beluga whales from MarineLand Canada is a critical piece of our effort to inform policy and action for wild populations of belugas and other species of whales including the Northern right whale.

The five whales proposed for import were all born under human care at MarineLand Canada and will thrive in Mystic's Arctic Coast habitat, the largest outdoor whale habitat in the United States as we've heard. The Mystic habitat is designed and extensively equipped and certified for beluga research. It is a hub for beluga scientists and conservationists providing unique accessibility to study belugas in a way not possible in wild settings.

Mystic's ethical approach is the

absolute best solution for the individual animals that will otherwise live in crowded pools as we've heard or hypothetically released to sea sanctuaries that don't exist at the present.

Mystic's application for a research permit to these five whales should be approved for the sake of the individual animals in question and for the health of the species now and in the future. Thank you very much for your time.

MS. SLOAN: The next speaker will be Dan Ashe from the Association of Zoos and Aquariums.

MR. ASHE: Good afternoon. I am Dan Ashe, the President and CEO of the Association of Zoos and Aquariums and AZA supports Mystic's application to import these five beluga whales all of which have been born in human care and are currently living at MarineLand Park in Ontario, Canada.

AZA is a nonprofit membership organization. Membership status requires that an

aquarium or zoo meet our rigorous accreditation standards, the gold standard world wide for a zoological institution.

Mystic Aquarium is not simply a member of AZA, but it's a leader amongst the AZA community.

Prior to joining AZA in January of 2017, I had a 22-year career at the United States Fish and Wildlife Service, the last 6 serving as the Senate-confirmed Director of the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service. So I have a good sense of the decision that you're being asked to make in considering this application and I'm confident that this application is in the interest of the individual animals and the conservation and management of belugas in nature.

In my view, the application warrants approval for three principal reasons all of which you've heard today. It will facilitate bona fide and relevant scientific research furthering the understanding and conservation of beluga whales. It will improve the welfare and care of these

individual animals and it will engage and inspire the public to conserve beluga whales and other cetaceans.

Scientific research is the crux of the decision before you. We need to better understand these animals and it's expensive and difficult to study them in nature. Ex situ study plays an essential role in filling gaps and ensuring that in situ research is better focused, more effective, and safer for the animals being studied.

Mystic Aquarium and the Sea Research
Foundation have a core team of five full-time
scientists studying beluga whales within a larger
world renowned marine science research program.
The research is conducted to a state-of-the-art
facility at the University of Connecticut Avery
Point by these scientists holding faculty
appointments with proven publications, records,
and dedicated to non-invasive beluga research.

The importation will facilitate unique accessibility to study belugas in ways that are

not possible or practicable in wild settings.

Approval of this importation will improve the care and welfare of these five beluga whales.

They'll be moved from a well-managed, yet unaccredited facility, to an AZA accredited and exceptionally designed habitat. And they'll receive individual care and enrichment. Moving these animals will also reduce crowding at MarineLand further benefitting the remaining animals.

other cetaceans requires two things: greater understanding of their biology and ecology which has been discussed here, and a public that's informed, engaged, empathetic, and inspired to action. Mystic Aquarium has proven capacities to couple powerful scientific research with inspiring, impactful, public outreach and education. By approving this permit request you'll make a positive difference. Thank you.

MS. SLOAN: The next speaker will be Courtney Vail from OPS.

MS. VAIL: Good afternoon. The modern aquarium community including Mystic has done much to respond to imperiled marine life including serving on the front lines of strandings, entanglements, and rescues. The value of research to these endeavors is not in dispute. The justification behind this permit is indeed research for a depleted and endangered populations of beluga whales while, of course, benefitting from the public display of those whales as well.

Mystic knows the importance of collecting data that understands and serves wild beluga populations. This is commendable.

However, there's a fundamental issue that is lost to the conversation I think all too often, to the protection and sustainability of beluga populations in the wild. That doesn't require additional physiological or behavioral data and that is the on-going acquisition from the wild to public display. Belugas have been targeted for decades for the global aquarium trade including

those wild-caught parents of the captive-born whales proposed for import and is a primary threat to this depleted population.

Russia exploited at least 237 beluga whales between 1990 and 2010 and it is this global market that resulted in the most recent combined capture of at least 100 orcas and belugas in the 2018 capture season. Of the belugas that did survive that capture, most were believed to have been returned over the last several months, but only after public pressure on the Russian Government, made it an imperative to do so.

Unfortunately, despite those releases, we understand that there is a capture ship waiting in bay to potentially descend upon that population again, the very same population that is the progeny of which are the subject of imports.

So this isn't just a Russia or a China problem, nor are the impacts of this permit isolated to North America. As long as Russian

belugas are moving around the globe, capture operators have a strong motivation to continue their operation, so this is all of our problem. Whether for research or public display, any trade in cetaceans does increase the demand for and encourages the capture of these species from the wild. I don't think that's really in dispute. Even with decades of breeding experience and relative success, the global-caught populations are not self-sustaining. This is not a hypothetical argument to suggest that this kind of action may result in additional takes from the wild.

As a collective community concerned with welfare and sustainability of cetaceans, we can no longer ignore the localized and intense pressure that continues to be exerted upon wild populations that are targeted for capture because the demand is global. Addressing this threat doesn't require additional scientific research, but it does require Mystic, the public display community, and NMFS to broaden their

perspectives, examine the trade links, and think more globally.

In closing, the international trade in belugas and other cetaceans is relevant to this permit application whether it's apparent or not. I think many of us are seeking real action for depleted populations, not just for data collection and research that may not ever be directly applied where it counts. I wonder if the relative silence from the public display and aquarium community in regards to these ongoing and unsustainable captures is a reflection perhaps of a deep-seated concern that the supply chain will ultimately dry up if these captures are confronted. But from my perspective an aquarium's commitment to not source from the wild should be standing enough to confront the bad actors in the room, in this case, the bad actors in the international public display community.

If we are justifying all research and trade activities as necessary for conservation, then aquaria participating in trade are even more

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

obligated to keep up to addressing unsustainable, irresponsible, and often inhumane acquisition of belugas and other cetaceans from the wild. For your consideration, thank you.

MS. SLOAN: The next speaker is Dale Wolbrink from Mystic Aquarium.

MS. WOLBRINK: My name is Dale
Wolbrink and I am here to urge you to approve the
Sea Research Foundation's permit to import five
beluga whales born in human care.

This testimony, whether in support or opposition, has one common theme, the well being of beluga whales today and into the future.

There is also consensus that research work outlined in the permit is important to species conservation, while conservation is a key is the point at which opinions diverge.

There is concern about this permit creating a precedent. For more than 40 years, scientific research has been the core of Sea Research Foundation's mission and Mystic Aquarium, the only beluga care facility in the

United States to hold a research permit. Research Foundation's Mystic Aquarium meets a credible benchmark. The principal investigator on this permit is Chief Scientist Dr. Tracy She is the founder of the of the field of marine mammal neuro-immunology and is the leader in the field of marine mammal health. She is respected by scientists, indigenous communities, wildlife managers, and policy Her record is cited by both colleagues makers. and opposition. Dr. Romano's co-PIs are respected, up and coming conservation researchers that are also having a strong impact on cetacean studies today and will continue to do so for many years to come. This sets the bar very high.

Animal care at Mystic Aquarium is second to none. A staff of four veterinarians and animal care teams that specialize in beluga whales provide regular, preventative health care, focus on enrichment, and ensure integrated behavioral choice for every animal at Mystic Aquarium. This meets and exceeds care

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

expectations.

This permit should set a precedent.

Let other applications be evaluated on the merits

of which has been submitted by Sea Research

Foundation's Mystic Aquarium.

While today's discussion is not about the value of zoos and aquariums, the value is meaningful to this discussion. The approval of the permits would result in what is termed incidental display. This does not diminish the fact that the research outlined in the permit is essential to hope to realize advancement and contribution research. Most importantly, Mystic Aquarium does not take this lightly. Every day, animal care professionals openly engage with students and families from the habitat to demonstrate animal care and the meaningful work that is being done in order to educate, inform, and inspire.

Some would argue that learning about places we haven't been can be done through photography or video, that it's a viable

replacement for an in-person education in conservation. In her paper, Learning to Care about Animal Conservation, Dr. Susan Crayton, a Whitmore Williams Professor of Psychology and a Ph.D. in Social Psychology from Yale University, cites the psychological research that shows that vivid and emotional experiences not only attract more attention, they are also better remembered. The multi-sensory, unstructured nature of the encounter provides experiences that a video cannot. People remember when the animals do something unexpected.

In addition to sights and sounds, even smells add to the multi-sensory richness of the experience. Dr. Crayton's studies are a powerful example of extensive research in this area. Her study goes on to say after all information is available in classrooms and on the internet, what's used can distinctively provide a direct experience of non-human animals. Such experiences have physiologically important characteristics. They are vivid and emotionally

rich and they are typically shared with others.

Her research concludes that by saying that youth can foster a culture of conservation, in fact, youth tend to show more environmental concerns and care than the average person. Zoos can help to prevent the disappearance of wild animals from our state and from our lives. Isn't that the goal of everyone in this room here today?

Again, I urge you to approve the research permit application. Thank you.

MS. SLOAN: The next speaker will be Grey Stafford, Ph.D. from Grand Canyon U.

MR. STAFFORD: Thank you for this opportunity to speak with you this afternoon. As was said, my name is Grey Stafford and I've been an animal trainer, zoo manager, and researcher for the past 30 years. Also as it was said I'm at Grand Canyon University on the faculty these days and I'm a past president of the International Marine Animal Trainers Association.

During my tenure on the Board of that

organization, I was thrilled to be able to be a part in the funding for the vaquita CPR project which, as many of you know, brought marine animal husbandry and veterinarian expertise and equipment to Mexico in very short order. It was a bold and an emergency attempt to help preserve the few remaining vaquita on the planet.

Also, as most of you know, ultimately that heroic effort was tragically stymied by our collective lack of basic knowledge in the social, ecological, behavioral, and physiological needs of this unique cetacean. Today, there are fewer than a dozen vaquita left.

So why talk about the zoo community's effort to save a small porpoise at a hearing to import beluga whales from Canada? The answer is simple. We might have changed the fate of that critically-endangered species had we had the same level of knowledge and experience the world seems to take for granted today about more commonly displaced species like bottlenose dolphins and killer whales. Important life history

information that is due to the passion and research done by professionals that regulated and accredited and certified marine mammal facilities like Mystic Aquarium.

Now the good news is unlike the vaquita, belugas still have some time, time for us to conduct the science necessary to understand what's happening to their polar habitat and what effect all this may have on their species' long-term survival. The cumulative impact of climate change as has been described today, beluga physiology and behavior must be vigorously investigated before the situation becomes a crisis as it did so quickly with the vaquita.

Already, countries are chomping at the bit to open up more sea lanes and natural resource extractions as thick sea ice disappears. These and other harmful effects on beluga ecology will require an improved ability to monitor and assess wild populations as has been stated.

Ongoing necessary research, as well as the development of new methods and technologies that

must be validated, would not be possible without
the participation of positive reinforcement
training of cetaceans and the financial and human
resources that support them.

As for the vaquita, we can only speculate what might have been had the scientific and zoological communities had the courage and political support to intervene 20 or even 10 years ago when its population numbered in the hundreds or more. Sadly, the story for the vaquita today is a cautionary tale for everyone in this room and everyone concerned about this issue.

Which of the river dolphins or porpoises or other vulnerable cetaceans will we do to extinction next simply because we lack basic science about the behavior, ecology, and biology in a rapidly-changing world?

Now I get it. As a biologist, I know we have an annoying tendency to speak and make dispassionate decisions about species' needs and priorities at the population level. But it is

just as important for this Agency to consider the individual welfare of these five animals. Reality is quite clear on this point. Other than their at-capacity home, recent political changes mean there are no facilities in Canada to take the animals. As such, NOAA has the question to answer, not if, but where will these animals be sent eventually? Where best to ensure their future welfare? And given the situation in Canada would we all not be more satisfied they come here to this country to live out their days in one of the world class beluga facilities, where they would always be under the welfare standards and oversight enforcement of NOAA Fisheries and USDA APHIS. Thank you.

MS. SLOAN: I'd like to invite William Kelleher from Mystic Aquarium.

MR. KELLEHER: I'm here to support the conservation of marine mammals. The proposed permit will advance this conservation mission. I support the issuance of the permit. The proposal has been developed from the starting point of the

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

requirements of the Marine Mammal Protection Act.

It also implements the visions of the law.

enacted to reverse the dangers of depletion and extinction to remedy an adequate knowledge of ecology and factors affecting breeding. It promotes international arrangements for research and conservation. It recognizes the significance of whales and other species for their aesthetic, recreational, as well as economic values. It defines conservation and management as the collection and use of biological information to increase and maintain species and their populations. This means the law promotes all activities in modern, scientific programs such as research.

The research proposed in this permit is what the law defines as bona fide research, work that results in lively publications in a scientific journal and that is likely to contribute to the basic knowledge of marine mammal biology and that is likely to identify,

evaluate, or resolve conservation problems.

Mystic Aquarium is uniquely qualified to have developed this proposal and to carry it out. It is the only certified research facility in the United States. Mystic Aquarium is a center for global research in beluga whales with a core team of five full-time scientists studying belugas within a larger well renowned marine science research program. It operates state-of-the-art laboratories dedicated to beluga research and our scientists all hold faculty appointments with the University of Connecticut.

Its education programs operate all around the world and particularly within North American Native communities. The substance of the work proposed will expand the knowledge of the health of wild whales exposed to pollutants and other stressors, hearing, and potential effects of sound on wild populations, accurate measures of body condition and reproductive status of wild beluga populations, diving ability, and interference with this key behavior

that degrades the health of wild populations;
bacterial infections and other diseases adversely
impacting beluga populations, optimal conditions
for reproduction in the wild, devices for
measuring wild belugas remotely without
disturbance.

The benefits of these advances are relevant to the active risks already faced in wild populations such as in the Cook Inlet,
Alaska, the St. Lawrence estuary, and other depleted stock.

I urge NOAA to issue this permit for consistency with the Marine Mammal Protection Act, the benefits it will produce and to advance the international beluga conservation efforts starting with MarineLand Canada. MarineLand in Canada are embarking on a new era of conservation to marine mammal conservation. MarineLand is turning its success in captive breeding belugas for display into research and education missions under the guidance of an accredited animal care committee.

Canada has recently passed a new law that establishes conservation research as a basic requirement for future human care marine mammals.

MS. SLOAN: The next speaker will be Naomi Rose from Animal Welfare Institute.

MS. ROSE: Thank you for the opportunity to speak today. I'm Dr. Naomi Rose, marine mammal scientist with the Animal Welfare Institute.

AWI firmly opposes this proposed import of five belugas from Canada to Mystic Aquarium. We recognize the need for scientific research on belugas and other marine mammals as anthropogenic activities and impacts on the environment threaten their survival. We also recognize the quality of the research program at Mystic Aquarium. We do not argue that the applicant's research proposals overall are not bona fide. However, the laws in both Canada and the United States do not allow for this importation as others have explained.

The solution to this dilemma, the need

to conduct research on belugas versus not misusing research exemptions in the laws on both sides of the border is clear. The applicant's eight research proposals describe work that can be done MarineLand, eliminating the need for an import. In our opinion, this is the ideal outcome for the whales and the law.

Mystic Aquarium should invest the time, money, and staff effort needed to establish conditions at MarineLand to allow the research to be conducted there and to otherwise improve the well being of MarineLand's large beluga population.

We understand that there would be difficulties related to conducting some of the projects at MarineLand. But from what we read in the permit application, none of these difficulties pose insurmountable obstacles. It is not, in fact, infeasible to conduct the work at MarineLand. It's simply inconvenient to greater or lesser degrees which falls well short of the legal standard for allowing an import of a

depleted marine mammal for scientific research, let alone for research with incidental public display and breeding.

And if the research is done at MarineLand, the sample size would be far larger and would not only allow the research result to approach statistical significance, but to reach it.

Additionally, the conditions for the belugas at MarineLand which are infinitesimally subpar at the moment due to overcrowding, lack of shade, and to some extent husbandry practices, could be brought up to Mystic standards. The enclosures at MarineLand are similar in size to and are in fact deeper than Mystic's enclosures. They're simply too many animals in them.

However, now that breeding is banned in Canada for cetaceans, crowding will be less of a problem over time. The lack of shade can be easily corrected and husbandry practices can be improved.

Mystic makes several arguments in this

application to justify not pursuing the research at MarineLand. The only one that seems remotely valid in my point of view is the lack of certain infrastructure such as a specific type of freezer for maintaining samples. This seems easily rectified with an investment of funds.

The argument that the facility is privately owned and ownership could be transferred in my opinion is weak.

The concern about transferring samples in a timely way to the laboratory in Connecticut is speculative. Given that MarineLand has never provided samples under the previous owner means the logistics of transporting samples between the two facilities has never really been tested and it seems likely that as samples begin, regular movement for MarineLand to the Mystic Aquarium laboratory, the process would be expedited due to its routine nature.

Some of the obstacles preventing research in the past at MarineLand no longer exist, as they were largely a result of the

actions and positions of the previous owner. The current owners appear more receptive to collaboration and outside input. Certainly, the majority of the whales at MarineLand are available to training for research sampling and protocol as they do not perform and often have little interaction with trainers. So this is another reason why conducting the work at MarineLand would improve the welfare of whales there.

We believe that this is the first time anyone has attempted to import marine mammals with depleted populations or their progeny for research and given that it has never happened before, an obvious question is what happens to these whales or their progeny once research projects, as described, are completed? We have concerns that these animals may find themselves distributed into the U.S. population of captive belugas being held solely for public display somewhere and this would be unacceptable under the MMPA.

So it makes sense to us that you should bring the researchers to 50 plus belugas than to bring 5 whales to the researchers. And frankly, we believe that that is what the law requires.

Once again, I'd just like to emphasize

AWI is not opposing this research. We are simply

pointing out that it can be done in MarineLand.

Thank you.

MS. SLOAN: Next, I would like to invite Marc Himmelstein from NES.

MR. HIMMELSTEIN: Thank you and thank you to NOAA for holding this hearing. I think it's fairly important.

My name is Marc Himmelstein. And I'm one of those very lucky people who had parents who took me and my two brothers to zoos and aquaria when we were young. And as a result, I had a chance to become familiar with animals which kind of being a lawyer doesn't mix necessarily. But as I grew up, I became interested in belugas and started looking at what

was going on with the population and I found that Mystic was one of those rare places in the world that really cared about their care and was interested in their scientific research.

To me, the petition which I support is about five whales. What can we do for those five whales and then extending that out? How can that benefit the world population of belugas? I think it's clear that what Mystic has proposed to do will enhance those five whales and the future of belugas in the future. Thank you.

MS. SLOAN: Next is Jason Reese, Board of Trustees, Mystic Aquarium.

MR. REESE: Good afternoon. My name is Jason Reese, Board of Trustees, Mystic Aquarium. You know, I know from my work running a number of congressional offices that when we were faced with a decision similar to what we're here considering today that we would always have the temptation to either try to make everybody happy or absent finding some sort of compromise simply reaffirm the status quo and move on and

say no.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

I think you've heard today many of the numerous reasons why you should not give into that temptation in this case.

In that work, I also witnessed the beginnings of relatively troubling trends where numerous environmental groups are taking increasingly extreme stands in opposition to nearly everything on the premise that supporting any reasonable cause could give life to unreasonable ones. And in fact, in this case Mystic has heard from behind the scenes from many of the groups in opposition to it that they recognize the bona fide nature of the research, even the need to move from an inferior facility to a superior facility, and yet still they in public are not willing to offer their support in fear that it might give rise to less good actors with a precedent to do something like this in the future.

The application before you today represents over two years of specific work by

Mystic and its team to comply with every aspect of the law and regulations in this decision. But it also represents decades of work, becoming a leader in the beluga care and research world, and in fact, developing a reputation as the world's leader in beluga research as is evident from a number of the comments today around the convocation of international beluga research events and such.

In short, these are the good guys.

They care. Their application is bone fide

research, exactly what was envisioned under the

MMPA and in fact, if this application can't be

approved, I'm not sure I know which one can.

You know, I know the choice before you isn't an easy one that there is always the temptation to give into the volume of reflective response in opposition to a lot of things. But I would urge you to take this into account as you resist the temptation to reaffirm the status quo and simply say no.

In this case, most of the opposition

to Mystic in my opinion hasn't been about Mystic, what Mystic has done or hasn't done. Sadly, it's the same opposition you'd get if I were to make my personal application to study beluga whales in my back yard on occasional weekends. It doesn't really differentiate between good actors and bad actors, worthy aspirations, and sort of hair brained pipe dreams. And so the only way to get around that slippery slope argument is to -- is not to simply stick your head in the sand and say no to everything, but it's to use your discernment and your wisdom in looking over this application and using the regulations before you to make sure that it's appropriate.

And in saying yes, you don't just reaffirm the good work done by Mystic Aquarium and you don't just reaffirm the care that they have for the animals. But you also reaffirm the value of the MMPA regulations that you operate under. As well as you show everybody coming after us that if you put in the work, if you dot the i's and cross the t's, if you comply with

every aspect of the law, there is a process under which you can get to yes for the betterment of the species, for the betterment of research and human understanding, for the betterment of ocean health in the future, for the betterment of cetaceans and their good in the world. And I would urge you to take such a stance. Thank you.

MS. SLOAN: The next speaker I'd like to invite is Allison Tuttle from Mystic Aquarium.

MS. TUTTLE: Hello. My name is Dr.

Allison Tuttle and I'm the Senior Vice President

of Zoological Operations at Mystic Aquarium.

Research was a reason for opening the aquarium doors in 1973 and it is still a core pillar of our mission today, along with conservation and education. I've worked at Mystic Aquarium for 14 years.

While there may be philosophical differences on how it should be done, everyone at this hearing today can agree that it is critical to protect the future of our oceans and protect the future of cetaceans. The time to conduct

conservation research to protect Cook Inlet
belugas and other populations around the world is
now before their numbers dwindle dangerously
close to extinction as has occurred with the
vaquita.

Earlier this year, Mystic Aquarium convened over 100 of the greatest minds in beluga conservation with the goal of better informing conservation and management decisions of belugas. The recovery plan for Cook Inlet beluga whale has been in place since 2016 and identifies needed actions targeted at recovering the species.

Through seven non-invasive research projects, Mystic Aquarium's research permit addresses ten of these critical actions. And as evidenced by our desire to collaborate with indigenous people, scientists, wildlife managers, policy makers, and beyond, Mystic Aquarium's vision is not myopic.

Mystic Aquarium is a research

facility. We have a research license under USDA

and an Institutional Animal Care and Use

Committee which ensures our research is of the

utmost quality, is relevant, and non-invasive to our animals. With a team of leading research scientists, state-of-the-art habitat, and research laboratories, Mystic Aquarium is uniquely and ideally qualified to conduct this needed conservation research on belugas and this is work that would be difficult, if not impossible, to conduct in the wild.

A bona fide science addresses critical actions identified in the recovery plan and will provide information applicable to the biology and ecology of wild belugas.

Mystic Aquarium's outdoor habitat also provides the opportunity for the public to learn about research and conservation issues facing belugas in real time. There is no other place for this research to occur making incidental display necessary. This is similar to the current situation with the now rehabilitated Cook Inlet Beluga, Tyonek, currently held under a research permit on incidental public display at a facility in the U.S.

With the support of Georgia Aquarium, an organization with a track record of providing support for critically important conservation research on many species, the five aquarium belugas identified for travel to Mystic Aquarium that are currently living in a cohort of over 50 belugas will benefit from our world-renowned care while taking part in critically-needed research to protect their wild counterparts.

Mystic Aquarium will work with

MarineLand such that the belugas remaining there
will over time participate in some level of
research to benefit wild populations. But we
cannot simply stand by and wait during this
period of evolution.

Despite various ideological differences that will be expressed, this permit is about beluga conservation and that is truly a value that everyone can share. I strongly urge you to approve this permit. Thank you.

MS. SLOAN: The next speaker I'd like to invite up is Dr. Scott Willens, a member of

the public.

MR. WILLENS: Good afternoon. This testimony is to supplement the written testimony previously submitted. I do have to give the disclaimer that as an active duty Lieutenant Colonel in the Army these are not the opinions of the Army or the Department of Defense or of the U.S. Government and has to be fact-based testimony.

I'm a veterinarian of 23 years with a board certification in the American College of Veterinary Preventive Medicine which focuses quite a bit on environmental medicine and public health. I also have a Ph.D. in pharmacology. I have known Dr. Tuttle for 20 years and Dr. Romano for about 25 years and like the two of them and Drs. Richard, Thompson, and Flower, Mystic has played a pivotal role in my professional development as I served as a veterinary intern in aquatic animal medicine and research from 1998 to 1999.

My career and success in veterinary

sciences and environmental medicine can be traced directly back to my roots there where I worked closely with beluga whales at the time of the construction of the facility. Both stateside and abroad, I have seen firsthand the need for critical conservation research and I am here to urge you approve the Mystic Aquarium's permit of the importation of five beluga whales born in human care to a significantly less crowded facility where animals are permitted to engage in all normal behaviors including breeding. conservation is the purpose and intent of the proposal. It has been designed and will be held accountable under the most powerful conservation laws in the country and the Marine Mammal Protection Act,

The research highlighted in the permit will be fulfilled by one of the most reputable research facilities in the field. In fact, the mission of Mystic, as we have heard today, is focused on research along with conservation and education of all ages.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

For over 40 years, Mystic has put scientific research at the core and forefront of There are only a few institutions its mission. that engage in the study of marine mammal immune systems and Mystic Aquarium is a leader among Mystic is the only beluga care facility in them. the United States that holds a research permit as you've heard, and the scientists at Mystic have published hundreds of peer-reviewed papers and book chapters and articles. These studies have been cited by scientific colleagues, wildlife managers, policy makers, and government agencies alike.

The animal care at Mystic Aquarium is exceptional as evidenced by USDA inspections with no deficiencies and accreditation by the organizations of American Humane, the Association of Zoos and Aquariums, and the Alliance of Marine Mammal Parks and Aquariums. The habitat was designed for belugas to provide a spacious and naturalistic environment in which belugas can engage in natural behaviors and where they

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

receive optimal professional care.

The research and development that is being done at Mystic will allow us a fighting chance of reversing a devastating trend of cetacean population declines. The beluga whale, due to its size and temperament, is one of the few species of cetaceans that makes possible close study in controlled settings to produce new knowledge helpful for conserving wild whales.

Further, the knowledge of the overall health of each individual beluga, its health, behavior, morphometrics, diet, water quality, et cetera, allows researchers to ensure results are accurate, useful, and transferrable to endangered populations. Having the belugas in a controlled setting further validates the research performed. The studies are advancing knowledge of immune responses, health indicators, hearing and sound, diving physiology and more, contributing to at least ten of the actions listed as needed in the recovery plan for the endangered Cook Inlet beluga whale released in 2016. By increasing the

sample size of the whales in this controlled and optimal environment, Mystic Aquarium can bolster statistical significance and findings. All these factors are vital to the advancement of conservation efforts.

I once again urge you to approve

Mystic Aquarium's permit application. Thank you.

MS. SLOAN: And I would like to say thank you for your service.

The next speaker is Jen Flower from Mystic Aquarium.

MS. FLOWER: Good afternoon. My name is Dr. Jen Flower and I'm the Chief Clinical Veterinarian at Mystic Aquarium. I have a doctorate in Veterinary Medicine, a Master of Science in Conservation Medicine, and I am board certified by the American College of Zoological Medicine. I have dedicated my career to the medical care, health, and welfare of aquatic species including beluga whales.

At Mystic Aquarium, we are dedicated and passionate about the care we provide to our

animals. Our personal commitment to and enthusiasm for the highest legal and professional standards of animal care are recognized by the USDA, the Association of Zoos and Aquariums, the International Marine Animal Trainers Association, the Alliance of Marine Mammal Parks and Aquariums, and American Humane.

Animal welfare is amongst our guiding principles at Mystic Aquarium. We are actively engaged in daily preventative medical for all of our resident animals from our smallest amphibians and fish, the endangered African penguin and green sea turtles, to the largest marine mammals including star sea lions and beluga whales.

Mystic Aquarium has a strong program of preventative medicine that ensures all animals including belugas are healthy and thriving. The aquarium employs a large team of knowledgeable trainers to provide for the daily husbandry care of the belugas and a team of four skilled and experienced veterinarians who respond to any medical concern immediately 24 hours a day, 365

days a year.

Mystic Aquarium has a state-of-the-art veterinary hospital as well as portable diagnostic equipment that can be brought to the habitat for animal side diagnostics to ensure immediate and accurate results that allow for the highest quality of medical care.

Our daily care includes integrated behavioral choice for every animal at Mystic Aquarium. Beluga whales actively engage in their own health care. They behaviorally provide blood samples, voluntarily lay out for veterinarians to perform ultrasounds, endoscopies, and radiographs and allow a collection of respiratory test samples, all accomplished by positive reinforcement training.

They swim freely in the largest outdoor habitat in the United States and they interact at will with the other beluga whales that call Mystic Aquarium home.

Currently, we do not have a formal breeding program for beluga whales, nor do we

plan on having one in the future. In fact,
outside of our participation in the species
survival plan for the endangered African penguin,
we do not have any formal breeding programs at
Mystic Aquarium.

To ensure optimal animal health and ensure the validity of the scientific work being done by beluga conservation researchers, we will continue to offer behavioral choice to all the animals under our care.

Mystic Aquarium is home to the world's leading marine mammal scientists, animal behaviorists, and veterinarians who provide continuous and compassionate care for belugas.

As proposed in this permit application, a larger grouping of belugas in the Mystic habitat is vital to advancing scientific knowledge on key variables essential to the survival of this species.

In addition, this research is crucial for informing international marine mammal protection policies. Advancing conservation

research is essential to prevent ongoing declines in endangered beluga populations and I am confident that there is no better place for this critical research than Mystic Aquarium.

The animal care is not just a profession. It is our passion, our inspiration, and our priority. As professionals who have dedicated our lives to caring for animals, we strongly urge the approval of this permit application to ensure that all species and specifically beluga whales remain in our ocean planet for many years to come. Thank you.

MS. SLOAN: I'd like to invite Kaitlyn
Mitchell from Animal Justice.

MS. MITCHELL: Good afternoon. Thank you very much for the opportunity to be here today. My name is Caitlyn Mitchell and I am a lawyer from Canada with the organization Animal Justice. Animal Justice is Canada's only national nonprofit animal law organization.

So as you've heard today a number of times, Canada recently passed a new law, that is

bill S-203, the Ending the Captivity of Whales and Dolphins Act. And that act or the bill I should say made very important changes to the criminal code, as well as the Fisheries Act aimed at phasing out the keeping of cetaceans in captivity in Canada. It did that by preventing facilities from acquiring new cetaceans and also by prohibiting breeding of cetaceans in captivity.

The relevant parliamentary and senate committees heard from scientific experts regarding the serious physical and psychological harm caused by keeping cetaceans in captivity as well as in particular the trauma that can be caused to them from transporting them one facility to another facility.

They also heard from tens of thousands of Canadians in support of the new law.

And by way of the example of the new law's popularity, it garners that significant public support that at one point it looked like the bill was actually going to die in the Senate

and so many Canadians wrote in in support of the new law that the Senate email server actually crashed for a time.

So the government was clear about its support for the new law and why it chose to support the new law and that was the fundamental need to respect biological and social needs of whales, dolphins, and porpoises and that means protecting them from forced captivity and also from breeding in captivity and performances for human entertainment.

In terms of specifics, bill S-203

amended the Fisheries Act to make it illegal to
capture wild cetaceans and put them into
captivity and it also amended the criminal code
making it an offense to own or keep a cetacean in
captivity, to breed cetaceans in captivity, and
also to have in your possession any reproductive
materials of cetaceans.

It also amended the criminal code to make it an offense to arrange, receive money for or participate in events at which cetaceans are

made to perform for human entertainment.

Now MarineLand and Vancouver Aquarium are, of course, allowed to keep the whales and dolphins that they have currently in captivity.

And I should say there are 62 cetaceans currently in captivity in Canada, 61 of those are housed at MarineLand which is, of course, the facility from which these 5 belugas would be transported.

Of particular importance for discussion today, bill S-203 was also intended to clamp down on the international trade of live It does that by prohibiting any cetaceans. imports or exports without a permit from the Minister of Fisheries and Oceans and those normally would be issued when it's for scientific research or in the best interest of the cetaceans. Now, of course, that standard has yet to be tested in some ways because this is a very new law. What we do know is that when the minister recently approved the escorted two whales to Spain, he said explicitly the part of the reason that he decided it was in their best

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

interest is because the facility was not going to allow those whales to breed.

MarineLand has not yet applied for the escort permit necessary in Canada. However, when contacted by members of the public concerned about the potential to export these five belugas, Jonathan Wilkinson, who is the previous Fisheries minister, as an aside we find out who the new ministers are in two days in Canada. We just had an election. But anyway, Mr. Wilkinson said basically that in the consideration of an escort permit, any proposal that would involve allowing belugas to be on public display and in particular to allow those cetaceans to breed would not be assessed favorably.

So there is good reason to believe based on his comments and the new law that if and when MarineLand does apply for the permit necessary to escort these whales they may not be approved. Thank you.

MS. SLOAN: So the next speaker is Sylvain De Guise from the University of

Connecticut.

MR. DE GUISE: Good afternoon. My
name is Sylvain De Guise. I'm a Professor of
Pathobiology and Veterinary Science at the
University of Connecticut and I serve as Director
of the Connecticut Sea Grant.

I've been doing research on marine mammals for over 30 years. Following veterinary school, I started my research career working on pathology and toxicology of beluga whales in the St. Lawrence River and pursued a Ph.D. in immunotoxicology.

As far as this effort, I worked in collaboration with Mystic Aquarium to test new devices to safely capture belugas in the St.

Lawrence. That's 25 years ago. After a post-doc at UC-Davis to deepen my understanding of marine mammal immunology, I took a position at the University of Connecticut, was appointed adjunct researcher at Mystic Aquarium. I now serve on the Mystic Aquarium Research Advisory Council.

I'm here today to testify in favor of

the proposed permit to receive five beluga whales for research and conservation purposes. As a responsible scientist, I do not take lightly my testimony here today. Fundamental and applied research is essential for species conservation, especially those species that live remotely, are difficult to access and observe, and those that are threatened or endangered populations. This is the case for belugas.

The research team at Mystic Aquarium, led by Dr. Tracy Romano, has been at the forefront of conservation, research in marine mammals and has made significant progress over the last few years towards a transition from fundamental to applied research using non-invasive sampling to assess healthcare matters in belugas that would be applicable to wild populations. The addition of five new belugas would increase the sample size to work with, add statistical power and scientific validity while allowing for better understanding of interindividual differences. In short, it would allow

for better science and accelerated progress towards important conservation issues.

In addition to building their first class research group, Mystic Aquarium has and continues to be a strong collaborator and My research group has benefitted from convener. collaboration with Mystic Aquarium for over 25 years ranging from testing new methods and devices to sharing samples and collaborative field and lab research. The Mystic Aquarium research group is well integrated with the academic community with laboratories at the nearby University of Connecticut Avery Point campus and collaborative projects such as NSF funded initiatives to support summer undergraduate research for students.

Mystic Aquarium recently convened an important international beluga symposium.

Overall, while I believe that all aquariums in the U.S. claim federal research responsibility,

Mystic Aquarium is a credible and strong leader in the field.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

While the primary purpose of the permit to accept new belugas is conservation research, those animals will be displayed for the public to see. This is important for the public. How often do members of the public see belugas in their environment and at the same time are fortunate to learn firsthand what their challenges are?

Conservation research is essential to understand and to address concern about stressors that affect some marine mammal populations.

Conservation research is essential if we want to support Cook Inlet recovery plan, if we want to understand the decline of St. Lawrence beluga population, if we want to ensure that no beluga population becomes extinct.

As a scientific community, we must encourage and support Mystic Aquarium's researchers for the development of non-invasive techniques. The work that we do in conservation research is key to ensuring that future generations of marine mammals in general and

belugas in particular, have the optimum environment.

As a scientist, professor, one who tracks with new generation of scientists, decision makers, and informed citizens, and as someone who passionately cares about marine mammals and their future, I urge you to approve the proposed permit for Mystic Aquarium to receive five belugas for research and conservation purposes. Thank you.

MS. SLOAN: The next speaker will be Tracy Romano of Mystic Aquarium.

MS. ROMANO: Good afternoon, everyone.

I am Dr. Tracy Romano, Chief Scientist at Mystic

Aquarium and the principal investigator on this

permit.

This permit is critical for three major reasons. One, to ensure that our research, our conservation research continues; two, that it's expedited; and three, that we increase the scientific rigor of our studies.

I have been studying whales and

dolphins for approximately 30 years and have had the privilege of studying them under human care, as well as in the wild. From my experience, there are questions that you just can't answer from studying wild animals alone.

I have also had the privilege to conduct research in the Arctic since I was a graduate student. I have witnessed through the years, and even more so over the last five years, the many rapid changes in this part of the world. There are major issues being posed to the environment, belugas and other Arctic mammals, and the people that live there.

We are losing dolphins, whales, and porpoises at an alarming rate. We are currently witnessing the decline of the Cook Inlet beluga, the vanishing of the vaquita, and the rapid decline of the North Atlantic right whale.

Katie mentioned the recent report set out by the United Nations, up to one million plant and animal species are on the verge of extinction. We need to act now.

The research outlined in the permit application specifically contributes to research and education initiatives called for in the Cook Inlet beluga recovery plan with applications to other beluga populations that are on the decline. The research proposed on belugas can also be applied to other cetacean species.

A couple of examples of key research priorities include developing non-invasive techniques for assessing reproductive status, body condition, and health in wild animals.

Reproductive research, not to be confused with breeding research which is not the goal of this permit will allow us to learn about beluga reproduction which is really the key to recovery and sustainability of wild populations.

Moreover, the genetics of these whales in studying immune systems, for example, can have meaningful impact on particular populations that are difficult or impossible to study.

Mystic Aquarium is setting the bar for the quality of research to be conducted under

this research permit. Nothing less than the standards we set forth should be considered in the future. Some have said that there is no need to import. However, for the research to be effective, it simply must be carried out at Mystic Aquarium. The studies that frame the core of our research call for in-depth animal care and husbandry to ensure voluntary and non-invasive participation by the whales in a controlled environment. As such, ample space is needed for this training and research, something MarineLand simply cannot provide given the current overcrowded situation.

Further, many of the important tests in our research are time sensitive and that they need to be analyzed immediately after sample collection to ensure the integrity of the data. Prior experience has proven that the process of shipping internationally is not reliable and compromises sample integrity.

I, as a scientist and a citizen, feel an urgency to do all we can now. We must act

immediately to ensure the health and viability of belugas and other dolphin and whale species for generations to come.

Thank you to NOAA for this opportunity and thank you all for being here today.

MS. SLOAN: Our last speaker of the day, unless there's anyone else who came in late which I don't think there were, is Georgia

Hancock of Animal Welfare Institute.

MS. HANCOCK: Good afternoon. I am Georgia Hancock of the Animal Welfare Institute. On behalf of its members, supporters, and constituents, I would like to say that we are in full support of improving the living and welfare conditions of all of the animals at MarineLand. However, we do not believe the welfare of the whales to be imported or those left behind would be greatly improved by this transfer.

Additionally, there is a strong likelihood that the requirements of Canada's bill S-203 which is not on the floor are not satisfied by this permit application.

Bill S-203 allows for two derogations from the ban on the export of cetaceans from Canada including for the keeping the cetacean in captivity as it is in the best interest of the cetacean's welfare to do so.

While we fully recognize the overcrowded conditions that exist at MarineLand, the
U.S. and Canadian Government should consider this
factor in combination with others including the
overcrowding that will occur if five belugas are
imported to Mystic Aquarium and potentially
Georgia Aquarium.

I understand there are approximately 54 belugas at MarineLand that are currently divided into three main areas. While animal welfare advocates have been pointing out that MarineLand is overcrowded for years, it's only since S-203 passed that Canadian officials have also admitted that this is the case.

Mystic's main beluga enclosure, while larger than any of the largest tanks at MarineLand, would be very full, arguably, over

full if eight belugas were held there. It makes little sense to put MarineLand's belugas through the trauma and stress of transport, an acclimation to a new environment and social groups when the space provided would be at best only somewhat better than at MarineLand and that's before any calves are born.

From a welfare standpoint, the pluses of being moved don't outweigh the minuses which is not consistent with moving them in their best interest. At Georgia Aquarium, the beluga complex is entirely indoors whereas MarineLand is outdoors in a climate that is cool to cold for much of the year. A lack of shade is a problem at MarineLand, but one that would be easy to rectify. But lack of natural light and fresh air at Georgia Aquarium cannot be rectified and it's a significant step down for any whales moved there from a northern climate outdoor facility.

According to media quotes from Georgia

Aquarium officials, the tank there is already at

capacity with five belugas. Dennis Christen,

Senior Director of Zoological Operations, stated quote. A fivesome largest this beluga crew will go at Georgia Aquarium. It's a number that seems to be quite comfortable. End quote.

Adding any more belugas to Georgia
Aquarium would therefore by the facility's own
reckoning result in overcrowding. Additionally,
given Georgia Aquarium's efforts to import 18
wild caught belugas from Russia starting years
ago, an effort that ended in a 2016 court ruling
upholding NMFS' decision to deny the permit
application we find this proposed import for
scientific research entirely suspect.

Three of the whales proposed for import would be quote unquote all inside Georgia Aquarium and the application states that they may be transferred there under vaguely described circumstances. It's difficult not to see this application as a back door to requiring additional belugas for the North American Beluga Breeding Cooperative.

We do not think any potential

1	improvement in welfare or quality of life
2	justifies this import. Thank you.
3	MS. SLOAN: So we're at time. I want
4	to thank everybody for coming to the hearing and
5	for those who are traveling I wish you safe
6	travels home. If you have any follow-up
7	questions, I have a card up there. You can email
8	me and for those traveling locally I wish you
9	safe travels as well. Thank you very much. This
10	concludes our public hearing.
11	(Whereupon, the above-entitled matter
12	went off the record at 3:06 p.m.)
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	

A
ability 12:14 15:15 16:7
17:4 28:20 31:9 46:15
60:19 77:19 81:22
<b>able</b> 4:16 21:15 36:3
43:2 47:18 76:1 above-entitled 122:11
abroad 98:5
absent 89:21
absolute 56:12 63:1
academic 112:12
accelerated 112:1
accept 113:2
access 17:15 24:19
46:1 47:11 111:7
accessibility 12:19 17:1 56:9 62:20 65:22
acclimation 120:4
accomplished 52:3
103:15
account 91:19
accountable 98:14
accreditation 64:1
99:16
accredited 24:22 59:11
66:5 77:3 82:21
accurate 81:19 100:14 103:6
achieve 6:3
acquiring 106:7
acquisition 67:20 71:2
act 7:8,9,11 13:6 26:13
26:13 49:9 80:1,3
82:14 98:16 106:2,2,4
107:13 115:22 117:22
action 21:17 28:21
54:16 55:13 61:3 62:9 66:16 69:12 70:6
actions 87:1 04:12 15
<b>actions</b> 87:1 94:12,15 95:10 100:20
active 34:6 82:8 97:5
actively 102:9 103:10
activities 50:3 70:21
80:15 83:14
activity 15:14
actors 70:18,18 90:18 92:6,7
92:6,7 adaptation 15:9
adaptations 15:11
adaptive 47:5
add 74:14 111:19
Adding 121:5
addition 17:16 32:4
59:3 74:13 104:20
111:18 112:3
additional 29:2 49:15
53:6 67:19 69:12,20

Additionally 85:9 118:19 121:7 address 57:15 113:10 addressed 57:19 addresses 26:17 94:14 95:9 addressing 69:19 71:1 adequate 80:5 adhere 53:14 adjunct 110:19 Administration 58:13 Administrator 57:20 admits 52:7 admitted 119:19 admittedly 17:14 52:6 ado 8:17 adopted 19:1 adults 9:9 54:7 advance 56:18 79:20 82:14 advanced 27:13 advancement 27:22 73:12 101:4 advancements 23:18 advances 22:2 42:3 57:17 82:7 advancing 33:5 58:9 100:17 104:17,22 adversely 82:2 Advisory 110:21 advocates 119:16 aesthetic 80:9 affect 43:17 113:11 affiliation 25:6 33:9 **African** 102:12 104:3 **afternoon** 2:3 8:20 18:10 21:7 25:12 30:1 37:10 44:21 53:19 63:14 67:1 75:15 89:14 97:2 101:12 105:15 110:2 114:13 118:10 agencies 31:5 99:12 **Agency** 51:4,7,16 53:14 79:1 ages 98:22 ago 61:9 78:9 110:16 121:10 agree 93:20 aid 27:17 aim 12:4 aimed 26:5,18 29:9 106:4 air 120:16 alarming 115:15

**Alaska** 27:19 34:14,17 36:21 58:7 82:10

Alaskan 29:16

alike 9:9 99:13 **Alliance** 99:18 102:6 **Allison** 93:9,11 **allow** 18:2 19:10 31:12 51:1,4,7,16,19 83:20 84:10 85:6 100:3 103:6,14 109:2,14 111:22 116:14 allowed 2:21 9:15 35:6 108:3 allowing 84:22 109:12 111:21 **allows** 12:8 43:7 100:13 119:1 **amazing** 11:10 35:9,20 **ambassadors** 10:4 18:3 amended 107:13,15,20 America 68:22 American 29:16 37:9 37:12 38:2,9 40:14,19 59:11 81:15 97:11 99:17 101:17 102:7 121:20 **AMMPA** 40:6 41:2 amphibians 102:11 **ample** 117:10 Amur 49:18 50:16 **Amy** 1:12,16,20 2:7 analyses 17:3 analyze 43:2 analyzed 117:16 **animal** 9:1,10 10:20 11:11 21:11 38:4,16 42:9 43:16,18 44:16 45:8,14 47:14 59:14 72:16,18,21 73:15,17 74:3 75:17,21 76:3 82:21 83:5,8 94:21 97:20 99:14 102:3,5,8 103:5,9 104:6,12 105:5,14,18,19,20 115:21 117:7 118:9 118:11 119:15 animal's 42:22 43:2 45:9,11 animals 9:13 11:20 15:4 17:16 18:3 21:15 24:6,10,14,19 30:19 31:10 32:9 33:6,17 35:1 38:12 41:11,20 42:4 43:8,9,11,14,15 44:3,5,5,11 45:4,7,16 45:21 46:10,11,22 47:12,18 48:10,13,18 52:4 54:14 56:12 57:1 57:14,16 58:8 59:4,15 59:19 61:1 63:1,7 64:15 65:1,6,10 66:8

66:10 74:11.20 75:7 79:2,6,7 85:16 87:18 88:19 92:18 95:2 98:10 102:1,11,16 104:10 105:8 113:3 115:5 116:11 118:15 annoying 78:20 annually 29:1,12 answer 10:7 76:16 79:7 115:4 Antarctic 61:12 anthropogenic 34:6 58:21 83:14 anti- 24:6 anyway 109:10 **APHIS** 79:15 apologize 25:5 apparent 70:5 appear 87:2 applicable 12:13 95:11 111:17 applicant's 83:18 84:3 **application** 1:3 2:5,15 2:17 4:17 5:2,17 6:22 7:13 13:10 19:10 24:15 30:4 37:14 49:1 53:16 55:10 56:21 57:10 62:5 63:5,17 64:13,14,17 70:5 75:11 84:17 86:1 90:21 91:11.13 92:4 92:13 101:7 104:15 105:10 116:2 118:22 121:12,16,19 applications 73:3 116:4 applied 42:1 70:9 109:3 111:4,15 116:7 apply 21:16 50:7 109:18 applying 59:17 appointed 110:19 appointments 65:19 81:11 appreciate 28:14 approach 56:11 62:22 85:7 approaches 17:7 appropriate 92:14 **approval** 12:8 13:5,19 25:4 64:18 66:2 73:8 105:9 **approve** 13:9 17:18 18:2 37:3 40:15 71:8 75:10 96:20 98:7 101:6 114:7 approved 56:22 63:6 91:14 108:20 109:20

121:20

approving 44:17 66:19

Association 59:12 15:3.20 21:13 30:16 **bold** 76:6 approximately 115:1 **boldly** 26:13 63:12,15 75:21 99:17 31:16 45:11 46:17 119:13 **bolster** 101:2 59:1 77:12 78:17 aquaria 24:1 59:10 102:4,5 at-capacity 79:4 81:22 100:12 **bona** 64:19 80:18 83:19 70:22 88:18 aquarium's 14:5 16:17 ate 42:9 **behavioral** 5:21 31:11 90:14 95:9 Atlantic 115:18 17:22 19:20 30:3 35:8 67:19 72:21 76:11 **bone** 91:11 103:9 104:9 Bonnet 23:6 37:13 53:21 55:9 Atmospheric 58:12 56:20 57:10 59:5 62:5 attempt 76:6 behaviorally 103:11 book 99:10 70:16 94:14,18 95:13 attempted 87:12 behaviorists 104:13 border 84:3 98:7 101:7 113:18 attendance 3:11 behaviors 9:18 16:10 **born** 5:6 23:13 44:12 attended 39:16 98:11 99:22 48:18 52:9,11 55:11 121:8 attention 20:20 74:8 believe 58:8 87:11 88:4 56:2 59:18 62:13 **aquariums** 11:19 21:19 109:16 112:19 118:16 63:18 71:10 98:8 21:22 24:19 25:1 28:9 attract 74:7 auditors 38:14 believed 68:10 120:7 33:3 36:13 37:12 38:5 38:12 59:12 63:13,16 authority 51:1 believes 40:19 borne 47:14 authorize 51:7 belugas' 40:20 bottlenose 22:12 76:21 73:7 99:18,19 102:4,7 authorized 40:6 51:19 benchmark 72:3 **bottom** 6:14 112:19 aquatic 26:6 97:20 authorizes 51:3 benefit 22:3 56:17 58:5 boundaries 19:21 101:19 availability 34:18 89:8 96:7,13 **boy** 12:19 **Arctic** 11:2 15:18 16:15 **available** 4:10 34:19 benefits 82:7,14 **Boyle** 37:9,10,11 74:18 87:5 benefitted 112:6 **brain** 43:1 26:22 30:13 35:12 36:1,8,9,13 56:4 average 10:6 75:5 **benefitting** 66:9 67:10 brained 92:8 Avery 55:9 65:17 61:13,15 62:14 115:7 benign 47:5 breath 42:17,21 115:12 112:13 best 37:19 44:15 46:15 breed 107:17 109:2,14 breeding 6:1 19:2,9,18 area 22:10 27:8 74:16 avid 60:16 56:12 63:1 79:8 20:3 69:8 80:6 82:19 areas 119:15 aware 18:22 27:3 108:16,22 119:4 arguably 119:22 awareness 10:18 22:10 120:5,10 85:3,17 98:11 103:22 104:4 106:8 107:10 argue 73:20 83:17 24:3 better 11:4 13:2 36:10 48:21,22 65:5,9 74:8 116:13 121:21 argument 69:11 86:7 AWI 83:10 88:7 94:8 105:3 111:21 **brief** 2:11 92:9 **AZA** 63:16,21 64:5,5,7 bring 13:19 22:9 24:2 arguments 85:22 112:1 120:6 **betterment** 93:2,3,4,5 88:2.3 **Army** 97:6,7 В **beyond** 94:18 **bringing** 11:19 39:18 arrange 107:21 **brings** 43:18 back 4:4 19:17 22:21,21 **big** 44:9 arrangements 80:7 broaden 69:22 **bill** 106:1,2,22 107:12 articles 99:10 92:5 98:2 121:19 108:10 118:20 119:1 broadening 12:10 **Ashe** 63:12,14,15 bacterial 82:2 biodiversity 22:19 brothers 88:17 **aside** 109:8 bad 70:17,18 92:6 brought 76:3 85:13 26:10,11 **asked** 64:12 **bags** 10:13 **biological** 35:17 42:19 103:4 aspect 48:11 91:1 93:1 **ban** 119:2 Bryde's 22:17 aspects 45:14 **banned** 85:17 80:12 107:7 biologist 1:15,18,19,20 building 112:3 aspiration 14:7 bar 72:15 116:21 burden 50:6 53:12 based 19:15 23:21 26:2 14:7 78:19 aspirations 92:7 **biologists** 13:22 43:8 asserts 52:17,21 109:17 assess 42:13 58:20 baseline 43:4 biology 24:13 30:6 39:1 basic 41:19 76:10 78:17 45:15 58:15 66:13 Caitlyn 105:17 77:20 111:16 80:21 83:2 78:18 80:22 95:11 calf 11:7 **assessed** 38:14 109:15 **biome** 58:22 caliber 20:2 **assessing** 16:6 116:10 basically 109:11 call 8:7 9:13 103:20 bit 77:16 97:13 assessment 26:9 38:17 bay 19:15 49:18,18 **blood** 19:18 42:15 117:7 42:12 50:16.16 68:16 103:11 called 116:3 assessments 43:6 beautiful 43:22 blow 35:18 **calves** 120:7 asset 17:9,11 becoming 91:3 **Blumenthal** 57:8 60:1 cameras 6:2 59:2 beginning 10:13 **assist** 58:9 **Assistant** 8:21 30:4 beginnings 90:6 **board** 18:12 60:12 campaigns 21:21 75:22 89:12,15 97:11 campus 55:9 112:14 begins 26:4 57:20 assisting 11:6 32:12 behalf 18:16 21:14 101:16 **Canada** 5:5,7 18:20 **boats** 15:19 39:20 55:12 62:7,14 118:12 58:17 **body** 43:13 44:8 81:20 63:20 76:16 79:5,10 associated 23:5 **behaving** 46:11,22 behavior 10:20 11:1 116:11 82:16,17 83:1,11,19 Associates 1:17

85:18 105:18.22 106:6 108:6 109:4,9 119:3 **Canada's** 105:19 118:20 Canadian 18:22 19:8,22 39:21 119:8,18 Canadians 106:18 107:1 Canyon 75:13,19 capability 45:2 capacities 66:16 capacity 32:6 120:22 captive 19:18 53:7 59:18 82:19 87:19 **captive-born** 62:6 68:1 captivity 5:7 20:4 52:10 52:11 106:1,6,9,13 107:9,10,15,17,17 108:4,6 119:4 **capture** 68:7,8,9,15 69:1,6,18 107:14 110:15 captured 49:17,19 captures 70:12,14 card 3:7.8 122:7 cards 8:4 care 9:1,15 10:4 11:11 12:6 14:3 16:5 18:2 21:15 23:13 24:14 25:16 33:17 37:18 40:21 44:12 47:12.16 47:17,18 48:10,19 54:13 55:11 56:2 58:4 58:18 59:8 61:1 62:13 63:18 64:22 66:3,7 71:10,22 72:16,18,19 72:22 73:15,17 74:2 75:5 82:21 83:3 89:3 91:4,11 92:17 94:21 96:7 98:9 99:6,14 100:1 101:19,22 102:3,19 103:7,8,11 104:10,14 105:5 115:2 117:7 cared 23:12 89:3 career 10:22 14:10 45:18 64:8 97:22 101:18 110:9 careful 29:18 cares 55:2 114:6 Carey 8:18,21 caribou 34:22 **caring** 105:8 **Carre** 23:7 **CARRIE** 1:19 carried 117:5 carry 15:5 81:3

carrying 47:1 case 40:9 70:18 90:4,11 91:22 111:9 119:19 **caught** 121:9 cause 90:10 caused 106:13,15 cautionary 78:11 **cell** 4:12 **cells** 15:9 center 1:11 27:4 38:22 81:6 **CEO** 60:7 63:15 certain 86:3 certainly 48:20 87:3 certification 38:11,15 97:11 **certified** 37:12 38:10 56:7 62:18 77:3 81:4 101:17 cetacean 18:8,13 72:13 76:12 100:5 107:16 116:7 119:3 cetacean's 119:5 cetaceans 21:19 24:18 41:6,9,14 53:8 56:19 57:18 65:3 66:12 69:5 69:15 70:4 71:3 78:3 78:15 85:18 93:6.22 100:7 106:5,7,8,13 107:14,17,19,22 108:5.12.17 109:14 119:2 cetaceans' 41:16 cetera 100:13 **chain** 70:14 Chairman 60:13 challenge 46:14 **challenges** 16:14 113:8 challenging 46:18 **chance** 2:20 88:19 100:4 **change** 27:1 36:7 77:11 changed 76:17 **changes** 15:20 79:4 106:3 115:10 changing 15:14,16,17 39:11 chapters 99:10 characteristics 74:22 check 3:22 Chief 1:16 2:8 54:20 61:19 72:4 101:13 114:14 **child** 33:3 childhood 54:3

**children** 9:9 12:16,16

39:9 54:7 60:15

China 68:20

**choice** 72:21 91:15 103:9 104:9 chomping 77:15 **chose** 37:18 107:5 **Chris** 57:19 **Christen** 120:22 Christopher 57:9 60:2 circumstances 121:18 cited 72:10 99:11 **cites** 74:6 citizen 29:4 117:21 **citizens** 114:5 **Civic 1:11** claim 112:20 **claims** 21:21 **clamp** 108:11 class 14:3 61:1 79:12 112:4 classrooms 74:18 **Clean** 48:11 clear 16:13 41:8 50:13 50:22 51:10 53:15 58:4 79:3 84:3 89:9 107:4 climate 26:12 27:1 36:7 77:10 120:13,19 climbed 61:9 **Clinical** 101:13 close 6:20 31:19 36:2 42:3 59:9 94:4 100:8 **closely** 9:4 98:3 closely-controlled 47:15 closing 70:3 **co-PI** 13:18 co-PIs 72:11 coalition 49:8 **Coan** 57:5,6 Coast 56:4 62:14 **code** 106:4 107:15,20 cognition 41:17 cohort 96:6 **cold** 30:15 120:13 collaborate 23:10 32:19 94:16 collaborates 52:7 collaboration 36:14 40:17 52:20 59:9 87:3 110:14 112:7 collaborations 36:2 collaborative 112:9,14 collaborator 112:5 collaborators 46:5 colleagues 28:18 72:10 99:11 collect 16:7 17:2 24:18

collected 43:12 55:19 collecting 42:19 67:13 collection 42:21 55:17 70:8 80:12 103:14 117:17 **collective** 69:14 76:10 college 32:10 97:11 101:17 Colonel 97:6 combination 119:9 combine 35:6 combined 23:15 68:7 come 8:8 13:15 37:5 57:5 60:20 72:15 79:11 105:12 118:3 comes 47:11 comfortable 40:20 121:4 coming 2:4 72:12 92:20 122:4 commendable 67:14 comment 6:20 7:4 **COMMENTER** 7:18,20 **comments** 3:1,13 4:17 4:20 6:11,12,19 7:1,7 7:21,22 49:7 91:7 109:17 commercial 60:9 **commitment** 14:5 48:1 54:15 61:2 70:16 102:1 committed 40:11 **committee** 82:22 94:22 committees 106:11 **common** 71:12 commonly 76:20 communities 29:10 72:9 78:7 81:15 community 28:2 34:15 37:2,16 49:22 64:6 67:2 69:14.22 70:11 70:19 112:12 113:17 community's 76:14 company 60:8,9 compassion 33:16 compassionate 104:14 **compelling** 38:20 40:2 complete 14:16 completed 87:17 completely 24:9 **complex** 120:12 comply 91:1 92:22 component 17:11 37:6 components 42:15 compromise 89:21 compromises 117:20 concentration 44:8 concepts 47:8

35:17 45:9

collect--how 35:16

concern 28:12 48:9 49:21 70:13 71:18 86:10 102:22 113:10 concerned 18:18 20:10 69:14 78:12 109:5 concerns 15:2 50:1 75:5 87:18 concludes 75:2 122:10 condition 43:13 44:8 81:20 116:11 **conditions** 15:11 20:16 43:11 47:9,15 52:2 59:19 82:3 84:10 85:9 118:15 119:7 conducive 24:20 conduct 5:9 31:13 35:12 36:4 48:15 77:7 84:1,19 93:22 95:5,8 115:7 conducted 16:12 38:21 41:6,18 65:16 84:11 116:22 conducting 84:15 87:8 confer 8:13 conference 27:10 confidence 17:18 confident 64:13 105:3 configuration 19:5 confounding 52:14 confront 70:17 confronted 70:15 **confused** 116:12 Congress 50:12 51:11 51:14,19 53:15 congressional 89:17 connected 48:20 Connecticut 14:18 18:12,15 19:16 54:2 57:8,9 59:10 65:17 81:12 86:11 110:1,5,6 110:19 112:13 Connecticut's 55:8 consensus 71:14 consequences 16:3 17:20 conservation 1:15,16 1:18,19,20,21 2:8 9:16 11:13 12:7,10 13:20,22 14:11 15:2 17:10,12,21 18:14 21:17 24:2 25:17 26:1 26:4 27:11,18 28:10 28:15,21 29:1,3,17 30:9 32:21 33:15 35:14 36:14,22 38:6 39:15 40:8 41:13 42:11 43:9 44:15 46:2 49:21 50:5 54:19,22

57:17 58:16 61:18.21 64:15,21 70:21 71:16 71:16 72:12 74:2,3 75:3 79:19,20 80:8,11 81:1 82:15,17,18 83:2 93:16 94:1,8,9 95:6 95:15 96:3,18 98:6,12 98:14,21 101:5,16 104:8,22 111:2,5,12 112:2 113:2,9,12,20 114:10,19 conservationist 39:17 conservationists 56:8 62:19 conservative 47:2 conserve 12:1 65:2 conserving 33:7 40:12 100:9 **consider** 79:1 119:8 consideration 7:6 13:11 29:19 71:4 109:11 considered 47:19 49:21 50:11 117:2 considering 64:13 89:19 **consistency** 42:6 82:13 consistent 58:1 120:10 constituents 118:13 construction 24:6 98:4 consultant 21:12 contact 3:12 contacted 109:5 **continue** 12:9,11 13:8 14:20 15:10 21:1 32:18 36:9,20 53:1 69:2 72:14 104:9 continues 36:13 69:17 112:5 114:19 continuous 104:14 **contribute** 5:11 33:11 36:21 80:21 contributes 116:2 contributing 34:7 100:19 contribution 17:8 73:13 controlled 42:6 48:15 100:8,15 101:1 117:9 convened 1:11 94:7 112:17 convener 112:6 conversation 67:16 convincing 40:16

**convocation** 91:8 **Cook** 11:8 27:19 30:10

115:16 116:3

58:6,13 82:9 94:1,10

95:19 100:21 113:13

**copy** 6:17 **core** 26:7 27:5 65:13 71:20 81:7 93:14 99:2 117:6 **corners** 45:20 corrected 85:20 cost-effective 31:21 Council 110:21 counterparts 96:9 Countless 28:10 **countries** 39:21 77:15 country 79:11 98:15 **counts** 70:9 couple 66:17 116:8 courage 78:7 course 45:17 47:6,10 67:9 108:3,7,17 court 4:7 51:10,14 121:10 courteous 4:13 **Courtney** 1:17 8:9 66:22 covered 61:10,10 **CPR** 76:2 **crashed** 107:3 Cravton 74:3 **Crayton's** 74:15 **cream** 60:8 create 19:17 32:6 36:17 creating 71:19 **credible** 26:5 72:3 112:21 crew 121:2 criminal 106:4 107:15 107:20 **crisis** 77:14 criteria 7:7,10 critical 17:10 22:2 26:18,21 28:9 31:2,17 32:2,4 38:5 46:1 55:12 62:8 93:20 94:15 95:9 98:6 105:4 114:17 critically 13:5 47:6 50:8 96:3 critically-endangered 76:18 critically-needed 96:8 **Crittercam** 45:1,3,5 47:3 Crittercam's 46:19 cross 92:22 crowded 56:13 63:2 98:9 117:13 119:7 **crowding** 66:8 85:18 crucial 34:5 41:10 59:6

cool 120:13

Cooperative 121:21

104:20 crux 65:4 **CSI's** 19:14 Cubina 25:7,10,10,11 25:12,13 cultivate 28:6 cultural 26:3 29:15 35:5 35:22 37:7 culture 75:3 cumulative 77:10 Curator 8:21 current 31:14 54:9 58:1 87:2 95:19 117:12 **currently** 23:4 24:5 44:12 52:5,19 60:13 63:19 95:20 96:6 103:21 108:4,5 115:15 119:14

D daily 24:17 102:10,19 103:8 **Dale** 71:5,7 **Dallas** 60:10 damaging 55:21 **Dan** 63:12,14 dangerous 17:2 20:21 dangerously 94:3 dangers 80:4 data 24:18 30:7 31:3 34:1 42:8 43:7 45:6,8 50:1 55:17.22 67:13 67:19 70:7 117:17 **David** 19:14 day 9:6,8 10:4,17 12:5 32:7 35:4 36:18 37:1 42:8 73:14 102:22 118:7 days 75:20 79:11 103:1 109:9 **De** 109:22 110:2.3 **debate** 4:19 **debris** 29:7 decade 54:1 decades 67:22 69:8 91:3 December 6:21 **decided** 108:22 decision 2:16 7:3,12 17:18 64:12 65:5 89:18 91:2 114:5 121:11 decisions 78:21 94:9 declared 50:18 decline 113:14 115:16 115:18 116:5 declines 100:5 105:1

declining 27:20

dedicated 9:20 38:11 devastating 100:4 develop 5:10 9:18 17:7 65:20 81:10 101:18 101:21 105:8 30:7 31:6 dedicates 29:11 **developed** 5:18 14:22 dedication 14:4 16:18 45:6 47:4 79:22 81:3 deemed 6:7 **developing** 31:1 42:12 deep 54:14 61:2 42:21 43:1 45:2 58:19 91:5 116:9 deep-seated 70:13 development 14:13 deepen 110:17 26:12 27:2,16 77:22 deeper 85:15 deeply 18:18 32:22 97:19 100:2 113:19 devices 6:2 59:3 82:4 Deepwater 23:1 Defense 97:7 110:15 112:9 devoted 33:5 deficiencies 99:16 **defines** 80:11,18 diagnose 42:2 degrades 82:1 diagnostic 103:4 degrees 84:21 diagnostics 103:5 demand 53:7 69:5,19 die 106:22 demonstrate 73:17 diet 100:12 demonstrated 40:16 difference 9:13 51:15 **Dennis** 120:22 66:20 deny 20:14 53:15 differences 93:19 96:17 121:11 111:22 **department** 26:1 97:7 different 7:22 depend 34:21 differentiate 92:6 difficult 17:2 65:7 95:7 depends 34:15 **depleted** 5:8,14 40:13 111:7 116:20 121:18 49:14,18 50:4,6,9,14 difficulties 84:15.18 dilemma 83:22 50:17 51:2,5,8,17 52:16 53:9 67:8 68:3 diminish 73:10 70:7 82:11 85:1 87:13 direct 9:15 10:5 14:12 **depletion** 13:6 80:4 21:16 29:3 54:6 74:19 directly 16:9 20:15 22:2 deployed 45:7 47:21 23:22 27:17 42:11 deploying 59:2 deployment 47:5 58:5 70:9 98:2 director 7:12 21:8.13 **Deputy** 1:16 2:7 37:11,17 64:10 110:5 derogations 119:1 descend 68:16 121:1 **describe** 15:9 84:4 Directors 18:13 described 77:11 87:17 disappearance 75:6 121:17 disappears 77:17 disasters 22:22 design 47:20 discernment 92:12 designated 50:16 designed 47:2 56:6 disclaimer 97:5 discovered 41:17 59:13 62:17 66:6 98:13 99:20 discussed 49:6 66:14 **discussion** 4:18 47:7 **desire** 94:16 desperately 31:3 73:6,8 108:10 diseases 42:2 82:2 **despite** 68:14 96:16 destination 55:21 dispassionate 78:21 detail 49:6 displaced 76:21 detailed 5:16 display 6:6 19:2,7 20:8 detect 42:14 50:10,11,13,20 51:1,4 51:7,17,20,21 53:11 detectable 15:22 deterioration 26:11 67:10,21 69:4,21 70:10,19 73:10 82:20 61:8 determine 43:13 85:3 87:20 95:18,21 determined 15:21 109:13

displayed 113:3 disproportionately 26:22 dispute 67:6 69:7 disregarded 22:9 disruption 59:1 disseminate 24:1 distinctively 74:19 distributed 87:19 distribution 15:17 disturbance 82:6 dive 15:3,16 16:10 diver 60:17 diverge 71:17 diverse 39:2 divided 119:15 diving 5:21 15:10,13 27:15 41:21 58:21 60:17 61:6 81:21 100:19 **Division** 1:15,16,18,19 1:20,21 2:8,9 doctorate 101:15 document 46:16 documentation 7:11 doing 33:1,2 43:20 110:7 dollars 29:12 dolphin 23:5 118:2 **dolphins** 19:3 22:13 23:12,21 24:1 76:21 78:14 106:2 107:8 108:4 115:1.14 door 19:17,22 121:19 doors 93:14 dot 92:21 double 3:22 doubt 33:1 41:8,11 **dozen** 76:13 **Dr** 13:16 14:22 21:8 30:2 32:15 35:13 36:16 37:8,10 41:5 44:22 54:20 61:19 72:4,11 74:3,15 83:7 93:10 96:22 97:15,15 101:13 111:11 114:14 **dreams** 92:8 drones 42:20 43:12 **Drs** 97:17 **dry** 70:14 due 34:6 49:22 77:1 85:11 86:18 100:6 duration 58:3 **duty** 97:5 dwindle 94:3

early 2:21 earth 13:2 easily 85:20 86:5 easy 91:16 120:15 echolocation 41:20 ecological 76:11 ecology 39:1 45:11 66:13 77:18 78:17 80:6 95:12 economic 80:10 ecosystem 37:6 ecosystems 11:20 26:6 **editor** 19:15 educate 28:5 73:18 educating 38:6 education 12:7 13:21 14:4 17:22 25:17,22 29:2 66:19 74:1 81:13 82:20 93:16 98:22 116:3 **educational** 14:12 29:8 29:15 32:13 54:6 educator 33:11 **educators** 14:1 28:6 **effect** 77:9 **effective** 48:14 65:10 117:5 effectively 44:4 46:3 48.2 effects 36:11 77:18 81:19 efficiency 47:13 effort 30:7 32:22 62:8 76:9,15 84:9 110:13 121:10 efforts 9:20,22 13:8 17:13 34:8 41:13 42:11 46:2 55:12 82:15 101:5 121:8 eight 5:15 59:5 84:4 120:1 either 34:19 89:20 election 109:10 electronically 6:20 eliminate 31:6 eliminating 84:5 elucidate 31:16 email 107:2 122:7 embarking 82:17 emergency 76:6 emotional 74:7 emotionally 74:22 empathetic 66:15 emphasize 88:6 employed 47:1 54:1 **employs** 102:18 enabling 32:4 enacted 80:4

earlier 56:3 94:6

enacting 50:12 enclosure 119:20 **enclosures** 85:14,15 encounter 74:10 encourage 17:21 20:15 37:3 113:18 encourages 69:6 endangered 5:14 11:8 12:13 22:16 27:18 30:10 40:13 56:20 58:6 67:8 100:14,21 102:12 104:3 105:2 111:8 endeavors 67:6 ended 121:10 endoscopies 103:13 enforcement 79:14 **engage** 9:7 65:1 73:15 98:10 99:4,22 103:10 engaged 23:17 48:14 66:15 102:10 **engages** 28:22 engaging 28:10 39:7 England 26:3 **enhance** 89:10 enhancement 51:6 enhancing 26:5 enrichment 66:7 72:20 **ensure** 9:22 12:14 13:6 13:20 36:4 37:4 46:14 46:21 72:20 79:8 100:13 103:5 104:6.7 105:10 113:15 114:18 117:8,17 118:1 **ensures** 94:22 102:16 ensuring 65:9 113:21 entanglements 67:5 **entered** 9:12 59:22 entertainment 107:11 108:1 enthusiasm 102:2 entirely 120:12 121:13 environment 15:14 24:20 46:12 61:8 83:15 99:21 101:2 113:6 114:2 115:12 117:10 120:4 environmental 7:11 28:6 45:8 58:19 75:4 90:7 97:13 98:1 environments 16:22 30:13 envisioned 91:12 **equipment** 47:20 76:5 103:4 **equipped** 56:6 62:17 era 82:17 **escort** 109:4,11,19

escorted 108:20 **especially** 9:10 20:10 30:10 111:6 **essential** 19:12 65:8 73:12 104:18 105:1 111:5 113:9.12 establish 20:17 84:9 establishes 83:2 **estate** 60:9 estuary 27:20 58:7 82:10 et 100:12 ethical 56:11 62:22 evaluate 81:1 evaluated 73:3 evaluating 47:13 events 29:7 91:9 107:22 eventually 79:8 **everybody** 3:4,6,18 13:12 89:20 92:20 122:4 evidence 40:2 evidenced 26:8 27:8 94:15 99:15 evident 39:13 48:10 91:6 evolution 96:15 ex 23:15 65:7 **exactly** 91:12 examine 70:1 **example** 12:22 15:15 22:4 30:21 74:16 106:19 116:18 examples 116:8 exceeds 72:22 **excellence** 39:1 59:8 excellent 40:21 exception 53:2 exceptional 33:17 99:15 exceptionally 66:6 exchange 29:15 35:22 excitement 9:8 Executive 37:17 **exemptions** 49:13 84:2 exerted 69:17 exhibits 25:22 exist 56:15 63:4 86:22 119:7 **expand** 81:16 **expect** 28:14

expectations 73:1

**expedited** 86:18 114:20

experience 11:21 12:21

16:16 32:1,12 33:3,14

37:20 45:2 47:17 48:3

**expensive** 34:18 65:6

48:11 69:8 74:15.20 76:19 115:3 117:18 experienced 102:21 experiences 11:17 28:17 33:2 74:7,10,21 experiencing 23:4 **expert** 21:13 33:12 **expertise** 20:1 31:22 33:16,20 76:4 experts 31:20 44:2 47:19 106:11 explained 83:21 **explicitly** 51:3 108:21 exploited 68:4 export 19:3 109:6 119:2 **exports** 108:13 **exposed** 81:17 exposure 14:8 express 34:9 expressed 96:17 extended 42:4 extending 89:7 extensive 74:16 **extensively** 56:6 61:5 62:17 **extent** 85:12 External 53:22 **extinct** 113:16 **extinction** 26:16,20 66:11 78:16 80:5 94:4 115:22 extractions 77:17 extraordinary 16:19 38:7 extreme 90:8 **extremely** 32:16 34:17 46:18 extremist 21:20 24:7

F face 16:14 faced 82:8 89:18 facilitate 34:4 64:19 65:21 facilitates 45:13 facilities 20:2,7 31:21 41:9,18 42:11 48:7,12 52:6,18 77:3 79:5,12 86:15 98:19 106:7 facility 12:9 19:6 37:19 43:22 44:13 55:1,4 58:2 62:3 65:17 66:5 71:22 81:4 86:7 90:15 90:16 94:20 95:22 98:4,10 99:6 106:16 106:16 108:7 109:1 120:19 facility's 121:6

facing 95:15 fact 27:8 46:16,22 52:10 73:11 75:4 84:19 85:15 90:11 91:5,13 98:19 104:1 fact-based 97:8 factor 16:6 119:9 factors 11:5 34:6 45:14 55:20 80:6 101:4 faculty 65:18 75:19 81:11 failed 20:4 fails 52:1 failure 23:21 fairly 88:14 falls 84:21 familiar 11:22 22:7 40:7 88:19 families 34:20 73:16 family 10:11 34:14 60:15 61:11 far 85:5 110:13 fascinating 39:10 fast 2:13 faster 61:14 fate 76:17 **fathers** 49:19 favor 110:22 favorably 109:15 **FDMS** 3:15 fear 90:18 feasibility 59:2 feasible 52:18 feature 31:8 feces 42:17 **federal** 112:20 feel 19:5 117:21 Fellow 1:21 fewer 76:12 fide 64:19 80:18 83:19 90:14 91:11 95:9 field 16:16 17:7 23:19 40:9 47:20 54:19 55:6 61:18 72:5,7 98:19 112:10,22 fighting 100:3 Figuring 42:18 File 2:5 fill 3:7 12:9 17:6 filled 3:6 8:4 filling 58:17 65:8 final 4:1 7:12 50:15 financial 21:21 78:3 find 87:18 109:8 121:12 finding 89:21 findings 27:17 39:6 58:5 101:3

fine 3:4

guests 9:7 10:6.8 finish 3:21 Foundation 27:4,13 generate 30:7 guidance 32:17 82:21 35:8 48:3 65:13 generation 32:7 114:4 firmly 83:10 guiding 102:8 generations 13:21 33:8 **first** 8:7,19 9:11 14:14 Foundation's 25:14 14:15 15:8 31:4 38:2 **Guise** 109:22 110:2,3 27:21 71:9,21 72:2 37:4 113:22 118:3 38:10 48:16 52:3 55:5 genetically 52:12 Gulf 22:6,12,17 23:8,11 60:20 62:4 87:11 Foundations 29:11 **genetics** 116:17 н 112:3 founded 38:3 Geographic 45:18 founder 72:5 geographically 52:12 habitat 38:1 56:4,5,5 **firsthand** 10:17 54:13 60:22 61:7,12 98:5 four 3:20 8:17 72:17 Georgia 6:9 20:11,13 59:13 61:14 62:15,15 102:20 52:20 96:1 118:8.11 62:16 66:6 73:16 77:8 113:7 fish 34:22 64:9,10 119:12 120:11,17,20 95:3,13 99:19 103:5 four-year 23:2 103:18 104:16 **frame** 117:6 121:3,5,8,15 102:12 Fisheries 1:1 2:9 25:20 **frames** 45:15 gestation 41:21 hair 92:7 Hall 1:11 40:11,14 57:20 79:15 frankly 88:4 getting 25:6 106:4 107:13 108:14 free-ranging 45:3,7 giant 22:14 halt 26:10 46:10,10 **Gilhuly** 53:18,19,20 halted 13:7 109:7 five 3:18 5:4 8:16 13:19 free-swimming 43:14 give 2:11,13 3:18 4:1 hammerhead 22:13 freely 103:17 8:16 44:10 90:3,10,18 Hancock 118:9,10,11 17:16 18:20 37:22 44:11 55:10 56:1,22 freezer 86:4 91:17 97:4 hand 4:4 60:20 fresh 120:16 given 6:12 19:5 79:9 hands 48:22 59:3 62:6,12 63:6,17 freshwater 23:8 86:12 87:14 117:12 **HAPEMAN** 1:20 65:13 66:3 71:9 79:2 81:7 83:11 89:6,6,10 front 3:2 4:3 67:4 121:8 happened 87:14 96:4 98:8 109:6 111:1 frozen 34:19 glaciers 61:9 happening 36:8 40:10 111:18 114:9 115:9 fulfilled 98:18 glad 2:20 61:16 77:8 global 21:3 26:9 27:4 119:10 120:22 full 51:20 118:14 **happens** 87:15 fivesome 121:2 119:22 120:1 36:6 38:22 54:16 61:3 happy 49:1 89:21 floor 118:21 full-time 65:13 81:7 67:22 68:6 69:19 81:6 hard 6:17 33:15 36:17 harm 106:13 flow 43:1 fully 23:16 25:21 119:6 global-caught 69:9 harmful 77:18 Flower 97:17 101:10,12 function 15:4,6 43:3 globally 70:2 harshest 30:12 101:13 45:22 **globe** 69:1 focus 40:17 72:20 fundamental 46:9 **goal** 10:2 15:12 33:7,11 Hartford 18:15 67:15 107:6 111:4.15 75:8 94:8 116:13 head 92:10 focused 29:16 30:21 goals 26:12 funded 14:19 29:14 headquartered 18:15 38:3 40:1 65:9 98:21 health 5:9 6:8 15:3,13 focuses 24:12 31:14 35:9 112:15 **gold** 64:2 government 19:1 68:12 16:4.13.18 26:6 27:14 97:12 funding 76:2 **funds** 86:6 97:8 99:12 107:4 35:19 36:5 42:12 **follow-up** 122:6 funky 12:18 119:8 43:10,13 52:22 57:2 Following 110:8 further 8:17 55:16 66:9 graduate 14:15 115:8 58:20 63:8 72:7,19 **food** 34:18 35:2 **foods** 34:15,22 100:10,16 117:14 **Grand** 75:13,19 81:17 82:1 93:5 97:14 forced 107:9 furthering 64:20 **Grant** 1:21 110:6 100:11,11,18 101:19 **granted** 76:20 103:11 104:6 116:11 forefront 54:21 61:20 Furthermore 29:8 greater 50:7 66:12 99:2 111:12 future 13:20,21 17:9,12 118:1 healthcare 41:17 foremost 48:17 55:5 20:13 33:8 36:5 37:4 84:21 62:4 40:18 56:14 57:2 63:9 greatest 94:7 111:16 71:13 79:9 83:3 89:10 greatly 118:18 healthy 43:5 102:17 forge 18:4 89:11 90:20 93:5,21 green 102:13 hear 10:21 13:12 forgotten 22:8 formal 103:21 104:4 heard 56:2 60:18 62:1 93:22 104:1 113:21 Greg 44:20,22 62:16 63:3 64:19 90:2 format 6:17 114:7 117:3 grew 34:13 88:21 **Grey** 75:13,16 90:12 98:20 99:8 former 52:20 G group 20:19 34:3 112:4 105:21 106:11,17 formerly 37:16 hearing 2:4 4:8,15 5:19 forth 41:22 42:9 117:2 112:6,11 gain 30:18 fortunate 11:18 33:10 27:14 41:22 42:22 **grouping** 104:16 gained 32:11 41:12 groups 21:20 24:7 90:7 43:16 44:8 76:15 113:7 galley 46:8 90:13 120:5 81:18 88:13 93:20 forward 34:7 gallons 23:7 forward-thinking 40:15 100:18 122:4,10 **gaps** 17:6 58:15,17 grow 12:17 heightened 28:13 forwarding 40:3,17 **grown** 14:6 65:8 held 87:20 95:20 98:13 foster 75:3 garners 106:20 **growth** 31:18 found 13:3 89:1 **guess** 43:10 120:1 general 113:22

**Hello** 93:10 99:9 84:6.22 87:12 117:4 incredible 60:20 61:12 incredibly 10:1 47:12 121:8.12.15 122:2 help 9:20 12:12 18:4 hunting 34:21 40:6 independent 32:11 **importance** 37:5 67:12 24:11 36:10 52:16 hurricanes 22:22 56:18 75:6 76:6 38:14 husband 10:20 12:22 108:9 helped 9:18 husbandry 9:17 11:14 important 9:21 10:1 indicate 28:12 indicates 26:15 **helpful** 100:9 32:1 33:4,13 59:14 13:5 16:6 29:19 32:16 76:4 85:12,20 102:19 indicators 27:14 100:18 helping 17:6 41:10 36:9,12 45:10 46:12 71:15 74:21 76:22 indigenous 28:2 35:6 heritage 37:7 52:9 117:8 79:1 88:14 96:3 106:3 **heroic** 76:9 hybrid 52:12 36:3 72:8 94:16 **Hidden** 30:13 hypothetical 69:11 112:2,18 113:4 individual 31:9 42:4 117:14 44:16 56:12 57:1,15 high 17:22 29:9 72:15 hypothetically 56:14 **importantly** 40:19 48:8 63:1,7 64:15 65:1 high-quality 38:21 63:3 66:7 79:2 100:11 highest 102:2 103:7 48:13 73:13 importation 49:9,11 111:22 highlighted 98:17 highly 22:20 25:3 44:1 i's 92:22 50:9,18 57:22 65:21 individuals 16:3 22:18 66:2 83:21 98:8 29:3 49:14 50:9 Himmelstein 88:11,12 ice 30:14 60:8 77:17 imported 5:6 19:6,11 individuals' 42:8 88:15 ideal 84:6 historic 23:6 ideally 95:5 49:17 52:8 118:17 **indoors** 120:12 history 14:2 45:17 54:4 **ideas** 47:8 119:11 industrial 27:2 identical 53:1 **imports** 68:19 108:13 industry 21:10 55:4 62:3 76:22 infeasible 84:19 **imposed** 53:15 hit 22:21 identified 95:10 96:5 hold 36:15 38:18 52:19 identifies 58:14 94:11 **imposes** 49:10 infections 82:2 62:1 72:1 81:11 identify 23:20 80:22 impossible 31:13 95:8 inferior 90:15 holding 65:18 88:13 identity 35:3,5 37:7 116:20 infertility 24:17 impressed 48:6 holds 55:2 99:7 ideological 96:16 infinitesimally 85:10 influencing 40:5 45:14 Hollev 21:6.8 ianore 69:16 impressive 39:16 inform 5:12 9:21 28:5,7 home 9:14 22:12,15 illegal 107:13 **improve** 20:16 30:8 40:8 55:13 62:8 73:18 26:22 40:20 79:4 imaging 45:6 47:20 64:22 66:2 84:11 87:9 **information** 3:12 24:2 103:20 104:11 122:6 immediate 103:6 improved 59:14 77:19 28:15 41:19 42:1,19 honed 11:11 immediately 43:15 43:5 45:10 46:1 74:17 hope 30:18 37:1 40:7 56:18 102:22 117:16 85:21 118:18 77:1 80:12 95:11 44:17 49:2 73:12 improvement 122:1 **improving** 32:8 118:14 informed 13:8 66:15 hopeful 20:22 **immune** 15:4,5,9 27:13 114:5 in-depth 117:7 **hoping** 3:17 42:15 99:4 100:17 informing 40:4 94:8 Horizon 23:1 116:18 in-person 74:1 inaugural 38:13 104:21 hormones 42:14 44:9 **immuno-** 110:11 informs 41:12 42:11 hospital 103:3 incidental 6:6 50:11 immunological 5:18 infrastructure 17:1 hosted 27:9 29:14 54:5 immunology 110:18 51:2,5,8,18,20,21 **hosting** 39:13 impact 9:16 10:5,12,18 53:10 73:10 85:2 86:4 hours 102:22 26:2 53:5 72:13 77:10 95:17,21 infusing 39:8 incidentally 19:7 inhabitants 54:17 61:4 **house** 21:19 116:19 housed 58:2 108:6 impactful 66:18 include 5:17 29:5 116:9 inherent 52:13 **hub** 23:10 56:7 62:18 includes 41:19 42:1,14 inhumane 71:2 impacting 82:3 **HUBARD** 1:19 **impacts** 15:14 28:12 51:11 103:8 **initial** 49:16 including 5:13 9:5 11:1 initiatives 29:5,9 human 13:2 15:14 18:2 41:13 68:21 83:14 impede 17:19 58:16 11:4 21:11 22:22 112:15 116:3 23:13 24:14 44:12 Inlet 11:8 27:19 30:10 28:11 52:4 62:10 67:2 47:12 48:19,20 55:11 impediments 31:6 58:7,14 82:9 94:1,10 56:2 62:13 63:18 imperative 68:12 67:3,22 98:11 101:20 imperiled 67:3 102:14,17 119:3,9 95:20 100:21 113:13 71:10 78:3 83:3 93:4 115:16 116:4 98:9 107:11 108:1 implement 9:19 inconvenient 84:20 **input** 87:3 implementation 29:12 incorporated 35:3 115:2 inside 121:15 **humane** 37:9,11,13 increase 17:17 32:5 implements 80:2 38:2,3,9,9 40:14,19 **implications** 16:13 34:2 69:5 80:13 111:19 insight 30:18 114:20 insights 45:10,21 40:21 59:11 99:17 **import** 1:5 5:4 18:19 increased 36:8 inspections 99:15 102:7 19:2,17 20:7 50:8,13 increasing 53:6 100:22 inspiration 105:6 **humans** 21:16 53:4,8 55:10 56:1,21 increasingly 34:5 39:3 inspire 12:5 24:3 25:15 hundred 28:22 57:13 62:6,12 63:17 28:20 65:1 73:19 hundreds 39:8 78:10 68:2 71:9 76:16 83:11

killer 22:15 76:22 learning 33:18 73:20 inspired 14:8 33:15 114:15 investment 86:6 kinds 42:2 74:2 36:20 66:15 leave 13:2 knowledge 5:11 17:7,8 inspiring 66:18 invite 8:18 13:14 18:7 led 54:20 61:19 111:11 21:16 23:22 24:15 **Institute** 83:5,9 118:9 21:5 25:7 44:19 49:3 118:11 57:4 79:16 88:11 93:9 27:13 35:7 36:16 **left** 76:13 118:17 institution 64:3 96:22 105:13 41:12 56:18 58:14 legal 84:22 102:2 Institutional 94:21 **invites** 20:21 lesser 84:21 76:10,19 80:5,21 involve 5:22 109:12 81:16 100:9,10,17 letter 19:14 21:2 57:7,7 **institutions** 15:5 26:3 involved 57:1,16 60:14 104:17 57:21 59:21,22 38:13 99:3 instructions 7:1 involving 17:5 knowledgeable 102:18 **level** 54:15 61:3 76:19 **instrument** 45:6 47:14 **IPBES** 26:9 known 19:4 42:4 97:15 78:22 96:12 knows 67:12 license 38:19 55:3 62:2 irreconcilable 53:3 instruments 47:1 94:20 insufficiency 50:1 irresponsible 71:2 **Island** 29:22 30:5 Lieutenant 97:5 insurmountable 84:18 isolated 68:22 lab 15:8 112:10 life 33:5 45:17 54:10 integrate 25:22 issuance 7:7,9 79:21 laboratories 55:8 81:10 67:3 76:22 90:10 integrated 72:20 103:8 **issue** 67:15 78:13 82:12 95:4 112:12 122:1 112:11 **integrity** 117:17,20 issued 50:15 108:15 **laboratory** 17:3 23:14 lifetime 12:15 intelligent 12:18 **issues** 27:15 95:15 35:15 86:11,18 light 120:16 intend 32:18 112:2 115:11 lack 76:10 78:16 85:11 **lightly** 73:14 111:3 intended 51:14 108:10 85:19 86:3 120:14,16 likelihood 118:20 intense 40:17 69:16 lanes 77:16 likewise 50:17 **intent** 98:12 **Jaakkola** 41:2,4,5 language 51:11 limit 3:17 4:1 17:1,3 inter- 111:21 January 64:7 large 84:12 102:18 limited 17:15 34:18 lines 67:4 **interact** 103:19 Jason 89:12.15 largely 20:4 86:22 links 70:1 **interaction** 48:13 87:7 Jen 101:10.13 larger 27:6 34:3 37:19 lions 102:14 interest 10:15 48:14,17 Jennifer 1:15 8:9 59:4 65:14 81:8 85:5 listed 100:20 64:14 108:16 109:1 iob 28:7,8 104:15 119:21 literally 12:20 119:4 120:11 **Johnson** 49:4,5,5 largest 38:1 56:4 62:15 literature 39:6 interested 88:22 89:4 102:13 103:17 119:21 ioin 35:21 little 87:7 120:2 interests 15:1 ioinina 64:7 121:2 late 118:7 live 23:13 30:12 56:13 interference 81:22 ioint 14:16 57:7 intern 97:19 Jonathan 109:7 launched 38:9 63:2 79:11 108:11 111:6 115:13 Jordan 1:21 4:4 international 18:9.13 **Laura** 13:14,16 27:9 39:14 49:22 70:3 lively 80:19 **journal** 80:20 law 19:1 58:1 80:2,14 **Justice** 105:14,19,19 80:18 83:1 84:7 88:4 **lives** 9:11,13 11:18 70:19 75:21 80:7 82:15 91:8 102:5 justification 52:15 67:7 91:2 93:1 105:20,22 30:19 48:19 75:7 105:8 104:21 108:11 112:18 justifies 122:2 106:18 107:2,5,6 living 23:14 34:17 internationally 117:19 justify 86:1 108:19 109:17 internet 74:18 justifying 70:20 law's 106:20 44:13 59:19 63:19 96:6 118:14 **internship** 35:9 36:19 **Justin** 29:21 30:2 **Lawrence** 27:20 58:7 interpret 17:4 43:7 82:10 110:11,16 **local** 54:16 61:3 interrupt 15:11 localized 69:16 113:14 laws 19:22 21:3 83:19 intervene 78:8 **Kaitlyn** 105:13 locally 29:10 122:8 84:2 98:15 located 22:5 introduce 8:10 **Kaplan** 19:14 locations 16:20 lawyer 88:20 105:18 intrusive 47:4 Kate 18:7,11 lay 103:12 logging 45:6 Inuit 39:22 **Katie** 25:7,13 115:19 logistically 31:13 **Inupiaq** 34:13 Katrina 22:22 lead 12:22 keep 20:3 71:1 107:16 leader 15:7 36:6 38:16 logistics 2:14 42:18 Inupiat 36:1 86:14 invaluable 17:9 108:3 54:18 58:4 61:17 64:5 long 23:6 54:4 59:7 invasive 31:2 33:22 72:7 91:4,6 99:5 keeping 106:5,13 119:3 112:21 68:22 42:16 111:16 **Kelleher** 79:17,18 long-77:9 inventor 44:22 **Kelly** 41:2,3,5 leaders 39:22 leadership 27:7 40:3 long-term 37:20 **invest** 84:8 Kemp's 22:13 53:21 longer 69:16 86:21 investigate 15:10 **key** 16:6 27:22 31:8 leading 95:2 104:12 longitudinally 31:10 investigated 77:13 71:16 81:22 104:17 learn 12:21 35:18 95:14 look 34:7 48:18 investigations 59:6 113:21 116:8,15 113:7 116:14 looked 106:21 investigator 72:3 Kilimanjaro 61:9

looking 44:14 88:22 92:12 **looks** 3:19 **losing** 115:14 loss 26:10 61:15 lost 67:15 **lot** 91:18 love 12:1,1 lucky 88:16 lung 43:2

## M

magnanimous 12:18 main 119:15,20 maintain 15:13 36:14 36:17 80:13 maintaining 86:5 major 114:18 115:11 majority 41:15 87:4 makers 72:10 94:17 99:12 114:5 making 38:22 55:20 95:17 107:16 mammal 7:8,9 21:14 31:20 33:21 36:20 41:9,18 42:10 44:2 49:8 51:17 54:19 61:18 72:6,7 77:3 80:1,3,22 82:13,18 83:8 85:1 98:15 99:4 99:19 102:6 104:12 104:21 110:18 113:11 mammals 8:22 9:5 12:21 15:6 23:3 24:14 26:16 36:10 42:13 49:12 50:15 51:5,8 53:6 79:19 83:3,13 87:12 102:13 110:8 111:13 113:22 114:7 115:12 man-made 22:21 managed 48:12 management 5:12 17:12 28:7 30:8 32:9 34:2,6 46:2 58:10 64:16 80:11 94:9 manager 75:17 managers 28:3 72:9 94:17 99:12 managing 31:5 manta 22:15 Marc 88:11,15 March 27:9 marine 1:1 7:8,9 8:22 9:5 12:21 14:7 15:6 18:14 21:14 23:2 24:14 25:20 26:16

36:10,20 41:9,18 42:10 44:1 49:8,12 50:14 51:5,8,17 53:6 54:10,19 61:18 65:15 67:3 72:6,7 75:21 76:3 77:3 79:19 80:1 80:3,21 81:8 82:13,18 83:3,8,13 85:1 87:12 98:15 99:4,18 102:5,6 102:13 104:12,21 110:7,17 111:12 113:11,22 114:6

MarineLand 5:5,7 18:20 20:16 55:11,16 58:2 59:20 62:7,13 63:19 66:9 82:16,16,18 84:5 84:10,16,20 85:5,10 85:14 86:2,12,17,21 87:4,9 88:8 96:11 108:2,7 109:3,18 117:11 118:15 119:7 119:14,17,22 120:6 120:12.15

MarineLand's 20:7 84:12 120:2 market 68:6 marsh 29:5 Marshall 44:20,21,22 Maryland 1:12 Mashantucket 35:22 mass 26:20 massive 24:8 Master 101:15 mate 19:11 materials 107:19 matter 11:19 29:19 49:16 122:11 **matters** 111:16 maximize 26:1 McCLENAHAN 1:18 mean 79:5 meaning 51:15

means 80:14 86:13 107:8 measures 38:15 81:20 measuring 42:22 82:5 media 120:20 medical 101:19 102:10

meaningful 10:5 48:1

48:12 73:8,17 116:19

102:22 103:7 **medicine** 35:3 97:12,13 97:20 98:1 101:15,16

101:18 102:16 meet 26:11 52:1 53:12 64:1

Meeting 1:3,11 meets 72:2,22

**Melanie** 49:4.5 melting 61:13 **Melts** 60:8 member 18:12 53:20 60:11 64:4 96:22 members 10:11 13:1 18:17 28:2 109:5 113:5 118:12 **membership** 63:21,22 mentioned 4:2,21 5:18 6:12 8:6 115:19 mentor 32:16 35:13 **merits** 73:3 metabolism 41:21 meter 43:2

methods 31:2 33:22 55:17 58:20 77:22 112:8 Mexico 22:7,12,17

23:11 76:5 micro 58:22 microbiome 5:21 microphone 4:4 7:17

millennia 35:1 million 54:5,7 115:20

millions 29:11 mind 4:12 minds 94:7 Mini 60:8 **minimal** 16:22

minister 108:14,20 109:8 ministers 109:9

**minuses** 120:9 minutes 3:18,20 8:16

mission 12:5 25:14,15 71:21 79:20 93:15 98:20 99:3

**missions** 82:20 Mississippi 21:9 22:4,6 22:11

misusing 84:2 MIT-trained 41:5 Mitchell 105:14,15,17 mix 88:20

**MMPA** 49:10 50:8,12 51:3,6 53:8 87:22 91:13 92:19

moderate 49:21 Moderator 1:12 modern 67:1 80:15

moment 4:11 7:14 8:13 20:11 85:11 **MONDAY** 1:8

money 24:9 84:9 107:21

monitor 31:9 77:19

monitoring 24:17 29:6 31:15 months 68:11 moratorium 49:11 morphometrics 100:12 Mosey 60:5,6,7 **mothers** 49:16 motivate 28:20 motivation 69:2 motivations 20:1 move 37:18 89:22 90:15 moved 52:22 66:4 120:9,18 movement 58:8 86:17 moving 37:21 66:7 69:1 120:10 mugs 10:14 multi-disciplinary

23:17 multi-sensory 74:9,14 **Muraco** 21:6,7,8 Murphy 57:9 60:2 **myopic** 94:18 Mystic's 20:8 40:3,9,15 56:3,11 62:14,22 63:5 63:16 85:15 119:20

name 2:7 3:12 8:20 13:16 18:11 21:7 25:12 30:1 34:12.13 41:5 53:19 60:7 71:7 75:16 88:15 89:14 93:10 101:12 105:17 110:3 named 11:7 Naomi 83:5,7 **narrow** 49:12 **nation** 29:13 **national** 7:10 25:20 35:8 37:11 38:2 45:18 58:12 105:20 nationally 29:10 **Nations** 115:20 native 29:16 54:2 81:15 **Natives** 29:16 natural 5:22 22:21 24:13 46:11,17 77:16 99:22 120:16 naturalistic 99:21 nature 26:11 64:16 65:7 74:9 86:19 90:14 **Naval** 14:19 near 34:14 nearby 112:13 nearly 90:9

27:7 29:6 31:20 33:21

necessarily 88:21

**necessary** 6:7 25:3 37:6 70:21 77:7,21 95:18 109:4,19 **need** 3:8 24:11,19 29:9 31:3 42:7 43:10 44:4 46:13 65:5 83:12,22 84:5 90:15 98:5 107:7 115:22 117:3,16 needed 22:10 52:21 55:22 84:9 94:11 95:6 100:20 117:10 Needless 48:5 needs 76:11 78:21 107:7 negative 20:20 53:5 **NES** 88:11 neural 5:17 neuro-immunology 72:6 **never** 10:8 46:19 86:12 86:15 87:14 new 17:7 19:8,18 22:4 26:3 37:17 40:20 45:13,21 47:14 77:22 82:17 83:1 100:8 105:22 106:7,18,19 107:2,5,6 108:19 109:8,17 110:14 111:18 112:8 113:2 114:4 120:4 **news** 77:5 newspaper 19:15 **NGOs** 49:8 niche 28:19 Nikolai 49:18 50:16 **NMFS** 20:14 50:15,22 51:19 69:22 **NMFS'** 121:11 **NOAA** 1:1 2:9 11:4 40:10,11,14 79:6,14 82:12 88:13 118:4 **NOAA's** 25:20 58:13 non- 31:1 33:21 111:15 non-depleted 52:4 non-human 74:20 non-invasive 5:10,19 12:11 27:16 30:22 31:10 35:17 55:16 58:20 59:16 65:20 94:13 95:1 113:19 116:9 117:8 non-invasively 42:20 non-releasable 59:18 nonprofit 63:21 105:20 **normal** 46:17 98:11 normally 46:11,22 108:15 North 68:22 81:14

115:18 121:20 northern 22:6,12 23:11 62:10 120:19 Northwest 34:14 note 29:13 noted 19:7,13 novel 34:1 47:8,8 NOVEMBER 1:8 NSF 29:14 112:14 number 17:15 47:2 89:17 91:7 105:21 121:3 numbered 78:9 numbers 94:3 numerous 90:3,7

0

O'Connell 18:8,10,11 objectives 6:3 obligated 71:1 observation 15:22 observations 31:11 **observe** 46:16 111:7 observed 16:10 obstacles 84:18 86:20 obtain 52:2 obvious 48:9 87:15 occasional 92:5 occupy 28:19 occur 6:10 95:17 119:10 occurred 94:4 ocean 1:17 9:14 10:13 12:6 15:19 25:16 28:13 34:14 54:17 60:20 61:4 93:4 105:11 **Oceanic** 58:12 oceans 93:21 108:14 offense 107:16.21 offer 90:17 104:9 office 2:9 7:12 14:19 offices 89:17 officials 119:18 120:21 offsite 55:19 offspring 19:12 oil 23:1 Ok 29:20 **Oliver** 57:19 omits 51:12 on-going 67:20 **onboard** 46:19 once 61:10 87:16 88:6 101:6 ones 90:11 ongoing 70:11 77:21 105:1

**Ontario** 63:19

open 22:5 77:16 opening 19:22 23:6 93:13 **openly** 73:15 operate 81:13 92:19 **operates** 59:9 81:9 operation 69:3 **Operations** 93:12 121:1 operators 69:2 opinion 84:6 86:9 92:1 opinions 71:17 97:6 opportunities 14:13 32:6,13 opportunity 4:22 9:4 10:9 16:20 34:8 35:10 35:20 75:15 83:7 95:14 105:16 118:4 opposes 83:10 opposing 88:7 opposition 71:12 72:11 90:8,13 91:18,22 92:3 **OPS** 66:22 optimal 82:3 100:1 101:2 104:6 **optimum** 114:1 oral 3:1 4:16 6:12 orcas 68:7 order 3:16 6:3 8:6 24:18 26:1,10 28:4 31:4 55:16 73:18 76:5 organization 18:14,18 19:16 26:8 38:3 54:12 54:16 60:22 63:22 76:1 96:2 105:18,20 organization's 55:4 62:3 organizations 11:4 99:17 **Osborne** 34:11,12 outcome 40:10 84:7 outdoor 56:4 62:15 95:13 103:18 120:19 **outdoors** 120:13 outlined 71:15 73:11 116:1 outreach 66:18 outside 30:16 87:3 104:2 outweigh 120:9 over-117:12 119:6 over-crowded 44:13 overall 83:18 100:10 112:19 overcrowded 58:2 59:19 119:17 overcrowding 85:11

oversight 48:15 79:14 overview 2:15 owned 86:8 owner 86:13 87:1 owners 87:2 ownership 86:8

Р

P-R-O-C-E-E-D-I-N-G-S 2:1 p.m 1:12 2:2 122:12 paper 74:2 papers 46:6,7 99:9 paragraphs 57:22 pardon 8:12 parent 5:8 parents 68:1 88:16 Park 63:19 Parks 99:19 102:6 parliamentary 106:10 part 11:9 14:8 16:17 28:16 54:11 57:21,21 60:21 76:2 96:8 108:21 115:10 participate 6:5 16:21 35:10,21 59:16 96:12 107:22 participating 9:22 70:22 participation 14:11 78:2 104:2 117:9 particular 43:18 44:9 45:4 51:11 106:14 108:9 109:13 114:1 116:19 particularly 81:14 partner 48:4 partnering 20:11 partners 47:22 party 38:11 passed 83:1 105:22 119:18 passing 25:4 passion 32:20 33:14 35:5 77:1 105:6 passionate 101:22 passionately 114:6 passively 42:22 Pathobiology 110:4 pathology 23:21 110:10 patterns 15:16 Paul 37:8,11 pause 2:17 7:14 8:14 peer- 46:6 peer-reviewed 39:6 99:9 penguin 102:12 104:3 people 11:17,20 12:6

119:10 121:7

overlooked 22:8

25:16 36:1,3 38:6 44:6 48:16 60:19 74:11 88:16 94:16 115:13 **people's** 28:12 **Pequot** 35:22 perception 41:16 **perform** 87:6 103:13 108:1 performances 107:10 performed 100:16 **period** 6:21 96:15 periods 41:22 42:5 permit 1:3 2:5 4:17 5:1 5:4,16 6:22 12:8 13:5 13:9,18,19 17:10,19 18:2 19:10 20:14 25:4 25:19 30:3 37:3,14 43:19 49:1 51:3,6,9 51:18,20 52:3 53:16 55:10 56:21 58:3 59:18 62:6 63:6 66:19 67:7 68:21 70:5 71:9 71:15,18 72:1,4 73:2 73:11 75:11 79:20,21 80:17 82:12 84:17 94:14 95:21 96:17,20 98:7,17 99:7 101:7 104:15 105:9 108:13 109:4,12,18 111:1 113:2 114:8,16,17 116:1,14 117:1 118:22 121:11 **permits** 1:15,16,18,19 1:20,21 2:8 50:14 73:9 **permitted** 53:11 98:10 person 75:5 personal 32:22 92:4 102:1 perspective 70:15 perspectives 70:1 **PETA** 49:4,6,7 petition 89:5 **Ph.D** 14:16,21 32:18 74:5 75:13 97:14 110:11 pharmacology 97:14 phasing 106:5 philosophical 93:18 phones 4:12 phonetic 34:13 photogrammetry 5:20 photography 73:22 **photos** 42:20 43:12 physical 106:12 physiological 5:20 16:7 67:19 76:11

physiologically 74:21 physiology 5:21 15:1 27:15 30:16 31:15 41:16,21 58:22 77:12 100:19 piece 55:12 62:8 **pillar** 93:15 pioneered 54:8 55:17 **pipe** 92:8 pivotal 97:18 place 1:12 48:21 55:15 94:11 95:16 105:3 **placed** 50:12 places 45:11,22 73:21 89:2 plan 58:13 94:10 95:10 100:21 104:1,3 113:13 116:4 planet 10:19 12:6 25:16 30:13 38:7 60:20 76:7 105:12 plans 9:21 28:1 plant 115:21 play 28:9 38:5 47:11 **played** 97:18 plays 65:8 please 3:8 4:11 7:17 13:15 **plus** 88:2 **pluses** 120:8 point 4:6 7:22 16:16 44:16 45:9 55:9 65:18 71:17 79:3,22 86:3 106:21 112:13 pointing 88:8 119:16 points 57:11,11 **polar** 77:8 **policies** 9:21 104:22 **policy** 7:11 28:7 55:13 62:8 72:9 94:17 99:12 political 78:8 79:4 pollutants 81:17 pollution 50:2 **pool** 56:13 **pools** 63:2 popularity 106:20 popularly 26:19 **population** 11:8 16:4 29:6 31:18 40:1 49:14 49:19,20 50:4,19 52:16,16 53:5,9 68:3 68:17,17 78:9,22 84:13 87:19 89:1,8 100:5 113:15,16 populations 5:13,14 11:5 12:14 13:7 16:19 18:5 27:18,21 31:3,4

50:10 52:13 55:13 58:6 62:9 67:9,14,18 69:9,18 70:7 77:20 80:14 81:19,21 82:1,3 82:9 87:13 94:2 96:13 100:15 105:2 111:8 111:18 113:11 116:5 116:16,19 porpoise 76:15 porpoises 78:15 107:8 115:15 portable 103:3 portfolio 26:17 pose 84:18 posed 115:11 position 110:18 positions 53:2 87:1 positive 66:20 78:2 103:15 positively 40:5 41:13 possession 107:18 possibility 20:6 possible 11:13 16:5,15 30:20 31:22 32:14,18 42:3 47:4,6,7 56:10 62:21 66:1 78:1 100:7 **post** 4:9 post-doc 110:16 post-doctoral 14:18 posted 6:14 potential 47:14 55:18 81:18 109:6 121:22 potentially 68:16 119:11 pouring 23:8 power 111:20 powerful 66:17 74:15 98:14 practicable 66:1 practically 61:11 practices 40:6 85:12,20 precedent 18:1 20:9,21 71:19 73:2 90:19 premise 46:9 90:9 prepare 7:10 presence 15:19 present 1:14 63:4 presentation 2:12 3:9 3:21 presentations 4:14 preserve 76:6 president 19:14 25:13 53:22 60:7 63:15 75:20 93:11 presiding 1:12 pressure 68:11 69:17 presumes 51:14 pretense 24:10

**pretty** 61:10 prevent 22:1 55:20 75:6 105:1 preventative 72:19 102:10,16 preventing 66:11 86:20 106:6 Preventive 97:12 previous 86:13 87:1 109:7 previously 97:4 **prey** 15:18 primary 21:20 68:2 113:1 principal 1:17 64:18 72:3 114:15 principles 102:9 Prior 64:7 117:18 priorities 58:10 78:22 116:9 priority 105:7 privately 86:8 privilege 9:6 115:2,6 privileged 11:16 privileges 10:22 problem 43:17 68:21 69:3 85:19 120:14 problems 43:16 81:1 process 2:15,18 4:5 5:1 7:3,15 38:16 86:18 93:1 117:18 processes 12:12 **produce** 19:11 82:14 100:8 product 32:13 **profession** 9:12 28:18 105:6 professional 9:1 14:13 33:4,5,13 97:18 100:1 102:2 professionalism 48:8 professionals 47:16 73:15 77:2 105:7 professor 30:4 74:4 110:3 114:3 progeny 49:15 50:4,19 52:15 53:9 68:18 87:13,16 program 14:16 20:17 23:16 27:7 29:15 37:12 38:10 44:17 59:9 65:15 81:9 83:16 102:15 103:22 programs 14:6 19:4,19 20:3 25:14 29:2,4,13 54:6 80:15 81:13 104:4 progress 17:20 111:13

34:5 40:13 43:11

106:12 **ranges** 43:6 **region** 22:8.19 112:1 regionally 29:10 Psychology 74:4,5 ranging 112:8 prohibited 50:21 rapid 115:10,17 register 2:20 **prohibiting** 19:2 106:8 **public** 1:3,11 2:4 4:16 **rapidly-** 39:10 registered 2:22 108:12 6:11,19 7:18,20 19:2 prohibition 50:13 19:7 20:8 22:11 24:2 rapidly-changing 16:14 registration 3:3 **prohibits** 19:9 49:9 regular 72:19 86:16 28:5,10 29:3 39:8 78:18 rare 89:2 50:8 53:8 50:10,13,20 51:1,4,7 regulated 77:2 51:17,19,21 53:10 rate 36:8 115:15 regulation 19:8 40:4 project 76:2 projects 31:12 32:3 65:2 66:14,18 67:10 rays 22:15 58:22 84:16 87:17 94:13 67:21 68:11 69:4,21 reach 85:7 regulations 91:2 92:13 read 57:21 84:16 92:19 112:14 70:10,19 85:2 87:20 regulations.gov 6:18 90:17 95:14,21 97:1 reaffirm 89:22 91:20 **promise** 39:12 regulators 39:21 promotes 80:7,14 97:13 106:21 109:5 92:16,17,18 real 20:6 24:17 60:9 regulatory 7:9 **proofs** 46:8 109:13 113:4,4,5 122:10 61:15 70:6 95:16 rehabilitated 11:10 properly 48:2 publications 65:19 Reality 79:3 95:19 proposal 18:19 19:21 **realize** 12:5 73:12 rehabilitation 11:7 38:20 39:13 40:9,15 80:19 57:13 79:21 81:3 published 46:6 54:7 reason 34:20 60:13 reinforcement 78:2 98:13 109:12 58:10 99:9 87:8 93:13 108:22 103:16 **proposals** 83:18 84:4 publishes 39:5 109:16 relate 16:9 related 5:10 15:1 27:1 reasonable 90:10 **propose** 6:6,8 purported 52:14 proposed 5:6,16 19:17 **purpose** 2:14 4:15 reasons 53:1 64:18 50:1 61:6 84:15 49:9 56:1 62:12 68:2 50:20 98:12 113:1 90:3 114:18 relates 15:4 28:20 79:19 80:17 81:16 purposes 1:6 18:21 rebuilding 40:13 Relations 53:22 receive 49:15 66:7 relationship 15:3 47:10 83:10 89:9 104:15 111:2 114:10 100:1 107:21 111:1 relationships 36:16 111:1 114:8 116:6 pursued 48:2 110:11 **relative** 69:9 70:10 121:12,14 pursuing 86:1 114:9 received 14:14 relatively 90:6 proposes 5:9 put 92:21 99:1 107:14 receptive 87:2 released 26:9 56:14 proposing 19:13 120:2 63:3 100:22 protect 12:6 25:16 46:3 reckoning 121:7 Q releases 68:14 93:21.21 94:1 96:9 **recognize** 83:12,16 90:14 119:6 relevant 7:6 45:16 47:7 Protected 2:9 qualified 44:1 47:19 recognized 102:3 64:20 70:4 82:8 95:1 protecting 40:12 107:9 81:2 95:5 quality 48:7 83:16 95:1 106:10 recognizes 80:8 **protection** 7:8,9 18:4 reliable 37:1 117:19 24:4 49:8 54:17 61:4 100:12 103:7 116:22 recommend 37:21 67:17 80:1,3 82:13 record 4:8 6:13 46:19 remain 105:11 122:1 59:8,22 72:10 96:2 remaining 22:18 66:9 **Quebec** 58:8 98:16 104:22 76:7 96:11 question 8:2 44:11 63:8 122:12 protections 49:15 remarkable 22:20 protesting 24:7 79:6 87:15 recorded 6:13 protocol 35:15 87:6 questions 2:18 4:3,5,22 recording 11:1 **remedy** 80:5 records 6:15,16 65:19 remember 74:11 prototype 6:1 7:15 10:7 115:4 122:7 quickly 77:14 recovering 94:12 remembered 74:8 proud 54:11 60:21 quite 12:20 79:3 97:13 recovery 5:12 9:21 13:8 remind 8:9 proven 14:2 65:19 66:16 117:18 121:4 27:22 31:7 58:13,16 remote 16:22 45:20 94:10 95:10 100:21 remotely 82:5 86:2 provide 4:16,19 9:19 **quo** 89:22 91:20 113:13 116:4,15 111:6 33:17 59:4 72:19 quote 50:18,21 51:10 recreational 80:10 removal 29:7 74:19 95:11 99:20 51:15 121:2,4,15 renowned 27:6 65:15 rectified 86:6 120:17 101:22 102:19 103:11 quotes 120:20 **rectify** 120:16 81:8 104:13 117:12 R recycling 10:15 repeated 16:8 provided 54:6,13 60:15 **reduce** 66:8 Repetitive 31:10 61:2 86:13 120:5 race 13:2 Reese 89:12,14,15 replacement 74:1 provides 34:1 43:4 45:9 radiographs 103:13 referred 26:19 74:10 95:14 rail 22:14 report 26:9,15 115:19 reflection 70:12 reporter 4:7 providing 25:2 56:8 raised 52:11 62:19 96:2 reflective 91:17 reports 40:11 54:8 random 8:7 **regarding** 6:11 7:3 representation 44:11 provision 51:13 randomize 3:16 representative 44:7 proximity 31:19 range 26:17 29:5 41:22 106:12 regards 70:11 representing 44:20 psychological 74:6 44:7

represents 46:17 90:22 results 14:12 16:9 17:4 **Sakhalin** 49:18 50:16 30:14 48:3 49:20 56:14 63:3 65:12 71:9 17:17,18 40:8 80:19 **saliva** 42:16 91:3 71:20 72:1 73:4 77:16 reproduction 5:22 sample 44:10 59:4 85:5 100:13 103:6 returned 68:10 101:1 111:19 117:16 77:17 102:13,14 19:12 21:12 24:16 82:4 116:15 reusable 10:13 117:20 110:6 reproductions 23:22 **seals** 34:22 revealed 45:21 **samples** 16:8 17:2 season 30:17 68:8 reproductive 23:20 reverse 80:4 35:18 42:16,19 43:12 55:18,20 86:5,10,13 second 27:9 39:14 53:4 24:13 30:6,16 31:16 reversing 100:4 59:1 81:20 107:18 review 2:14 7:4 86:14,16 103:12,15 72:17 116:10.12 reviewed 46:7 112:9 secondly 57:16 sampling 31:11 87:5 section 7:8 51:12 reputable 98:18 **Rhode** 29:21 30:5 securing 17:11 rich 75:1 111:16 **reputation** 20:5 91:5 Richard 8:18,20,21 sanctuaries 63:4 seek 21:3 **request** 66:19 sanctuary 56:15 seeking 70:6 requested 5:3 29:21 30:1,2 57:8 60:1 97:17 sand 92:10 seeks 50:8 require 34:5 67:18 richness 74:14 satisfied 79:10 118:21 seen 10:11 16:21 46:20 69:20,21 77:19 **ridley** 22:13 **satisfy** 53:12 54:12 60:16,22 61:7 requirement 53:13 83:3 rigor 114:21 save 76:15 98:5 requirements 25:3 80:1 118:20 rigorous 26:4 38:15 **saw** 61:12 self-sustaining 69:10 requires 24:17 63:22 64:1 saying 11:22 75:2 senate 106:10,22 107:2 Senate-confirmed **rise** 90:18 92:15 66:12 88:5 requiring 121:19 risk 55:18 scan 6:17 64:10 **rescues** 67:5 risks 82:8 **scenes** 90:12 **Senator** 57:8,9 60:2,3 researcher 10:21 13:17 **risky** 56:16 school 39:9 110:9 **Senators** 57:13 sending 30:17 21:13 33:12 75:17 river 49:18 50:17 78:14 science 26:2,5 27:7 Senior 25:13 53:21 110:20 110:11 28:4 35:6,7,8 38:4 researchers 11:2 13:22 robust 31:21 39:7,10 40:3,8,16 93:11 121:1 role 25:21 28:9 65:8 65:15 77:7 78:17 81:9 sense 24:3 64:11 88:1 21:14 23:15 24:19 95:9 101:16 110:4 120:2 25:2 35:14 36:15 55:7 97:18 **sensitive** 117:15 72:12 88:2,3 100:13 roles 21:11 38:5 112:1 104:8 113:19 Romano 14:22 32:16 sciences 98:1 **sent** 79:8 scientific 1:6 5:3 11:14 separated 52:13 resident 18:11 102:11 35:14 36:17 54:21 61:20 72:5 97:15 18:21 29:14 38:18 separation 20:19 resist 91:20 39:2,5,12 49:22 51:2 **serious** 106:12 resolve 81:1 111:11 114:12,13,14 seriously 28:8 resource 2:10 37:1 Romano's 72:11 51:9,18 53:10 54:8 room 70:18 75:8 78:12 64:20 65:4 66:17 serve 23:14 29:4 110:5 77:17 rooted 38:4 69:20 71:20 78:6 110:20 resources 12:11 78:4 **served** 97:19 roots 98:2 80:15,20 83:12 85:1 respect 21:2 107:7 89:4 99:2,11 104:7,17 **server** 107:2 **respected** 72:8,12 Rose 83:5,6,7 respective 11:3 **Roslyn** 53:17,20 106:11 108:15 111:20 **serves** 67:13 113:17 114:21 121:13 service 9:19 25:21 64:9 respiratory 43:1,16 **routine** 86:19 routinely 33:22 46:1 scientist 1:17 14:20 64:11 101:9 103:14 serving 64:9 67:4 respond 67:3 102:21 **rule** 50:15 32:17 39:17 41:6 set 7:22 18:1 20:9 42:5 response 5:20 15:17 ruling 121:10 54:20 61:19 72:4 83:8 **running** 89:16 111:3 114:3,14 73:2 115:19 117:2 91:18 Russia 68:4,20 121:9 117:21 sets 72:15 responses 16:7 27:14 scientists 9:19 23:16 setting 100:16 116:21 58:19,21 100:18 **Russian** 5:8 68:12,22 settings 56:10 62:21 Rutland 1:21 4:4 responsibilities 12:9 27:5 28:2 29:4 32:7 32:15 36:3 39:20 66:1 100:8 responsibility 10:12 S seven 94:13 13:1 112:20 41:10 44:1 48:9 56:8 59:5 62:19 65:14,18 seven- 10:17 responsible 32:8 111:3 S-203 19:1 106:1 72:8 81:7,11 94:17 **shade** 85:12,19 120:14 107:12 108:10 118:21 restoration 24:4 29:6 restrictions 50:7 53:15 119:1,18 95:3 99:8 104:12 **shaped** 14:8 114:4 **share** 38:7 47:22 57:6 result 22:1 53:5 69:12 **Sadly** 78:10 92:2 73:9 85:6 86:22 88:18 Scott 96:22 96:19 safe 40:18 122:5,9 scuba 60:16 61:6 shared 32:20 75:1 121:7 **safely** 48:2 110:15 sea 1:21 22:13 25:14 **shares** 33:14 resulted 23:1 68:6 safer 65:10 sake 56:22 63:7 27:3,12,21 29:11 sharing 112:9 resulting 23:7

II			
sharks 22:14,14	small 14:8 17:15 47:3	specific 14:22 48:14	<b>Steve</b> 57:4
SHASTA 1:18	76:15	86:4 90:22	stewards 28:6
sheet 3:11	smallest 102:11	specifically 16:9 37:21	stick 92:10
shelf 34:20	smells 74:14	52:15 105:11 116:2	stimulating 48:12
ship 68:15	SMITH 1:17	specifics 107:12	stock 5:8 82:11
shipping 117:19	sobering 26:14	speculate 78:6	stocks 50:14
shopping 10:13	social 20:19 34:3 52:22	speculative 86:12	stop 10:14
short 53:7 76:5 84:21	74:5 76:10 107:7	speed 17:17	stores 34:19
91:10 111:22	120:4	speed 17.17 spent 24:9	storied 54:4
show 50:6 75:4 92:20	society 18:8,13,16	sperm 22:14	stories 39:7
shows 52:7 74:6	28:19 45:19	spill 23:1	story 11:13 78:10
side 103:5	solely 38:11 87:20	Spillway 23:7	stranded 23:2 43:15
sides 84:3	solution 28:16 56:12	spirit 21:3	strandings 67:4
sights 74:13	63:1 83:22	spray 35:18	strategies 31:6,17 47:2
sign 3:10	somewhat 120:6	Spring 1:11,12	straws 10:14
signed 60:1	son 12:17,22	squarely 29:17	streamlined 47:3
significance 15:20 80:8	son's 10:18 12:15	squid 22:14	stress 20:18 57:12
85:7 101:3	sons 10:11	<b>St</b> 27:19 58:7 82:10	58:19 120:3
significant 106:20	sorry 8:15,15	110:11,15 113:14	stressors 81:18 113:10
111:13 120:18	sort 89:21 92:7	staff 1:14 32:1 48:9	stretch 19:21
significantly 57:16 98:9	sound 5:20 15:19 22:6	59:15 72:17 84:9	strict 49:10
silence 4:11 70:10	22:11 27:15 58:21	Stafford 75:13,14,16	stringent 53:12
Silver 1:11,12	81:19 100:18	stakeholders 39:19	strong 30:3 69:2 72:13
similar 85:14 89:18	sounds 74:13	stance 93:7	102:15 112:5,21
95:18	source 35:2 70:16	stand 4:19 96:14	118:19
simple 76:17	Southeast 19:15	standard 64:2 84:22	strongly 37:21 40:14
simply 30:19 45:11	<b>space</b> 117:10 120:5	108:17	96:19 105:9
49:9 64:4 78:16 84:20	spacious 99:20	standards 17:22 64:2	struggling 31:5
85:16 88:7 89:22	<b>Spain</b> 108:21	79:14 85:13 102:3	student 14:16 115:8
91:21 92:10 96:14	<b>spare</b> 20:18	117:2	students 23:14 28:5
117:5,12	spark 9:8	standing 70:17	29:1,9 73:16 112:16
simultaneous 31:15	spatial 45:15	standpoint 120:8	studied 15:2 22:20
<b>single</b> 10:17	speak 3:8,14 8:3,8	stands 90:8	65:11
<b>situ</b> 23:15,16 65:7,9	16:16 57:5 75:15	star 102:14	studies 5:10,15,18,22
<b>situation</b> 42:6 77:13	78:20 83:7	started 88:22 110:9	6:5 14:21 15:21 16:11
79:9 95:19 117:13	<b>speaker</b> 3:7,8 8:6,8,10	starting 79:22 82:16	16:21 17:14 23:19
sixth 26:20	8:19 18:7 29:20 34:10	121:9	24:16 27:12 28:11
<b>size</b> 19:5 44:10 59:4	41:1 53:17 60:4 63:11	state 18:12,17 75:7	45:20 52:17 72:14
85:5,14 100:6 101:1	66:21 71:5 75:12 83:4	state-of- 81:9	74:15 99:10 100:17
111:19	93:8 96:21 101:10	state-of-the-art 43:22	114:21 117:6
<b>SKIDMORE</b> 1:15	109:21 114:11 118:6	55:7 65:16 95:3 103:2	study 21:15 23:10
skilled 33:19 102:20	speaker 18:6	stated 19:9 77:20 121:1	28:11 31:1,2 45:7
skills 11:11	speakers 2:13 3:17,19	states 1:6 38:1 50:20	54:9 56:9 62:20 65:7
slightly 59:21	speaking 3:1 4:2 18:16	52:5 55:2 56:5 60:1,2 62:1,16 64:8 72:1	65:7,22 74:17 92:4 99:4 100:8 116:20
slippery 92:9 Sloan 1:12,16 2:3,7	speaks 55:3 62:2 specialize 72:18	81:5 83:20 99:7	studying 27:6 30:5
7:19 8:1 13:12 18:6	specialize 72:18 species 9:5,16 10:3	103:18 121:16	58:18 65:14 81:7
21:5 25:5,11 29:20	12:15 18:3 20:4 22:3	stateside 98:4	114:22 115:2,5
34:10 37:8 41:1 44:19	33:7 38:7 45:19 54:9	statistical 85:7 101:3	116:18
49:3 53:17 57:4 60:4	55:14 56:19 57:2	111:20	stymied 76:9
63:11 66:21 71:5	61:15 62:10 63:8 69:6	statistics 26:14	subject 49:12 68:18
75:12 79:16 83:4	71:16 76:18,21 80:9	status 43:13 50:5 63:22	subjects 39:2
88:10 89:12 93:8	80:13 93:3 94:12 96:4	81:21 89:22 91:20	submit 3:13 7:20,21
96:21 101:8 105:13	98:11 100:7 101:20	116:10	submit 7:18
109:21 114:11 118:6	104:2,19 105:10	statute 51:12	submitted 2:5 4:17 6:19
122:3	111:5,6 115:21 116:7	statutory 7:7	7:5 25:19 49:7 73:4
<b>slope</b> 92:9	118:2	stemming 26:18	97:4
<b>slow</b> 26:10	species' 77:9 78:21	step 120:18	submitting 7:1
<del></del>			

**subpar** 85:11 tank 120:21 66:12 91:18 trainable 52:10 trained 16:10 30:17 third 26:15 subsistence 34:21 tanks 119:21 third- 38:10 trainer 21:12 33:11 substance 81:15 target 21:20 targeted 67:21 69:18 substantive 7:6 **Thompson** 13:14,16,17 75:17 succeed 20:9 94:12 97:17 trainers 33:20 75:21 87:7 102:5.19 succeeded 39:18 taught 12:3 35:15 thousand 29:1 training 31:22 32:14 **success** 11:13 17:12 teach 46:12 thousands 39:8 54:9 teachers 39:9 33:19 78:3 87:5 23:20 31:8 32:2 69:9 106:17 threat 68:3 69:19 team 11:10 27:5 32:20 103:16 117:11 82:19 97:22 successful 11:6 22:1 35:14 44:1 53:21 threaten 83:15 transfer 118:18 threatened 12:13 26:16 transferrable 100:14 suffering 24:11 54:20 55:6 61:19 transferred 20:13 86:9 65:13 81:7 91:1 95:2 27:1 56:20 111:8 suggest 69:11 suited 25:2 102:18,20 111:10 threats 27:1 121:17 three 44:16 57:11 64:18 transferring 86:10 summarily 50:22 teams 29:16 72:18 summer 30:17 112:15 114:17,20 119:15 transition 111:14 techniques 5:11,19 27:16 42:12 47:5 121:14 translates 39:7 **summit** 61:10 threshold 52:2 53:13 Translating 28:4 superior 90:16 113:20 116:10 technologies 77:22 thrilled 76:1 **transport** 6:8 20:19 supplement 97:3 **supply** 70:13 telemetry 6:1 59:2 thrive 34:16 46:13 56:3 120:3 tells 43:5 62:14 transported 55:19 support 25:18 29:12 108:8 temperament 100:6 **thriving** 102:17 30:3 32:17 34:9 37:13 48:21 49:1 57:10,22 temptation 89:20 90:4 **tide** 26:18 transporting 86:14 71:11 78:4,8 79:18,21 91:17.20 tightly-controlled 47:9 106:15 89:5 90:17 96:1,3 ten 60:12 94:14 100:20 timely 26:21 86:11 trauma 106:14 120:3 travel 16:20 35:11 96:5 106:18,21 107:1,5,6 tend 75:4 times 62:1 105:22 112:15 113:13.18 tendency 78:20 **Timing** 55:19 traveled 61:5,11 118:14 tens 106:17 today 2:11 4:8 6:12,16 traveling 122:5,8 travels 122:6,9 supported 28:1 tenure 9:3 54:12 75:22 6:17 7:21 10:21 13:4 14:20 18:16 21:14 treat 42:2 43:17 supporters 18:17 term 23:6 77:10 trend 100:4 33:2 40:4 56:3 60:18 118:12 termed 73:9 supporting 90:9 terms 44:15 107:12 64:19 71:13 72:14 **trends** 90:6 test 42:22 47:8.20 triage 43:14 supports 63:16 75:9 76:12.20 77:11 103:14 110:14 78:11 83:7 89:19 90:2 tribal 39:22 40:6 **Supreme** 51:10 **Tribe** 36:1 **survival** 56:19 77:10 90:21 91:7 93:15,20 testament 14:4 trillions 23:7 83:15 104:3,18 tested 86:15 108:18 98:20 105:17.21 testify 25:18 110:22 108:10 110:22 111:4 trip 13:4 **survive** 34:16 45:22 testimony 60:18 71:11 118:5 troubling 90:6 46:13 68:9 today's 38:4 47:7 73:6 true 11:12 **Susan** 74:3 97:3,3,9 111:4 truly 16:11 18:3 24:10 **suspect** 121:13 testing 6:1 112:8 **Tom** 60:5,7 sustainability 28:1 39:3 tests 48:5,15 117:14 **Tonia** 34:11,12 24:16 96:18 tools 27:17 30:7.22 trust 28:14 40:2 67:17 69:15 **Texas** 60:10 **topics** 26:18 thank 2:4 8:1,1 13:10 trusted 26:2 116:16 **Trustees** 60:12 89:13 sustainable 26:12 tourism 50:2 18:5 21:4 25:5,11 swim 103:17 29:18 34:8 40:22 toxicology 110:10,12 89:15 44:18 49:2 57:3.6 traced 98:1 try 2:12 20:7 46:21 **Sylvain** 109:22 110:3 60:3,6 63:9 66:20 track 59:7 96:2 89:20 symposium 112:18 tracks 114:4 turn 6:16 71:4 75:11,14 79:15 **system** 48:21 **turned** 6:15 systems 47:3,9 99:5 83:6 88:9,12,12 89:11 **Tracy** 14:22 32:15 93:7 96:20 101:7,9 35:13 36:16 54:20 **turning** 82:19 116:18 61:19 72:4 111:11 turtles 22:13 102:13 105:12,15 109:20 Т 114:12,14 **Tuttle** 93:9,10,11 97:15 114:10 118:4,5 122:2 122:4,9 two 3:3 16:20 52:12 trade 21:4 67:22 69:4 t's 92:22 70:1,3,21,22 108:11 57:11,21 60:15 66:12 **Thanks** 13:13 tables 3:4 traditional 34:15,21 86:15 88:17 90:22 thawing 61:14 tag 15:21 the-art 81:10 35:7 36:15 97:16 108:20 109:9 takes 33:16 47:22 69:12 theme 71:12 traffic 50:2 114:19 119:1 tale 78:11 tragically 76:9 **Tyonek** 11:8,10,12 talk 76:14 thick 77:17 things 42:14 46:12,14 train 6:4 32:6 59:15 34:13 95:20 talking 45:1

type 43:21 86:4 typical 43:5 typically 75:1 U **U** 75:13 **U.S** 19:10,18,22 20:2 25:1 39:20,21 64:10 87:19 95:22 97:8 112:20 119:8 **UC-Davis** 110:17 ultimate 33:7 ultimately 16:4 70:14 76:8 ultrasounds 103:13 **UME** 23:2,5 unacceptable 87:21 unaccredited 66:5 undergraduate 14:15 112:16 undergraduates 32:11 underlying 28:12 undermine 52:14 understand 11:5 12:2,2 15:12 23:20 31:4 36:10 41:10 46:4 65:6 68:15 77:7 84:14 113:10,14 119:13 understanding 11:20 16:3,13 24:13,16 31:17 32:8 33:6 45:13 58:15 64:21 66:13 93:4 110:17 111:21 understands 13:1 67:13 undertaking 59:5 unexpected 74:12 unfathomable 24:8 unfavorable 17:20 unfortunate 21:18 **Unfortunately** 68:14 unfounded 21:22 24:10 unique 12:20 16:11 28:19 56:9 62:20 65:21 76:12 uniquely 25:1 81:2 95:5 **United** 1:6 38:1 50:20 52:5 55:1 56:5 60:1,2 62:1,16 64:8 72:1 81:5 83:20 99:7 103:18 115:20 university 14:17 29:21 30:5 36:21 55:8 59:10 65:17 74:5 75:19

unquote 121:15 unreasonable 90:11 unstructured 74:9 unsustainable 70:12 unwavering 54:15 61:2 upholding 121:11 upload 3:14 6:18 urge 13:9,18 20:14 25:3 53:14 71:8 75:10 82:12 91:19 93:7 96:19 98:7 101:6 105:9 114:7 urgency 24:3 117:22 urges 40:14 **USDA** 38:18 79:15 94:20 99:15 102:4 use 2:16 10:13 17:21 43:12 45:3 80:12 92:11 94:21 useful 100:14 utilizing 10:14 35:16 utmost 95:1

vaguely 121:17 Vail 66:22 67:1 valid 86:3 validate 12:12 55:22 validated 78:1 validates 100:16 validating 30:22 58:20 **validity** 104:7 111:20 **valuable** 34:4 47:13 value 67:5 73:7,7 92:19 96:19 values 80:10 Vancouver 108:2 vanishing 115:17 vaquita 76:2,7,13 77:6 77:14 78:5,11 94:5 115:17 variables 52:14 104:18 variety 9:5 21:11 various 96:16 vary 42:8 44:5,6 vast 41:15 venture 20:12 verge 115:21 versus 84:1 vertebrate 23:10 vessel 50:2 Veterans 1:12 veterinarian 76:4 97:10 101:14 veterinarians 32:15 33:21 44:2 72:17

102:21 103:12 104:13

**veterinary** 32:1 97:12 97:19,22 101:15 103:3 110:4,8 viability 55:18 118:1 **viable** 73:22 Vice 25:13 53:21 60:13 93:11 video 45:8 46:19 73:22 74:10 view 30:14 45:9 64:17 86:3 vigorously 77:12 **village** 34:19 **vision** 94:18 visions 80:2 visit 9:7 10:10,15 28:13 visited 54:2 visiting 14:6 visitors 39:9 54:6 vital 39:3 101:4 104:17 vivid 74:7,22 **voice** 30:2 **volume** 91:17 voluntarily 6:5 10:1 59:16 103:12 voluntary 12:11 117:8 vulnerable 78:15

wait 96:14 waiting 68:16 **wants** 8:3 **warming** 15:18 warrants 64:17 **waste** 24:9 watched 12:17 water 30:15 100:12 **waters** 15:18 **waves** 43:1 way 8:11 11:21 18:4 30:19 42:5,7,21 62:20 86:11 92:8 106:19 ways 56:9 65:22 108:18 weak 86:9 website 4:9 6:14 7:2 40:10 week 46:8 weekends 92:5 welfare 6:8 21:12 37:20 38:4,12,15,16 40:21 44:16 48:17,19 52:22 57:15 64:22 66:3 69:15 79:2,9,13 83:5 83:8 87:9 101:19 102:8 118:9,11,14,16 119:5,16 120:8 122:1 well- 48:11 well-managed 66:4

went 122:12 weren't 35:2 **West** 18:15 western 35:7 **whale** 5:13 6:9 10:9 11:7 12:10 13:7 22:17 27:10 35:10,21 36:4,7 39:15,19 54:21 56:4 58:14 61:20 62:11,15 94:10 100:5,22 115:18 118:2 White 49:20 Whitmore 74:4 wide 9:4 38:17 64:2 wife 33:12 wild 5:13 11:1,6 16:18 16:21 18:4 21:2 22:3 23:21 24:3,10,15 30:9 30:20 31:2,3,13,18 34:2,5 39:4 40:5 41:13 42:13 43:8,10 45:3,7 46:10 47:21 52:16 55:13 56:10 62:9,21 66:1 67:13,18 67:20 69:7,13,17 70:16 71:3 75:6 77:20 81:17,19,21 82:1,4,5 82:9 95:8,12 96:9,13 100:9 107:14 111:17 115:3,5 116:11,16 121:9

wild-caught 68:1 wildlife 28:3 64:9.11 72:9 94:17 99:11 wildly 12:18 **Wilkinson** 109:7,10 Willens 96:22 97:2 William 79:16 Williams 74:4 willing 90:17 wisdom 92:12 wish 122:5.8 **witness** 10:16 witnessed 90:5 115:8 witnessing 115:16 **Wolbrink** 71:6,7,8 wonder 70:9 work 9:4,14 15:6,8,12 16:15 20:15 21:1 26:4 26:21 32:20 33:15 46:7,9 47:18,22 61:6 71:15 73:17 80:19 81:16 84:4,19 87:8 89:16 90:5,22 91:3 92:16,21 95:7 96:10 104:7 111:19 113:20 worked 36:17 37:15 45:19 93:16 98:2

81:12 109:22 110:5

110:19 112:13

unproven 56:16

unknown 15:21 50:5

440.40		50 000 00 0
110:13	0	<b>50,000</b> 29:2
working 11:2 14:21		<b>54</b> 119:14
16:2 21:10 42:3 43:9	1	
44:2 47:16 110:9	<b>1:00</b> 1:12 2:2	6
works 41:21 55:7	<b>10</b> 78:8	<b>6</b> 64:9
workshop 39:14,16	<b>100</b> 22:18 68:7 94:7	<b>60</b> 46:6
world 14:3 16:12 27:6	<b>104</b> 7:8	<b>61</b> 108:6
38:17 39:11 45:20		<b>62</b> 108:5
60:18 61:6 64:2 65:15	<b>1100</b> 23:2	02 100.0
	<b>14</b> 93:17	7
76:19 78:18 79:12	<b>150</b> 54:8	
81:14 89:2,8 91:4	<b>18</b> 1:8 121:8	
93:6 94:2 115:10	<b>1877</b> 38:3	8
world's 91:5 104:11	<b>1973</b> 54:5 93:14	<b>80</b> 45:19
world- 60:22	<b>1990</b> 68:5	<b>800,000</b> 10:6 60:19
world-class 54:13	<b>1998</b> 97:20	
world-renowned 96:7		
worried 19:16	<b>1999</b> 97:21	
worry 3:5 19:20	2	
worthy 92:7	<b>2</b> 54:7	
writing 6:13,19	<b>20</b> 9:1 21:11 33:13 41:7	
written 3:13 4:8 6:13,15	54:5 78:8 97:15	
6:16 7:21 49:7 97:3	<b>20-year</b> 33:9	
wrong 25:6		
wrote 107:1	<b>2010</b> 68:5	
	<b>2013</b> 32:10	
X	<b>2014</b> 28:11	
	<b>2015</b> 38:10	
Υ	<b>2016</b> 94:11 100:22	
	121:10	
<b>Yale</b> 74:5	<b>2017</b> 64:8	
yard 92:5	<b>2018</b> 68:8	
year 10:7 30:14 31:12	<b>2019</b> 1:8 27:9 39:14	
94:6 103:1 120:14	<b>2020</b> 22:5	
year-old 10:18	<b>2030</b> 26:13	
years 9:2 11:14 21:11		
33:13 37:16 38:22	<b>22-year</b> 64:8	
39:17 41:7 54:22	<b>22629</b> 2:5	
	<b>23</b> 97:10	
60:12,17 61:8,21	<b>237</b> 68:4	
71:19 72:15 75:18	<b>24</b> 102:22	
78:9 90:22 93:17	<b>25</b> 97:16 110:16 112:7	
97:10,15,16 99:1	<b>28</b> 3:19	
105:12 110:8,16	<b>2nd</b> 6:21	
111:14 112:8 115:1,9		
115:9 119:17 121:9 <sup>°</sup>	3	
York 37:17		
young 12:18 60:15	<b>3:06</b> 122:12	
88:18	<b>30</b> 52:5 54:22 60:17	
	61:21 75:18 110:8	
youth 75:3,4	115:1	
	<b>35</b> 37:16 39:17	
	<b>365</b> 102:22	
<b>zoo</b> 21:10 37:15 64:1		
75:17 76:14	4	
zoological 64:3 78:7	<b>40</b> 32:10 38:22 71:19	
93:12 101:17 121:1	99:1	
<b>zoos</b> 21:18,22 25:1 33:2	55.1	
37:12 38:5,12 59:12	5	
63.12 16 73.7 75.5		•
63:12,16 73:7 75:5	<b>5</b> 1:5 88:3 108:8	
63:12,16 73:7 75:5 88:17 99:18 102:4	<b>50</b> 88:2 96:6	

## <u>C E R T I F I C A T E</u>

This is to certify that the foregoing transcript

In the matter of: Import of 5 Beluga Whales

Before: US DOC/NOAA

Date: 11-18-19

Place: Silver Spring, MD

was duly recorded and accurately transcribed under my direction; further, that said transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings.

Court Reporter

near Nous &